

STATE INTEGRATION PROGRAMME
“INTEGRATION IN ESTONIAN SOCIETY 2000-2007”
MID-TERM APPRAISAL REPORT



TABLE OF CONTENTS

STATE INTEGRATION PROGRAMME “INTEGRATION IN ESTONIAN SOCIETY 2000-2007” MID-TERM APPRAISAL REPORT	4
1. SHORT SUMMARY OF THE PROJECT	4
2. SHORT SUMMARY OF SERVICES PROVIDED AND ACHIEVEMENTS IN THE COURSE OF THE PROJECT	10
Objective and extent of the work	10
Term of performance of the work	11
Working methods	12
Project team.....	16
Structure of the report and use of annexes	17
Restrictions	18
ABBREVIATIONS AND DEFINITIONS	20
3. SUMMARY BY APPRAISAL QUESTION.....	21
3.1. Has there been success in achieving the general objectives and sub-objectives of the programme in the course of realizing the programme and activity plans, and if so, to what extent?.....	21
Emphasis of primary objectives and output	32
3.2. What has the success and sustainability of the missions provided in the activity plans been like for each activity?.....	43
3.3 What are the advantages and shortcomings of the programme and the composition of the activity plans?.....	91
3.4 Are the objectives of the programme covered with the missions and activities stipulated in activity plans, and if so, to what extent?.....	95
3.5 Are the missions implemented in the framework of activity plans sustainable? If so, then to what extent?.....	98
3.6 Are the target groups covered in the framework of missions and activities of the activity plans? If so, to what extent?	99
3.7 Has the hedging of risks in programmes and activity plans been successful? If so, to what extent?.....	119
3.8 Have management and coordination of the programme and activity plans been successful? If so, to what extent?.....	123

3.9 Have monitoring and reporting on programme implementation been successful? If so, to what extent?.....	127
3.10 What are the strong and weak points of the financing of the programme and activity plans?	129
THE APPRAISAL OF THE PROGRAMME	130
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE STEPS	132
APPENDIX 1. Timetable of focus groups, interviews and surveys	136
APPENDIX 2. Target groups covered	147
APPENDIX 3. Bibliography.....	153
APPENDIX 4. Proposals for the new structure of the programme.....	156
APPENDIX 5. Survey questionnaires	158

STATE INTEGRATION PROGRAMME “INTEGRATION IN ESTONIAN SOCIETY 2000-2007” MID-TERM APPRAISAL REPORT

1. Short summary of the project

The writers of this mid-term report consider it expedient to appraise integration report compliance in the period under observation from two different aspects.

The implementing authorities have complied with the programme pursuant to the set goals, using the available foreign resources. The beneficiaries' assessments of the activities are positive. Therefore we rate compliance with regard to the narrower aspect—implementation of activities—as *satisfactory*.

Yet we must also point out that there has generally been a low amount of success in furthering integration in Estonia.

A condensed evaluation cannot proceed from individual successful activities achieved in the framework of the SIP, but must take into account above all the general situation, which is in terms of sub-objectives freshly covered in the framework of Integration Monitoring 2005.

In summary, the Estonian language proficiency of non-Estonian adults has not improved since 2000: around 40%¹ are able to cope with communicating in Estonian, according to the survey findings of IM2005, as the best available database. Failure to take strategic decisions at the state level and the resulting lack of specific activity plans, and likewise the organizational side of the process have resulted in unsuccessful organization of Estonian language instruction and transition to bilingual instruction and moving to a common information network in Russian-language schools. Although the activities carried out to date have been a great help to specific beneficiaries, such as in familiarization with the Estonian culture and language, there

¹ Precise, "objective" determination of the percentage of those who know a certain language, and of the related dynamics, is rendered more difficult by the fact that people's criteria for assessing their proficiency may change over time.

has not been change in society as a whole, so compliance with the programme cannot be considered successful. This approach is the basis for the criticism presented in the mid-term appraisal report.

With regard to linguistic-communicative integration, the lack of proficiency of non-Estonians in the official language has become the main source of dissatisfaction among Estonians (see chapter 3.1, p. 21).

Problems hindering the development of integration are contained in the educational system. There are not enough teachers who are able to teach in Estonian for work with a multilingual student body. Young people graduating from basic school in the Russian-speaking towns of Ida-Viru County continue to face linguistic barriers in continuing their education and/or competing on the labor market. Non-Estonian youth are poorly prepared for the transition to partial Estonian-language instruction in upper secondary schools. The language immersion programme has been launched with great success, but unfortunately it is not possible to expand it rapidly due to the time it takes to train teachers.

The average *Estonian* language ability of non-Estonians has not improved significantly in the course of the programme. Approximately 60% of adult Estonian Russians have less than average proficiency (they say they use it a little or not at all). In schools, Estonian language instruction has been somewhat motivated by the opportunity to apply for citizenship under simplified procedures. The programme specifies that the Estonian language will become the predominant language for everyday communication in society, but in certain areas this cannot be considered to have been carried out (such as comprehension of information bulletins in Estonian).

It is difficult to assess *changing of attitudes and views*. One positive aspect is the fact that Estonian attitudes toward other ethnicities have become more tolerant lately. At the same time, the picture of trends that emerges from monitoring is contradictory. Often Estonians do not see non-Estonians as possibly furthering the interests of Estonia. The young are distancing themselves from Estonian Russians both on the level of attitudes and actual behavior. Non-Estonians do not perceive clear interest from the state toward their prospects nor do they feel Estonians accept the multiculturalism that has developed in society. The readiness of non-Estonians to participate in community affairs is low.

Legal and political integration improved after Estonia entered the European Union in 2004, in connection with an increase in the number of people with citizenship. Still, the fact that young non-Estonians are gaining citizenship unfortunately does not mean there is a common network or that they are shaping the identity of their country. Citizenship of an EU member state is often a way to continue studies and/or work outside Estonia (see 3.1, p. 21).

Citizenship has brought few non-Estonians into politics. *An increase in the number of non-Estonians participating in political structures would reduce the number of politically unrepresented people.* The ethnic makeup of the public sector is not in proportion to the ethnic makeup of the population.

Loyalty to the Estonian state depends on the position of ethnic groups in society. Both Estonians and Estonian Russians perceive the position of Estonians as being higher. As a result, non-Estonians do not feel that they are full members of society or responsible for what happens to the country.

In order to increase the influence of the *media*, the role of Estonian broadcasting must be changed decisively. A bilingual TV programme would allow to provide important information to non-Estonians, introduce language instruction and culture and alleviate the influence on non-Estonians of hostile propaganda with respect to Estonia from the Russian media that has recently been increasing in frequency.

Socio-economic integration is improving, considering the general rise in the standard of living in society irrespective of ethnicity. Ida-Viru County is characterized by structural unemployment and a greater feeling of exclusion among non-Estonians, which is why this region would require heightened attention from the standpoint of integration. Discontent from the worsening of the situation grows among Estonian Russians along with age. Middle-aged Estonian Russian women are especially visibly discontent. Last year, unemployment was twice as high among young non-Estonians than it was among Estonians, due largely to the complicated situation in Ida-Viru County (see 3.1, p. 21).

The structure of the programme dates from a period 6 years ago and needs to be updated. The structure of the programme is too open to interpretation, and the sub-programmes are not based directly on the general objectives. The sub-programme entitled "Social competence" contains too many activities that are independent of each

other. It is difficult to classify these under sub-programmes, as the existence of more than 170 activities fragments focus and resources. The lack of compatibility of the programme as a whole with its individual parts makes it harder to make sense of the programme, to set specific performance-based objectives and implement (3.3, p. 91) and monitor it in a uniform fashion.

There are no activities specified for carrying out socio-economic integration, even though the structural unemployment and urgent social problems are concentrated above all in Russian-speaking areas.

In some cases there are a large number of individual activities yet the primary instruments have not been put into operation in a systematic manner.

For example, various publications are distributed and project-based Russian language broadcasts are created, but there is no bilingual TV programme with stable financing and the community information that people need does not reach them.

Sustainability is a problem in the fields addressed by numerous programs. True, camps are organized and language courses for adults, publications are issued and many different kinds of events are held, but follow-up activities are often not specified (3.5, p. 98).

There were many *target groups* initially specified for actions, which is why it was difficult to reach them. Much hope is put on assistance from the media, but monitoring shows that most non-Estonians do not follow the Estonian media. In the case of many activities, the target groups have been made concrete in the course of carrying out the programme, with only the communications measures requiring to be specified. An important target group is the local governments, which have been involved in the programme in a deficient manner – there are few integration-related activities in their development programs, for there is a prevalent belief that the topics of integration are the task of the central government. Yet it is precisely the local governments that are closest to daily concerns, can assist in resolving social problems and promoting enterprise and what is most important, administer the municipal schools that see to the teaching of the Estonian language. The involvement of detainees and prisoners as a separate target group in language and civics instruction should also be considered, since aside from other problems, most prisoners do not speak sufficient Estonian to communicate on a professional level (3.6, p. 99).

Risk hedging has been dealt on a good level in coordinating IF projects, on the level of individual projects. At the same time, however, there has not been enough attention devoted at the level of the programme steering committee to, or discussion in society at large about, risks facing the integration process stemming from the exodus of

Estonian Russian intellectuals, the worsening of Estonian-Russian relations and the potential for harmful propaganda falling on receptive ears (3.7, p. 118).

A steering committee meets once a quarter in order to direct the programme. The steering committee should ensure that the programme is carried out on a standard basis by bringing together representatives of government institutions. But in reality the influence of the steering committee is small; functional governance through the ministries is predominant; and the programme, which above all affects four ministries, does not form the whole of the declared priority. Much is expected of the Ministry of Education and Research, but the transition to a bilingual education has still not received political support in the form of attention and funding. The other ministries specified in the programme do not sense their roles and responsibility in the integration process. Every change of government is a threat to the stability of the integration policy at large, since the entire office of the Minister of Population is reassembled each time. The IF, which should be the party carrying out the dictated policy, has been left the obligations of interpreting results, developing new trends and adding government institutions. The foundation has been successful in coordinating support for integration projects and involvement of foreign resources, and there is no basis to require it to assume much broader functions (3.8, p. 118).

Making the programme a reality is, as can be seen from the annual reports, a labor-intensive activity that requires the serious efforts of many people. Individual results are described well and accurately in activity overviews. There has been a shortfall of indicators for the purpose of monitoring actual developments as well as a shortage of comprehensive analysis of monitoring carried out to date. This has prevented adopted decisions from being justified on the basis of studies.

Through the use of state budgetary funds, foreign assistance resources have been skillfully used for many important programs, such as language immersion. However, excessive fragmentation of resources does not allow resources to be pooled for the expedient achievement of the most important objectives.

The integration programme must continue. The government's increased attention is required in immediately renewing definition of the most important objectives -- the transition to bilingual instruction, the formation of a common information network and involving the relevant government institutions. In order to achieve the goals, measurable indicators of results must be planned and the sufficient funding must be

found. There must be an understanding on the definition of a multicultural society *cum* mission. Every activity should contain a plan up to the achievement of the final objective. All this can happen only if the government cabinet seriously devotes itself to resolving the fundamental question of Estonia's future development in a European fashion (recommendations, p 131).

2. Short summary of services provided and achievements in the course of the project

Objective and extent of the work

Pursuant to the tender documents and our contract for services, the direct objective of the project is to contribute to the further timely, conservative and efficacious implementation of the State Integration Programme, Integration in Estonian Society 2000-2007, on the basis of the activity plans for 2004-2007. Also as a result of this project, the activity plans for 2004-2007 should become more comprehensive, and new project ideas to be funded from European Union structural funds should be completed on the basis of identified needs insufficiently covered by the SIP.

The more general goal of the project is to contribute to the successful implementation of the integration process in Estonia.

The mid-term appraisal results expected by the Contracting Authority were:

- Appraisal methods have been developed;
- The mid-term appraisal of the state integration programme is carried out, with highlighting of the primary strengths and weaknesses in the model and content of the activity plans;
- An appraisal report is prepared and published in Estonian, English and Russian;
- The results of mid-term appraisal are introduced to the greater public in the framework of the workshop.

The extent of the work is restricted by the structure of the state integration programme. The state integration programme consists of four sub-programmes:

- Sub-programme I “Education”
- Sub-programme II “Education and culture of ethnic minorities”
- Sub-programme III “Estonian language instruction for adults”
- Sub-programme IV "Social competence”

The provisions of the state integration programme were the basis for each sub-programme's detailed activity plan worked out in 2000 by the institutions responsible for the relevant sub-programmes. The objectives of preparing the activity plans were: to gain an overview of the cooperation between relevant ministries and their partners in the framework of the integration programme, to gain information regarding the use of monetary funds, which will in turn provide information on compliance with and success of the programme; and to gain an overview of the funds, both currently existing as well as needed in the future, serving as the basis for submission of specific funding applications to the state and foreign donors.

Activity plans were developed:

- for 2000-2003;
- for 2004-2007 (including 2004).

The structure of activity plans includes the mission, activity, implementing authority, target group, term when activity will take place, budget, performance criterion, obligations (planned) and achievement (actual).

Term of performance of the work

This mid-term appraisal was carried out from the 18th week of 2005 (project commencement term pursuant to the contract concluded between EYB and the Republic of Estonia) to the 42nd week of 2005, when the concluding workshop will take place pursuant to agreement with the Contracting Authority.

The opening meeting of the mid-term appraisal was held on 20 May 2005. Focus groups, discussions and interviews between programme implementers and target group representatives were carried out from May to September 2005. Questionnaires compiled in the framework of the mid-term appraisal were carried out from July-August 2005. Regular meetings also took place with project managers from both the IF and the office of the Minister for Population Affairs. A project meeting also took place on 1 September 2005 with the participation of representatives from the Ministry of Finance.

The following table provides an overview of the schedule for carrying out the work:

Activities	Term for performance
Project opening meeting	20 May 2005
Focus group and discussions	26 May-8 June 2005
Interviews	20 May-29 July 2005
Ida-Viru County visit	17 June 2005
Project meeting	20 June 2005
Surveys	5 July-29 July 2005
Draft mid-term appraisal report	26 July-15 August 2005
Project meeting	15 August 2005
Additional interviews and interviews	22 August-9 September 2005
Ida-Viru County visit	8 September 2005
Project meeting	14 September 2005
Concluding workshop	27 October 2005

A more detailed overview of focus groups, discussions, interviews and surveys conducted is provided in annexes 1 and 4.

A more detailed overview of coverage of target groups in the mid-term appraisal is provided in annex 2.

Working methods

The primary activities in carrying out the mid-term appraisal were the following:

1. Interviews and discussions and elucidation of source material
2. Opening meeting, introduction of the approach, and discussion.
3. Introduction to materials necessary to implementing the mid-term appraisal and convoking focus groups.
4. Carrying out focus group discussions on relevancy and sustainability (primarily) and SIP effects (to a lesser degree).
5. Gathering source data on the extent (efficacy and influence) and effectiveness of achievement of sub-objectives and analysis of obtained indicators.

6. Preparation of studies on short-term influences and carrying them out (including forming a sampling, preparing questionnaires). Questionnaires were distributed primarily on paper.
7. Activities related to analyzing appraisal questions concerning success of the SIP implementation process (including familiarization with procedural rules, leader groups and other minutes of managing body meetings).
8. Analysis of information gathered and formation of initial conclusions, explaining the need for additional information.
9. Asking for additional information and supplementary analysis.
10. Preparing the draft report and gathering feedback for it.
11. Organizing the concluding workshop (in the form of the report).
12. Preparation and translation of the final report.
13. Presenting results to the greater public.

The following methods were used in performing the work and achieving the objectives:

- a. analysis of documents related to the field (for more detailed information, see annex 3)
- b. Discussions in focus groups (for more detailed information, see annex 1);
- c. Interviews and meetings with representatives and implementers (for more detailed information, see annex 1)
- d. visits to the Ida-Viru region;
- e. Survey (for more detailed information, see annexes 4).

In the course of analysis of documents related to the field, there was familiarization with numerous important integration process related documents, monitoring, development plans and other documents conveyed by the IF and the Minister for Population Affairs. The list of documents related to the field, provided in annex 3, was supplemented on a current basis.

Focus group discussions were used primarily with the objective of talking to experts in the same field, key public figures and target groups and to gather comments on important topics concerning the integration process. Expert recommendations as to

who should take part were considered in selecting focus groups. A written record was kept of all focus group discussions. Specialists from the relevant fields were invited to participate in focus groups. The first focus groups was to consist of people who represented the target groups of the integration programme (non-Estonian youth; adults primarily concerned with language instruction; organized non-Estonian youth representatives). The most important restriction on assembling focus groups was the fact that not all of the people invited were able to attend. They were asked for their opinion either in writing or in interview form.

Interviews were carried out with the aim of talking to target group representatives, programme implementers and other affiliated parties. The primary goal was to elicit opinions regarding the programme and its activities. A written record was kept of all interviews conducted.

The primary objective of on-the-spot visits (Ida-Viru County) was to learn first hand about the situation and problems specific to the region and talk to parties who come face to face every day with the main problems of integration and listen to their opinion of what should be done differently. A written record was kept of all meetings held during the visits.

In addition, meetings were organized with teachers and students at Russian language schools, there were visits to children's language and creativity camps and meetings with children who have undergone family education and their parents, teachers of vocational schools and students who have undergone language instruction and exchange programs.

All of the **surveys** prepared by experts were conducted by Ariko Marketing.

The surveys were aimed at the programme's five largest target groups and were intended to provide additional information and assessments for the remaining mid-term appraisal.

- The general sampling of Russian speaking populace (n=280-300)
- Students at Russian language schools (n=50)
- Teachers at Russian language schools (n=50)
- Ethnic minorities (n=50)

- non-Estonian representatives of NGOs (n=50).

The surveys were aimed at three regions: Tallinn and Harju county, the rest of Estonia (Tartu and Pärnu) and Ida-Viru County as a separate region.

All of the interviews conducted in the course of the study took place using the direct person to person method, where the interviewer poses a question, reads the options and the respondent answers.

The respondents for the various samples were found as follows.

General sampling of the Russian-speaking populace (n=280-300) A conventional nationwide social demographic cross section model was used, containing an average of 280-300 Russian-speaking respondents. On this occasion, only the Russian-speaking community was surveyed using the stratified random sampling method, based on the population density of the Russian-speaking community in sampling points and pursuant to the source address of the sampling point. At the same time, quotas were set for gender and age group (on the county and nationwide level).

Survey of Russian-language students Since the given sample was small, it was distributed between two areas, Tallinn and Ida-Viru County equally and the search took place on the basis of randomness. Sampling/selection could take place at homes and on the street. As a condition, the respondent had to be in the corresponding age group and be studying at an educational institution.

Survey of teachers at Russian language schools. The necessary database was obtained from the Ministry of Education and Research (contact person Maie Soll) and the selection was performed directly at schools (since the teacher survey fell in the second half of August, it was already possible to contact schools).

Survey of ethnic minorities. At first an attempt was made to obtain a database from the Association of Ethnic Minorities, but it was not successful. Thus the selection proceeded in two ways: a) in the framework of the general sampling of the Russian-language populace, if someone from another ethnic minority was living at an address;

b) in an additional search pursuant to information procured by interviewers during the main survey.

Survey of non-Estonian representatives of NGOs. The necessary database was obtained from the following sources: Pille Puss (Union of Estonian Youth Associations); Maia Meos (SIIN youth association); Jaana Laanemann (Narva Youth for Youth). Respondents for the survey were selected at random based on the possibilities of contacting people during the summer months.

The questionnaires for surveys conducted are provided in Annex 4.

Project team

Our team was led by Merike Rabi (until June 2005) and Tarmo Talts (from June 2005).

Other members of the team were

- Hanno Lindpere (Ernst & Young Baltic AS responsible partner);
- Erik Terk (Expert 1);
- Sulev Alajõe (Expert 2);
- Monika Kallas (assistant);
- Siiri-Mall Musten (assistant);
- Jörgen Jaanus (assistant);
- Ariko Marketing (conducted surveys).

The experts who took part in the project carried out additional analysis of the programme and activity plans, conducted interviews with parties related to the programme and activity plans, analyzed reports on the programme and various studies published, carried out focus groups and took part in them, took part in visiting the Ida-Viru region, and compiled surveys and reports.

The project assistants aided the experts in gathering materials related to the project, organizing and documenting various meetings and compiling reports.

Structure of the report and use of annexes

This report is structured based on the sample final report structure provided in the tender documents. The most important conclusions of the appraisers are underlined. An appraisal of content is provided within each assessment question. The source materials provided in annex 3 to the report was used primarily as background material in writing the report. Appraisal questions have been expressed with central importance for the mid-term appraisal.

- Has there been success in achieving the general objectives and sub-objectives of the programme in the course of realizing the programme and activity plans, and if so, to what extent?
- What has the success and sustainability of the missions provided in the activity plans been like for each activity?
- What are the strengths and weaknesses of the structure of the programme and activity plans?
- Are the objectives of the programme covered by the missions and activities provided in the activity plans, and if so, to what extent?
- Are the missions realized in the framework of the activity plans sustainable for each activity, and if so, how sustainable?
- Are the programme target groups covered in the framework of the missions and activities of the activity plans, and if so, to what extent?
- Have programme and activity plan risks been hedged successfully and to what extent?
- Has direction and coordination of programme and activity plans been successful and to what extent?
- Has monitoring of programme performance and reporting been successful and to what extent?
- What are the strengths and weaknesses of programme and activity plan financing?

IN addition, the last chapter lists recommendations and notes for further realization of the programme and activity plans.

The summary also sets out the terms of reference, restrictions, working methods and team composition for our work. In order to better understand the extent of the work described, see also:

- the schedule for focus groups, interviews and surveys listed in annex 1;
- the overview of target group coverage listed in Annex 2;
- the list of written materials used for carrying out the project, listed in Annex 3;
- the questionnaires used in surveys, listed in Annex 4;

Restrictions

1. In conducting surveys, we proceeded from coverage of the major target groups related to the SIP. Ariko Marketing proceeded from the principle of randomness in preparing samples.
2. The primary restrictions of the methods used in carrying out this appraisal are:
 - a. We have drawn on qualitative appraisals since the programme expresses many objectives in a form that is not possible to measure quantitatively.
 - b. In interpreting results of interviews and meetings, one should bear in mind that contact was made with parties that are socially more active than average and thus in general have a better language proficiency and educational level. Thus we cannot extrapolate the generalizations on to all representatives of the target group.
 - c. Since the integration process is long-term and a greater influence should be felt based on the programme structure by 2007, the appraisal of achievement of the programme objectives by each appraisal question is only valid as of the current moment.
 - d. The appraisal of the programme is formed bearing in mind the objectives provided in the programme for 2007 and the dynamics of achievement at the moment that the mid-term appraisal was carried out (the second half of 2005).

- e. Interpretation of the survey results is only a source of additional information and due to the small size of the sampling cannot serve as the basis for sweeping generalizations.
 - f. In this report, we use as a basis data published up to 30 June 2005 and studies carried out in the course of the project.
3. The appraisers have not carried out additional verification and audit procedures with regard to the various written materials submitted by the IF and office of the Minister for Population Affairs and other parties. It was assumed that submitted reports and documents were true and accurate.
4. The results of on-the-spot visits may be somewhat tendentious since it is possible that contacts were made with the more active non-Estonians who may have left an unrealistic impression of the average opinions and attitudes of the target groups.

Abbreviations and definitions

Abbreviation	Notes
ECRI	European Commission against Racism and Intolerance
Estonian Russians	Russians living in Estonia
EU	European Union
ER	Eesti Raadio (Estonian Radio)
ETV	Eesti Televisioon (Estonian Television)
EAIE	Estonian Association of Industry and Employers
LLI	Late language immersion
MER	Ministry of Education and Research
IM2005	Integration monitoring 2005
IF	Integration Foundation
Non-Estonians	All nationalities besides Estonians
MEAC	Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications
IISS	Institute of International and Social Studies
NEQC	National Examination and Qualification Centre
SIP	State Integration Programme
MSA	Ministry of Social Affairs

3. Summary by appraisal question

3.1. Has there been success in achieving the general objectives and sub-objectives of the programme in the course of realizing the programme and activity plans, and if so, to what extent?

More detailed comments on the situation in terms of missions and activities are provided in 3.2-3.4. This section presents only the most general conclusions of appraisers regarding the progress of the integration process, focusing on its success or lack of success, not on the effectiveness of the programme's individual measures. We should stress that the following general conclusions cannot be used to make direct conclusions about the success of the work of the implementers. In addition to the relevancy of the respective measures and the effectiveness of how they are carried out, the progress of integration also depends on many other factors, such as trends outside of Estonia, the amount of financial resources allocated and, among other things, the expediency of the integration strategy being realized and the programme priorities.

The ideological basis of the integration strategy is the recognition of a need for a significantly greater harmonization in the society's public sphere and at the same time the possibility of preserving the ethnic and cultural differences of various nationalities in the private sphere. Unfortunately, one of the indicators of integration problems is continuing opposition on a national footing: approximately half of IM2005 respondents note events involving conflicts, which emerge most frequently in the media or public places. Less frequently, a hostile attitude on the basis of ethnic relations is seen at work or at educational institutions.

- In the course of mid-term appraisal, some of the invitees to focus groups claimed it felt like they were being forced to integrate rather than the voluntary, self-regulating progress² of the process being promoted. While attitudes are positive regarding individual measures of the integration programme, such as language instruction, attitudes are more skeptical regarding the integration programme as such, as "the Estonians' agenda" or

² Focus group 1, (26.05.2005)

“bureaucratic matters.” Without knowing all that much about the actual programme measures and their realization, people tend to adopt an attitude³ that integration is, if not downright harmful and/or an anti-Russian activity, then at least a pointless waste of money. They are likely to add that no doubt it is taking place in the personal financial interests of some interest groups, that priorities have been set wrong, etc. Considering all of the meetings that took place in the course of the mid-term appraisal, the reputation of the programme as a whole is markedly poorer in the eyes of non-Estonians than is the reputation of the concrete activities contained in the programme. Follow-up communication is important (who says what and how, so that the message reaches non-Estonians), in what circumstances should there be more consideration lent to a specific target group and to cultural differences. Instead of the programme as a whole, it is better to treat definite topics that have a more intimate effect on people.

- On the basis of IM2005, young Estonians as a target group have been neglected and their attitude to the ethnic minorities inhabiting Estonia has been shaped in a situation where there is no awareness of, and daily contacts with, Estonian Russians. Thus people tend to think that integration is a process that affects non-Estonians but not them themselves. Although the appraisers feel that non-Estonians do in fact recognize that they should make some contribution to integration, these people are unable to say what the contribution could be.
- The objective of the integration process is to find harmony between nation-state and cultural pluralism. At the same time IM2005 data show that there are strong preconceived notions in Estonian society. Estonia is above all a primary-nation society—that of the Estonians—where Estonian Russians have a markedly lower position⁴. This attitude is in conflict with both the objectives of the stability and socio-economic development of Estonian society and broader global trends that favor multiculturalism.
- The primary objective of integration is to create a sufficiently large common share between the various groups in society. In the course of the mid-term

³ On the basis of the mid-term appraisal's focus groups, meetings and interviews (Focus groups 26.05.2005 and 08.06.2005)

⁴ IM2005, pg 40.

appraisal, we saw that while the SIP implementers expect non-Estonians to be proactive, the non-Estonians see integration as a process where the government should take action and they themselves should remain in a passive role.

The common share that would unite people requires a common information network to a certain extent. The problem here does not lie so much in the fact that the lion's share of the Russian-speaking population gets their information from sources outside Estonia (according to data from "Mina. Maailm. Media," 90% of respondents watch Russia-based TV stations) but in the fact that the influence of both Estonian-language and Russian-language Estonia-based media on Russians living in Estonia is small. A parallel development is the recent phenomenon of Russian media becoming more antagonistic toward Estonia, with misinformation and anti-Estonian propaganda becoming more frequent on Russian TV stations received in Estonia. Events held to mark 9 May and 23 September (the fall of Tallinn to the Soviets) show that this does influence the views of non-Estonians regarding Estonian history. Considering the fact that a large part of Ida-Viru County and some areas of Harju county will still not have a predominantly Estonian language communication environment in the near future, the question of how to strengthen the Estonia-based Russian-language media is especially salient.

Ethnic minorities in Estonia have, where there is imitative and interest, been able to promote instruction in their mother tongue, traditions and their own lifestyle. This depends greatly on how many actual "standard-bearers of culture" there are in the case of a given ethnic group living in Estonia. In the case of the Russians, there is no danger that critical mass would not be attained. It is clear from IM2005 data that two-thirds of non-Estonians feel it is important that they preserve their ethnic identity, and only one in ten supports assimilation. In the case of many other nationalities (ethnic minorities), this is hindered in addition to the small number of people, by the fact that they use Russian to communicate with each other, which has continued since Estonia regained independence.

In the course of integration, non-Estonians' competitive ability, use of learning opportunities and participation in cultural and political life should improve thanks to a

better knowledge of the Estonian language and culture. This process will take time. On the basis of the results of IM2005, the process so far is considered successful by 45% of Estonians and only 31% of non-Estonians.

Lack of citizenship does not only mean an indefinite legal status for people but a vague picture of their role in society. Thus the rate at which the number of the people without nationality is reduced is a very important indicator of integration. In 2004, the number of people who received citizenship through naturalization reached 6,523 (it was under 4,100 per year from 2000-2003). Above all, this can be explained by the influence of EU accession⁵, since meetings with youth representatives show that some youth see real opportunity in a move to Western Europe or elsewhere abroad to study or work. Application for citizenship is made easier for the young by the simplified procedures for getting it at school by passing an examination on the Constitution and Citizenship Act (if a NEQC examiner is summoned and the NEQC examination module is taken) and the state Estonian language examination.

The fears and prejudices stemming from the changes in society have decreased in Estonia, since the speed and radical nature of change is no longer comparable to that of the 1990s and the Estonian population has become accustomed to life in a democracy and market economy. A comparison of data from general monitoring reveals that there is an increased share of Estonian respondents who consider the lifestyle and views of Estonian Russians different from their own and who are bothered by the latter's lack of Estonian proficiency and their different behaviors and lifestyle. At the same time, the fears of Estonians regarding loss of their national identity and cultural sphere have clearly lessened. These ostensibly conflicting trends show that Estonians have started to feel a sense of security, but that their basic views have not changed. We can assume that a clearer awareness of the dynamics of the decrease of Estonia's population and the situation with labor will contribute to a rise in tolerance.

Linguistic-communicative integration expresses a primary objective of the integration process, which is the creation of a common information network and

⁵ Conclusion drawn on the basis of meetings held in the course of the appraisal.

Estonian-language environment, with cultural diversity preserved. According to IM2005 findings, Estonians are not content with the speed at which progress is being made toward that goal – **non-Estonians’ lack of Estonian language proficiency has become the primary source of dissatisfaction:**

- a. The activities carried out in Estonia’s *educational system* have not produced the expected sea change, i.e. a clear rise in Estonian language ability among young people and in their interest in using the language. There are still currently not enough teachers who are able to teach in the Estonian language for working with a multilingual student body, and this is among other findings confirmed by the Council of Europe’s 2003 human rights report on Estonia. Bilingual instruction and language immersion are seen by teachers as requiring the existence of teaching assistants, who would ensure assistance for students who are not able to keep up with the rest of their class. Schools feel that funds for hiring additional assistant teachers are limited. The general monitoring revealed the opinions of non-Estonians aged 15-24 regarding the level at which the Estonian language is taught in schools: about 50% found that they receive good knowledge and communications skills, about 45% felt that they gain knowledge regarding the language but do not learn how to use it for communication, and about 5% felt that yes, there are lessons, but they are not acquiring the language. It bears mentioning in this connection that according to the survey findings only 5% said they were not acquiring the language, even though 50% were not able to communicate in the official language. Among other things, approximately half of the respondents of the students in Ida-Viru County surveyed in a survey conducted in the framework of the mid-term appraisal found the level of Estonian language teachers to be insufficient. According to the findings of this mid-term appraisal, young people graduating from Russian-language basic schools in the towns of Ida-Viru County face continuous language barriers in continuing studies or competing on the job market. IM2005 data show that assessments of the level of teaching of the Estonian language in schools vary greatly according to nationality—individuals who have Estonian citizenship are much more optimistic compared to Russian citizens or stateless persons. While approximately 60% of the first group finds that good knowledge and communications skills are gained at

school, the percentage is under 25 for the latter. This shows how important the existence of motivation is with regard to language instruction.

- b. According to IM2005, the non-Estonian community, including the schools themselves, is unprepared for the transition to partial Estonian language instruction at upper secondary schools. Teachers interviewed believed that their own efforts would be used to prepare for school reform in 2007. One positive change that can be highlighted is that at 32 schools where instruction is in Russian, at least half of the subjects are being taught in Estonian in the 2005-2006 school year. 12 schools (in Jõhvi, Kohtla-Järve, Maardu, Narva, Tallinn, Tartu and Valga) have early language immersion (instruction is predominantly in Estonian in the first grades, while the share of Russian-language instruction increases from grade to grade to about 50%); 20 schools (including in Haapsalu, Kehra, Kohtla-Järve, Narva, Sillamäe, Tallinn, Tapa and Tartu) have late language immersion (from the 6th grade, instruction is partially and in 7th and 8th grade completely and in the 9th grade, 50% in Estonian, except for Russian class). Overall, according to the MER, at least one subject besides Estonian is taught in the Estonian language at 68 of 101 (68%) general educational schools. The activities of the PHARE 2003 project have been aimed specifically at training subject teachers.
- c. The *Estonian proficiency* of non-Estonians as a whole in society has not improved during the last eight years. In sociological studies, an overview of language proficiency is often gained from respondents' own self-evaluations, which may be at variance from actual language proficiency. For this reason, the correlation between proficiency and use of foreign language was also studied in the framework of "Mina. Maailm. Meedia". People in the 30-54 age group have the least experience interacting, while, by their own assessments, their language proficiency is the highest. This is the target group that was required to learn Russian or Estonian but who do not necessarily have an interest in or need to use the language in practice. Estonian is used most actively in practice by people aged 15-19 (93%) and 20-29 (78%), which indicates the positive effect of contact with the educational system and the decrease in this effect in the absence of such a need. **According to IM2005 data, around 60% of adult Estonian Russians have below average**

proficiency in Estonian⁶ (communicates little or not at all). The language proficiency of Russians with Estonian citizenship (young Russians above all) has by their own admission improved, while Russian citizens residing in Estonia (primarily older people) rate their Estonian language proficiency increasingly critically and as being poor. These two parallel trends are keeping the language proficiency of Estonian Russians at the level achieved back in the mid-1990s. The opportunity for simplified application for citizenship has been introduced to better motivate Estonian language learning in schools.

Without underestimating the great importance of language instruction in resolving integration problems, it should nevertheless be considered that Estonia has areas (such as Narva) where language instruction for objective reasons cannot yet serve as the primary mechanism for integration. In such regions, Estonian language proficiency becomes important (if we leave aside dealings with state bodies, which is a need that seldom arises) above all for people who want to work for state structures (such as the police), service sector (tourism chiefly) or vie for higher paid or more prestigious positions, as well for youths who want to continue education at Estonian universities or take up a position in some other part of Estonia. In regions where there are few Estonians, the ordinary people can get by in Russian without major problems in professional and private affairs; this reduces the incentive to learn Estonian. Another minus is the problematic environment, where the necessary practice cannot be applied for acquiring the language. At the same time, from the standpoint of integration, the bulk of the attention should be paid not only to the small elite, which may leave the region anyway, but to the ordinary people. There is a danger that the development of such regions will fall behind the rest of Estonia (as shown by unemployment which in Ida-Viru County persists at a level twice as high as the Estonian average) and become regions of low-paid work where a lower class mentality could start spreading combined with feelings of resentment and exclusion. To keep such a mentality from taking shape, social and economic oriented measures⁷ should be strengthened, since language instruction and civic education—limited to a mere formality—will clearly not be enough.

⁶ Even though people's assessments of their own language ability are subjective and it cannot be ruled out that they become more critical over time, this result cannot be underestimated.

⁷ SDP 2004-2006.

The primary goal of **legal-political integration** should be to increase the number of people with Estonian citizenship. In connection with the accession of Estonia to the EU in 2004, the number has increased. According to IM2005, about 60% of Russian-speaking respondents (69% of the young) equate themselves with Estonian citizens, at the same time that only 45% of respondents, 53% among the young, are in fact Estonian citizens. Citizenship is also strongly linked with territorial-ethnic inclusion: three-fourths of young citizens consider themselves Estonian Russians. The attitude of Russian-speaking youth is supported largely by the fact that 90% of citizens and stateless youth do not identify themselves as Russian Russians—even three-fourths of young Russian citizens do not feel the same way. According to interviews conducted and focus groups, citizenship of an EU member state is often a way to continue studies and/or work outside Estonia.

- a. Obtaining *Estonian citizenship* takes place on the basis of internationally accepted rules. At the same time, according to IM2005, 70% of Estonian Russians consider citizenship policy too strict.
- b. It did not prove possible to find data on the number of non-Estonians *participating in political structures*. The development of normal political pluralism and involvement will be assisted by the tendency, deepening in recent years, of the party membership of non-Estonians to be aligned according to world view and not ethnicity. There are non-Estonians in all three of the largest parties represented in the Riigikogu.
- c. *Loyalty* to the Estonian state depends to a significant degree on the position of the individual in society. Both Estonians and Russians feel that the position of Estonians is higher (IM2005). As a result, non-Estonians do not feel that they are full members of society or responsible for the state of the country, something that was corroborated by the focus groups conducted. The changing of attitudes and views is a long-term process. Even if Estonians see non-Estonians as having potential for Estonia's development, they do not yet see them as furthering Estonian interests. The studies show that young Estonians are distancing themselves from Estonian Russians both on the level of attitudes and actual behavior (IM2005).

Socio-economic integration in Estonian society has improved somewhat, if slowly, in recent years. The rise in the general standard of living has reached non-Estonians as

well—incomes in Estonian and non-Estonian families have started rising according to data from the Statistical Office⁸. The trend of growth in income is confirmed by IM2005 results. Unemployment and social exclusion is a regional problem for Ida-Viru County, but since the populace there is approximately 70% Russian⁹, this requires serious attention from the standpoint of integration as well. Dissatisfaction due to the situation worsening is growing among Russians apace with age, with middle-aged women conspicuously dissatisfied (IM2005). Last year, unemployment was twice as high among young non-Estonians than it was among Estonians, due largely to the complicated situation in Ida-Viru County¹⁰. According to data from the Ida-Viru Employment Office, problems may arise immediately after graduation from vocational or higher school. Of people graduating and suspending studies in 2005, 277 young people had registered themselves as unemployed as of 1 September 2005, of these 33 were from Jõhvi Vocational School, 19 from Kohtla-Järve Vocational School, 121 from Narva Vocational Center and 49 from Sillamäe Vocational School. On the basis of observations of the Employment Office, Estonian Russians file for unemployment significantly faster than Estonian school-leavers who are not able to find work immediately. There is a lack of a systematic, formalized cooperation between vocational schools and employment board and contacts are formed only on the initiative of administrators.

Education is becoming the guarantee of success for Estonian Russians as well, as a result of which competition with young Estonians is becoming keener. At the same time, the labor market is less accessible for non-Estonians than it is for Estonians. The limited opportunities and low level of vocational education is a greater problem among non-Estonians than it is among Estonians. Approximately 2/3 of Estonian Russian youth find that they do not have equal opportunities for finding a job compared to Estonians (IM2005). The state of exclusion of young non-Estonians was emphasized in the socio-economically oriented focus group held in the course of the mid-term appraisal.

The regional isolation of non-Estonians is decreasing among youth: meetings in the course of the mid-term appraisal and many concrete examples showed that Ida-Viru

⁸ While the Statistical Office figures have the average Estonian net income in 2003 as around 33 000 kroons a year (approx. 24,000 in Ida-Viru County), the average was already over 36 000 kroons in 2004 (in Ida-Viru County, over 28 000 kroons).

⁹ Statistical Office data.

¹⁰ Statistical Office data has the average unemployment level in 2004 in Ida-Viru County at 17.9 % (compare Harju 9.6 %, Lääne-Viru county 7.4 % and average for all of Estonia 9.7 %).

County youth are being hired in Tallinn and going to study in Tallinn and Tartu. Still, the Russians who took part in the appraisal lack a clear idea of the necessity of domestic mobility specified in the SIP and how it works. In both the opinion of the youth themselves and employers and county government specialists, the more successful contingent tends to leave Ida-Viru County. During a meeting with the Ida-Viru County government, an example was cited: even the children of the local Estonian-speaking elite study at upper secondary schools outside the county (even if the reason for studying away is in the interests of getting a stronger education, it is a sign of the weakness of state education policy locally and increases the distancing of learners from northeastern Estonia. Estonian Russians who live outside Tallinn and Ida-Viru County position themselves more equally to Estonians (IM2005).

Neither has the hoped-for integration between Estonian and Russian (Estonian Russian) business been seen on the level of private enterprise. A large part of the small and medium companies of Russians reproduces itself using commerce based on ethnic Russian staff (owners, managers and employees) often accompanied by a high proportion¹¹ of Russian clientele (in the case of service and commercial companies), Russian business partners and/or business contacts tied to Russia. The continuation of such a relatively isolated ethnic business model is justified by, besides the specifics (such as a predominantly Russian clientele or business with Russia) the fact that interaction in an ethnically more homogenous organizational culture is easier for Russians) or other so-called Russian-speaking non-Estonians). While acknowledging that selection of personnel and partners must be suitable, we must still point out that such an approach will perpetuate lack of language proficiency and result in the persistence of former and not very progressive business models and decrease the competitiveness of firms owned by Russians.

A counterexample, and a positive one, is the many larger Western-owned companies in Estonia which in addition to Estonians have hired many non-Estonians, including to leadership positions, especially younger candidates. In such a case, the integration of Estonians and non-Estonians take place in the framework of a broader international organization culture.

¹¹ On the basis of the socio-economic focus group.

Additional investigation is required into the issue of to what extent we can see non-Estonians coalescing into relatively low paid and low qualification mass production operations positions. Conflicting examples were provided by focus group discussions. Some corroborated this trend, others did not. There were examples of industrial companies that used non-Estonian regular staff, where the wages of Russian workers, especially skilled laborers, were very high for Estonian conditions, and examples of exporters that employed Russian women where the wage level was conspicuously low—where in other words, the contingent’s low potential mobility was exploited. If the aforementioned trend continues, it may result in social problems of an ethnic stripe, especially if unemployment increases. The need to more precisely analyze and investigate the problems of employment was cited back in 2001 by report II on Estonia of the CE’s European Commission Against Racism and Tolerance.¹² ECRI finds that ethnic minorities’ economic and employment situation should be studied more closely and measures adopted to resolve the problems stemming from their poorer situation.

Even though EAIE has implemented some measures for the better involvement of large Russian companies, the involvement of non-Estonian business leaders in Estonian business organizations, and in particular in management, cannot be considered adequate. There are reasons why this is the case, both for Estonians and Russians. Part of the non-Estonian business elite does not want to draw attention to their activities and results in Estonia in the fear that it would not go over well in the Western-minded and to some extent nationalist-minded climate. According to the employers themselves, the reason is contradictions arising from cultural background and style of communications. The greater involvement of non-Estonians as employers and in business organizations, and their greater visibility in the Estonian economic context, could have a positive effect on integration in some sense, if even as evidence that non-Estonian business people can be successful in Estonia, respected and seen as having a positive image by Estonians. (A good example is the Ukrainian businessman Levada, even though his popularity comes largely from football.)

¹² European Commission Against Racism and Intolerance, report II on Estonia, 22 June 2001, pg 15.

There is not yet enough of an understanding among Estonians that the Russian community with its industrial traditions is a primary resource for the unskilled laborers, skilled workers and industry managers that are extremely important for the Estonian export industry. Currently not enough attention is being paid to utilizing and developing this potential. The consequence is the double unemployment level in Ida-Viru County, with recent graduates of vocational school making up a part of the unemployed. In EAIE's opinion, Estonian agencies and business organizations do not have a precise understanding of the problems here (such as the problems faced by Russians in vocational education) or the policies developed on how to better use this potential. The lack of attention to this matter tends to be justified by the argument that there are no problems of vocational education, unemployment, technical education etc. faced specifically by non-Estonians, but rather only a corresponding list of general problems. But in fact these problems have an ethnic aspect: differences in mentality (hoping for a better job offer, not increasing individual responsibility), lack of regional mobility, hindrances related to language proficiency etc. The survey data from IM2005 indicates that the employment structures are becoming more similar for Estonians and Estonian Russians. Job structure has changed--in 2000, a major share of Estonian Russians (especially the young) had become employed as simple laborers and auxiliary workers and it was due to this that their incomes and satisfaction with work were low. Today, Estonian Russians tend to be skilled workers and depending on how quickly they acquire their higher education, the proportion of specialists has been growing in the job structure for Estonian Russians in the last few years. It follows, therefore, that (higher) education is becoming just as important a factor in employability as it has been for years in the case of Estonians.

Due to the special ethnic makeup of Ida-Viru County, separation, not integration, continues to be seen.

Emphasis of primary objectives and output

In meetings with Ida-Viru County youth and in discussing problems related to Estonian language instruction, the opinion was cited that the government has not done enough to create conditions favorable to integration. However, those representing the older generation of Russians claimed that integration tended to be something forced upon them "from above" rather than the outgrowth of their own free will. | Youth

representatives attribute their low interest to the small size of Estonian society and the language space, while the older people are simply opposed to complying with unpleasant obligations (an analog would be the attitude of Estonians to the compulsory use of Russian).

It was decided to aim the main focus of the SIP at *youth*. In summary, the programme's youth orientation has improved over the years (as the Minister for Population Affairs in office at the time the SIP was created says as well, in the appraisal's summary section), which was made possible thanks to the practical experience in carrying out activities. In addition to the formal educational system, effort has gone into language camps and family exchange programs. Youth associations and Sunday schools for ethnic minorities have received support. Unfortunately, the analysis shows that the objectives of the educational sub-programmes aimed at youth will not be achievable in full by 2007.

We can say that the idea of *integration as a development challenge* and the policy followed on the basis of that notion has been realized only in part. A part of Russian youth have understood that language will be of critical importance to getting by in the future—according to IM2005 data, Estonian Russians' better Estonian language proficiency is reflected in their greater self-confidence. More than half of young Russians (54%) consider their Estonian language proficiency sufficient to live in Estonia, and 45% of them feel that their existing Estonian language proficiency is not enough for living in Estonia.

Yet neither Estonians nor Russians have a clearer picture of the role of non-Estonians in Estonia's future society. Expectations do not coincide to a sufficient extent, either. On the initiative of the state and through the assistance of SIP, the necessary measures have been implemented, but it is hard to assess to what extent it has been a self-regulating and slowly progressing process of adaptation that has taken place (people are forced to learn some things in new circumstances and change their behavior) rather than effective policy.

Both Estonians and non-Estonians have had an improved *sense of security* in recent times. Most Estonians have faith that the Estonian national identity will survive and develop, while non-Estonians perceive more than they did before that they are not

being excluded (on the basis of comparison of the monitoring for 2002 and 2005), even though opinions to the contrary were expressed in the course of this mid-term appraisal. Objective changes (accession to the EU) are largely responsible for the formation of these views—Estonians know that all member state languages have equal status but Russians see it as a better outlet for personal growth.

The SIP sets forth the desire to see the process output a model of a *multicultural society*. Even though with regard to cultural pluralism, opportunities to preserve the special linguistic and cultural character of ethnic minorities have been created, interaction between the minorities takes place chiefly in Russian¹³. A strong common share based on good Estonian language, a common information network, a uniform view of history and general values has not taken shape, as shown by media monitoring, the events related to the commemoration of 9 May or the clash of opinions in the bilingual TV programme “Unetus”. For this reason, it is difficult for many Estonians to understand multiculturalism as an objective. In the opinion of some, this interferes with the sense of security with regard to the survival of their own national culture.

On the basis of the above, we can say that despite many areas where progress has been made, continued efforts and a good resource plan are required to reach the primary goals and outlets of the SIP.

Compliance with sub-objectives (designated A) The sub-objectives up to 2007 established upon approval of the programme are the basis here, and the sub-objectives added under the activity plan for 2004-2007 are not treated (compliance with the latter has just begun). The appraisal provided for each sub-objective features comments providing more detail as well as responses to question 3.2 of this mid-term appraisal by each mission.

A1. Basic school graduates are able to function in society and have mid-level proficiency in Estonian.

¹³ Interviews with ethnic minority representatives.

Since according to NEQC data, the average result on the basic level Estonian test has been 75/100 for basic school-leavers in recent years, yet the SIP sets as its sub-objective language proficiency on the mid-level, we cannot say that all those who have performed their school obligations have Estonian language proficiency and the resulting ability to orient in society. In 2000, the goal was set to reach mid-level Estonian language proficiency, but to this point proficiency is verified a notch lower - - at basic level. It will not be possible to achieve this aim everywhere in Estonia by 2007, since it would require much better Estonian language proficiency among those who graduated 7th grade in 2005 and a sudden intensification of language instruction in the remaining two academic years in basic school classes. In cities of Ida-Viru County without an Estonian-language community, many basic school graduates do not have Estonian language proficiency on a mid-level (according to IM2005 data, 38% of Narva youth under 30 years of age speak no Estonian. These basic school graduates are thus not in a position equal to others their age in continuing their studies or taking up employment, and it is difficult to increase the amount of Estonian language instruction in upper secondary schools starting in 2007. To evaluate the situation with Estonian-language instruction and evaluation of associated needs, the survey firm TNS Emor was commissioned by the MER to conduct a two-part complex study among schools, teachers and students at general educational schools where the language of instruction from November-December 2004.¹⁴ School reform is made more difficult by the fact that a part of Russian-language schools did not teach subjects in the Estonian language lessons—there was only Estonian class (preparations must be made in the 3rd tier of school for transition to Estonian in upper secondary schools). Aside from the positive experience of the language immersion programme and teaching of other subjects in Estonian, the survey conducted in the framework of the appraisal revealed that about two-thirds of students surveyed get a chance to practice Estonian only in Estonian class. There is a lack of an environment that would make it advantageous to use and practice Estonian.

Due to the special situation of Ida-Viru County, Estonian-mindedness should be assessed right next to language proficiency as an indicator of how the person is able to function in society. The ability of basic school graduates to understand what is going on in Estonian society depends on the whole county's socio-economic development

¹⁴ Subject instruction in Estonian at schools with a Russian language of instruction: the current situation and needs.

and opportunities to practice their Estonian language proficiency (media, language camps, staying with families).

A2. Young people with a secondary education have the necessary level of proficiency for everyday and professional interaction and are able to learn in Estonian.

It will not be possible to achieve this sub-objective for everyone by 2007 as the necessary preparations have not been satisfactory so far and the process itself is long-term. A gonzo journalism experiment of the weekly *Eesti Ekspress* in 2004--unannounced visits to various Russian schools--showed that Estonian language instruction is very different from school to school. It can be concluded that local governments, which administer schools, have not affected the process to the necessary degree. Pursuant to the SIP report for 2004, 65% of 2004 graduates of upper secondary schools with Russian as the language of instruction continued studies in higher school, including 49% in state budget slots, while 69% of graduates of schools with Estonian as the language of instruction continued studies at a college or university.

According to IM2005 data, 54% of Tallinn youth (up to 29) see their Estonian language proficiency as sufficient for living in Estonia ;46% as insufficient. Of Narva youth, 48% see their Estonian language proficiency as sufficient for living in Estonia; 50% as insufficient. On the basis of our meetings and interviews we can place these self-evaluations in some doubt: the ability of youth to use Estonian to communicate is poor.

The primary problem with language instruction is sustainability. In meetings with Ida-Viru County government representatives, youth and local residents, the position was expressed that language instruction cannot be sustainable since there is no environment to use the language in practice. Above all, such positions show the continuing lack of desire to acquire Estonian. People lack motivation, their environment is Russian-speaking and lack of proficiency in the official language is not a great hindrance for them in finding work, either. Even a Narva Vocational Educational Centre teacher who was enthusiastic in describing her visit to a language

class admitted that she does not avail herself of the opportunity to follow Estonian-language media.

A meeting with student government leaders in Sillamäe revealed that it has been hard to master Estonian in school in the last 10 years and projects undertaken have mainly been one-off affairs. Many non-Estonians do not consider the amount of resources allocated so far to adult language instruction to be sufficient. In meetings with Russian school teachers, the opinion was expressed that the ones that learn productively are the ones that have an incentive to do so. Schools are located in areas where there is not very much of an Estonian-language environment (something that teachers also admit) so it is harder to create an incentive. Mere language lessons are not enough for acquiring the official language. Schools do what they can to improve language instruction, but significantly larger problems are tied to everyday activities—finding new and additional teachers and purchasing the necessary materials. To some extent, teacher exchange programs are taking place. Schools feel more of a need for student exchange programs where Russian-speaking students, for example, could practice their Estonian and learn in an Estonian language school in an Estonian language environment.

A3. Ethnic minorities have opportunities to get an education in their mother tongue and for preserving their culture.

On the basis of activity reports and interviews, the ethnic minorities that maintain and further their culture have organized and interact with governmental institutions through four umbrella organizations¹⁵. A network of national cultural society-run Sunday schools that receive support in the framework of the programme has been created and there is project-based support for the endeavors of societies and artistic collectives. According to data from surveys conducted in the course of the mid-term appraisal, only 8% of respondents are actively engaged in promoting their national culture, while most deal with it seldom (34%) or only when called on to help or when they are able to help (32%). A relatively large part of the respondents said they are not consciously engaged in this at all. As said before, this statistic reflects only the result of a survey conducted with a small sample.

¹⁵ These would be the Union of National Cultural Societies “Lüüra”, Union of Estonian Nations, Ida-Viru County Ethnic Minorities Roundtable and the Slavic Society.

The wording of the sub-objective definitely requires clarification, as it currently leaves open the possibility to presuppose that all ethnic minorities ought to get their compulsory education in their mother tongue. Such an interpretation is unrealistic for most small minorities, as Sunday school would be the most suitable way for them to learn their language and culture.

A4. Opportunities have been created for adult non-Estonians to improve their Estonian language proficiency and raise their socio-cultural competence.

In principle, there do exist opportunities for raising Estonian language proficiency and the aforementioned competence.

The “Interest” language instruction repayment system has been implemented successfully. The programme reimburses successful Estonian language examinees 50% of their language instruction costs. An increase of the reimbursed share merits consideration, in the interests of stimulating language instruction to an even greater extent and to remove poverty-related hindrances to language learning.

The content of the sub-objective—raising social and cultural competence—and its connection with the programme is open to interpretation. On the basis of meetings in the course of the mid-term appraisal, we can say that people do not understand this desire. Opinions were expressed that a high level of language proficiency will automatically result in a greater consumption of culture and social level of activity and since the programme should be aimed at youth above all, it would not be necessary to put separate efforts into informal educational programmes for adults.

A5. Estonian residents take part actively in developing a civic society independent of their ethnicity and mother tongue.

As of this writing, we cannot say that non-Estonians are sufficiently active participants in the development of a civic society, and if current developments continue, we cannot forecast that this sub-objective will be met.

This sub-objective covers employment and non-Estonians' level of involvement in society.

In covering the problem of **total employment**, the press has stressed the importance of all working hands to Estonia, but this is not a case of an activity that is funded or

planned in the framework of the programme. The employment-related involvement of non-Estonians is not conceivable on the basis of the ethnicity criterion: educational factors and professional skills count most of all. It was stressed in the focus group that according to the Ministry of Social Affairs, labor market measures are not based on ethnic origin. At the same time, though, considering the specific character of the unemployed, structural unemployment in one region of Estonia requires different measures than, say, unemployment in southeastern Estonia (due to the difference in the past working environment).

Political involvement was measured in the framework of IM2005 according to experience in political participation and political interest. In effect, three-fourths of Estonian residents use diverse kinds of political information. About 12% are interested in everything happening at home and abroad and 64% are at least selectively interested in major political events. The youth of both ethnic groups are interested in political events on the same level. 53% of Estonians and 44% of Russians are interested in Estonian politics, while only 14% of Estonians and 42% of Russians are interested in Russian political events. In summary, it can be said that the difference in the interests of Estonians and Russians causes problems, but clearly shows the need to create a political dialogue between the communities with Estonian and Russian backgrounds.

Experience in participating in politics. It is popular in Estonian society to be interested in politics (over half of Estonians and Russians discuss political events in their inner social circles.) To analyze political activeness, a consolidated index was formed in the integration monitoring, using which three different types were identified:

- type 1. not involved in politics, has not voted in elections for three years, or taken part in political meetings, signature campaigns, demonstrations or strikes (38% Estonians and 59% of Russians by ethnic/linguistic distribution were in this group)
- type 2. minimally involved, has taken part in only one of the above activities (46% of Estonians and 32% of Russians)
- type 3. politically active, active in 2-5 of the above political activities (15% of Estonians and 10% of Russians).

Involvement in society – Estonian Russians are on the basis of IM2005 summaries integrated relatively little and are in a somewhat isolated situation in Estonian society. Many strong preconceptions can be perceived, such as the one that Estonia is above all a society of Estonians and that Estonian Russians are in a lower position. Estonian Russians have a weaker starting position (already due to their ethnicity), due to which their competitiveness and ability to succeed in Estonian society is hindered. The conclusions are reflected in the IM2005 report as well.

A6. The views of Estonians and non-Estonians favor achievement of the primary objectives of the state programme.

Society lacks a clear understanding of the concept of a multicultural society, which is why it is difficult to implement it. Support for the project has contributed to familiarizing the public with the cultures of ethnic minorities. Estonian residents with a mother tongue other than Estonian are relatively passive in furthering a civic society. Non-Estonians primarily belong to NGOs founded to promote culture in their own language and protect their own interests. Compared to non-Estonians, Estonians take part in the activity of more cultural societies and associations, with 15% of Estonians and 4% of non-Estonian members and active participants of in the activity of various associations, according to the data from the study “Mina. Maailm. Meedia”. Irrespective of ethnicity, the populace is best organized on the basis of common interests in sporting clubs and housing associations.

Considering the desire to achieve sub-objectives by 2007, we can be skeptical in this case. The monitoring often cited in this report show persistent rifts in attitudes and there is no basis to suppose on the developments of the past five years that any major rapprochement can be achieved in two years in the views of Estonians and non-Estonians.

A7. The sphere of influence of the Estonian media has increased among non-Estonians.

Media monitoring conducted in the framework of RIP show that Russian media dominated in the media preferences of Estonian Russians, and the sphere of influence of the Estonian media is low among non-Estonians and has not increased. Newspaper

readership is traditionally lower than that of Estonians and the main media channel is Russian television. Due to the availability of cable TV, Western channels are second to Russian ones. Reading and listening to local channels (radio and newspapers) is connected with getting information for everyday use and entertainment rather than being a significant sphere of influence of the Estonian media. Fulfillment of the sub-objective by 2007 is unrealistic, since a dynamic comparison of media monitoring shows the very slow change in media preferences.

A8. More active participation by the Estonian media in achieving the objectives of the state programme and strengthening of mutual cooperation in this area.

Despite the media (educational) programs, the active participation on the part of the Estonian media in achieving programme objectives is not seen, nor in strengthening cooperation. The main method at the disposal of the state, national broadcasting, has been too underfunded to play a part in covering and furthering integration, and a clear strategy is lacking as well. On the basis of meetings that took place with broadcasting representatives¹⁶, it appears that bilingual TV programming is an underused opportunity. Estonia's Russian-language media is weakly involved in the programme. Contrary to the prevalent opinion that a bilingual ETV programme would not be able to make Russian channel viewing audiences defect, almost half of the non-Estonians surveyed in the course of the survey felt that such a channel would certainly gain viewers.

The appraisers hold the position that the sub-objective is not achievable as far as its content is concerned and requires reformulation.

A9. A rise in Estonian society's level of informedness regarding the state programme goals and integration process developments.

People take an interest in specific matters that affect them, not so much in state programme objectives and general developments in the integration process. For example, students teachers and parents are interested in the transition to partial Estonian language instruction in upper secondary schools without this being linked to

¹⁶ Focus group, 06.06.2005

the SIP. Thus it is difficult to evaluate how informed people are of the programme goals. Many non-Estonians do not consider it necessary to talk of the programme but only developments that are important to them. It emerged in discussions with target groups that the SIP has acquired a negative image.

For the sub-objective to be fulfilled by 2007, all activities planned for the creation of a common information network must be utilized decisively, actively and intelligently.

A10. Improvement of the situation of population groups with serious special social needs.

The disabled are always counted among population with special social needs, but the disabled practically lack a connection with the programme. This primarily depends on the concrete aid seeker and the geographic area.

The unemployment level in Ida-Viru County in 2004 was 17.4% while the average for all of Estonia was 9.7%¹⁷ The twofold difference has persisted through all recent years. Here language instruction would not be enough to improve the situation of non-Estonians, rather it has been necessary to implement labor market measures that take into account the region's specific character and the background of the unemployed. The activity of the MEAC and the MSA has not been able to change the situation. According to Statistical Office data, the unemployment level among all non-Estonians has dropped from 18% in 2000 to 15.6% in 2004.

As shown by sociological studies¹⁸, many socio-psychological (status of Soviet-era immigrants), socio-economic (high unemployment in northeastern Estonia) and linguistic-cultural (lack of proficiency in the official language) have caused integration difficulties for a noteworthy share of the population with a language other than Estonian, as manifested by the disproportionate share of prisoners, drug addicts, HIV positive people and people living with AIDS, and the unemployed (findings of the "Mina. Maailm. Meedia" 2004 study).

The specific character of the unemployed of Ida-Viru County lies in their industrial background and their resulting limited professional skills (for which an alternative use is often lacking), combined with lack of proficiency in the official language. On the

¹⁷ According to Statistical Office 2004 data.

¹⁸ The CE's 2003 human rights report on Estonia.

basis of the experience of the Ida-Viru County employment office, there is intentional registration of entire families as unemployed in order so as to have the local government cover all costs of living for them. In connection with the rising price differential, speculation on goods from Russia is becoming more active. According to the opinion of the Employment office, approximately one-fifth of the unemployed are in a situation where it would not be possible to bring them back to the labor market. For this reason, northeastern Estonia's labor measures require additional support to support on a permanent basis the creation of new jobs, longer adaptation courses, payment of teacher fees for practical training, and Estonian language courses. At the present time, considering the specific character of the county, 6 projects are being additionally coordinated by the employment office (including one that is directly aimed at youth). This increases work stress for already overworked and underpaid officials.

If the current attitudes continue in how the social situation of Ida-Viru County is seen vis-à-vis the SIP, there is no reason to hope for success in this field by 2007.

3.2. What has the success and sustainability of the missions provided in the activity plans been like for each activity?

The appraisers find that the corrections of activity plans for 2004-2007 is justified, which points to the drawing of conclusions from the experiences of 2000-2003. Thus we have abandoned the practice of providing commentary on suitability after each activity—the activities are considered necessary in the framework of the given mission. A separate assessment is provided in cases where it has become significant.

At the end of each mission, an evaluation is given to the success of the mission and the average ratio of each mission, on the basis of actual budgets for 2000-2003, to the budget of the sub-programme and the entire programme.

Sub-programmes are denoted with Roman numerals, while missions and submissions are denoted pursuant to the conventions specified in the activity plans.

Sub-programme I “Education”

I.1. To shape a system of teaching Estonian as a second language, one where diverse and contemporary study material is applied and language study models that consider the interaction of languages, so that non-Estonian-speaking children and youth would acquire Estonian, in a motivated and efficacious manner.

Last year, important achievements were realized in carrying out this mission in the teaching of Estonian as a second language in kindergartens. A survey carried out in the course of the appraisal showed that 100% of Tallinn and Harju county students surveyed in the course of the mid-term appraisal considered the decision a correct one. A shortage of teachers¹⁸ hinders rapid involvement of all Russian kindergartens.

On the basis of IM2005 data, the most major problem can be seen as the fact that the non-Estonian youth themselves are fairly skeptical regarding acquiring Estonian in school. With increasing age, the number of those is growing who find that they are acquiring Estonian almost not at all in Russian schools. As a whole, about half of respondents are dissatisfied with the level at which Estonian is being taught, and the dissatisfaction is significantly greater among youth without Estonian citizenship.

At the same time, both teachers and students find that those who are interested in learning the language will acquire it in ordinary classes as well. The largest obstacle to learning the language is lack of interest, though the lack of an environment supporting practicing of the language is cited.

The given mission consists of three submissions, which are:

I.1.a. Developing language didactics, language instruction methodology and study materials, teacher training

Developing a language didactics programme for pre-school children's institutions -- a language immersion programme has been prepared (and successfully implemented). Around 5.2 million kroons has been invested to support the given activity in the period 2000-2004.

¹⁸ The CE's 2003 human rights report on Estonia.

Resources promoting the formation of a language instruction environment and new study materials costing around 10.5 million kroons were purchased in the period—including the interior furnishing of 2 new multimedia language study offices and supplying of Russian schools with additional supplementary materials.

Study materials for Estonian as a second language were also diversified for a significant sum—a CD-ROM was produced for grades 7-9. An interactive language study environment has been created for Russian-language grades 7-12 taking the beginner's and intermediate level state examination.

As regards language didactics, the activity plan specified that language didactical studies existing in 2003 would be mapped and annotations compiled. In this framework, it would have been possible to find weaknesses and deficiencies and to announce the corresponding competitions for research.

Language didactics were developed in the framework of PHARE 2 (language teachers' methodology notebooks, development of new study materials).

As regards shaping the key points for language didactics, the position was reached in cooperation with the IF and MER that three centers for Estonian as a second language would be used for methodological and didactic consulting. The centers would have the materials and a person in the network (association of teachers of Estonian as a second language) who would be able to perform consulting. The activity of the centers is supported from state budgetary funds.

Language didactics centers as research centers were omitted in the activity plan for 2004-2007, because establishing such centers separately would be questionable from the standpoint of sustainability, limited human resources and independent maintenance. Today, corresponding research is primarily performed at and via the chairs of Estonian as a second language at the University of Tartu and Tallinn University.

Development, consultation and training for pre-school children's institutions as regional children's centers for language learning along with precise planning of activity concerning basic education took place in 2001-2002, when procurement tenders were announced for obtaining materials, teacher's training modules and pilot courses, and devising the language training center model and subsequent activities of the people working there. The failure of the first public procurement was due to a delay of half a year.

A study had been carried out beforehand and served as the basis for planning activities and the sequence of activities. Language study centers were and are in last place in that sequence (consultant training comes right before). Activities are planned and development activity is taking place.

The sub-mission activities have helped to reach fulfillment of the sub-objective with sufficient coverage.

I.1.b. Development and implementation of the language immersion programme

The most successful activity in the framework of the first mission is the expansion of the language immersion programme, which has met with a positive response from both the implementers and the primary target groups. The project entitled "Estonian language immersion in kindergartens" was launched in 2002 in cooperation with IF, the Language Immersion Center, the Finnish School Board and University of Vaasa. In 2003, language immersion expanded to kindergartens, and in the academic year 2003/2004, the programme was implemented in nine pilot kindergartens. In the course of interviews with the kindergarten community, the continually growing popularity of language immersion groups among parents was cited—many parents are looking for ways of placing their children in language immersion groups. On the basis of interviews with kindergarten directors, early language immersion in kindergartens is deemed effective and sustainable. The efficacy of the language immersion programme has been confirmed by the standard determining tests and surveys conducted. It is clear that on the basis of the content of the language immersion programme, we cannot put our hopes in it as a programme that will quickly spread to all Russian schools, as it will take time to train teachers. On the basis of comments that have been received from the language immersion center, it is not reasonable to set a goal for all schools with a Russian language of instruction to make the transition to language immersion at some point. The language immersion center considers voluntary choice a very important principle: parents may decide in favor of some other method that is sufficiently efficacious for their children. Such methods may include additional study in language schools, partial Estonian study without the typical immersion characteristics, and others.

However, since the language immersion center sees immersion methods as a methodology that unites many good pedagogical conventions and techniques, the center considers it important for such solutions to be fairly well represented in every region.

Currently 32 schools and 17 kindergartens¹⁹ have joined the programme, which was made possible with foreign assistance. Language immersion is successful in the opinion of the participants themselves. A problem for language immersion schools as well as kindergartens is creating study materials, since the level of students is different by both institution and home preparation. In a situation where language should support the subject, the subject supports the language. Subject teachers must also cope with teaching a language. Although worksheets developed in the framework of the programme have been invaluable, the decision of what textbooks to use is still up to each school to make. Thus worksheets do not necessarily coincide with textbooks. And teachers also pointed out that natural science, required for the 6th grade, is an information-intensive and difficult subject to master for Estonian-speaking children as well: non-Estonian children have to learn it in a foreign language, to boot. The children themselves considered the 6th grade difficult. Many saw their grades go down and this resulted in additional stress for both children and parents. According to teachers, in spite of the work undertaken to keep parents informed, parents are not sufficiently informed of the needs of children attending language immersion class and do not offer enough support at home, which can be attributed to the greater demands this class places on homes (compared to conventional classes).

In the period 2000-2003, initially the principles for compiling study programmes for grades 1-3 were developed. Two-part textbooks and workbooks for all grades in the first stage of study—1st, 2nd and 3rd grade—have been published. Language immersion class teachers in schools and kindergartens have been trained. Teachers consider the level of training good. They see as the primary advantage the opportunity to share experiences with their colleagues. Despite the training, the greatest problem is the existence of an appropriate professional staff. Schools have difficulties getting young teachers involved. In addition to good Estonian language ability, teachers

¹⁹ As of August 2005.

should also have a sufficient understanding of what language immersion is, and then they must be provided the necessary training.

At the same time, teachers feel the greatest need for textbooks and worksheets supporting late language immersion. Study in late language immersion classes is more complicated for children as subjects require more, and explanations have to be exacting. Children have to acquire vocabulary as well as the study programme at hand (knowledge in the framework of the study programme). At the time the SIP was put together, expansion of language immersion into a late language immersion option was not planned, because no one could foresee the efficacy and popularity of early language immersion. When implementation of LLI started to be prepared in consideration of the expectations of parents, it was clear that it would require significant additional resources, which is why a EU PHARE project application was prepared in cooperation with the MER and IF. Development of late language immersion is included in the activity plans for 2004-2007 as a separate activity. Thus it can be assumed that progress and results in this field can be evaluated only after 2007.

In the period 2000-2003, around 173,100 Estonian kroons was invested²⁰ into activity in the framework of which resources promoting language instruction should have been purchased for language immersion schools. To this amount was added 1,071,792 kroons worth of books, equipment and other resources procured in 2004 for schools that had joined the late language immersion programme. According to teachers, the greatest shortage is of supplementary contemporary language instruction resources, such as various audiovisual resources that assist interactive language learning.

In addition, summer language camps were organized for language immersion classes, scientific studies on language immersion were compiled. Each year, all language immersion class students were tested and parents surveyed.

²⁰ According to the language immersion centre's comments, the resources directed at language immersion centres cannot be measured by state resources alone. Tallinn, Valga, Kohtla-Järve, Narva and Jõhvi have supported their regional schools financially in purchasing equipment. This is an agreement between the school proprietors and the language immersion center, which is responsible above all for the methodological side of the programme.

The general evaluation of language immersion-related activities is positive and language study based on language immersion is sustainable. The activities carried out in the framework of the submission have contributed to achievement of the set objective. Significant support has come from continued political support on both the national and local level. The ideal is for language immersion to be implemented starting from kindergarten until the end of basic school²¹. Instruction started in kindergarten should continue in the beginning grades.

A positive assessment of the activities tied to the given sub-mission was also given by the report, compiled by IISS in March 2005, “Appraisal of the activities of the foreign aid project ‘Multicultural Estonia’”²². Various previous studies have cited assessments made by teachers, methodologists and parents that indicate that language immersion is a very effective way of learning language, since the result is that children learn a second language very quickly, piquing their interest and desire to use Estonian not just in kindergarten but elsewhere. A good internal climate in language immersion groups promotes every facet of child development and raises children's interest in learning, instilling self-confidence, courage and the skill to communicate in a second language²³. A similar attitude was reflected by the interviews and meetings with target group representatives conducted in the course of this mid-term appraisal.

I.1.c. Extracurricular language models

Along with practical use of language, language camps and family study have achieved success in introducing Estonia, even though for many participants, the effect is somewhat short-lived due to the lack of an Estonian-language environment (Ida-Viru County). It is notable that over three-fourths of the respondents interviewed in the course of the mid-term appraisal outside Ida-Viru County and Harju county considered opportunities for language camps and family study insufficient. In a meeting at a children’s language camp, the camp director cited the problem that in fact there are sometimes difficulties in finding children to attend camp. The director said that the given issue could be resolved successfully through jointly coordinated

²¹ According to teachers and kindergarten teachers.

²² Vöörmann, R., Helemäe, J., Nimmerfeldt, G. Appraisal of the foreign aid project “Multicultural Estonia” activities, 2005, pg 6.

²³ Ibid, pg 7.

information days or youth and social workers of local governments, who have the best information on youth and children who could be offered camp study opportunities.

Both children and parents consider summer language camps as a good way to find children an additional way to use their time, make friends and develop their Estonian skills. The IF is primarily seen as an a clearinghouse for information and creator of additional opportunities—the foundation could more actively ensure that employees of schools, kindergartens, and local governments' youth and education departments are kept abreast of additional language learning opportunities and offer support in creating new language and family study projects as well as additional support for the activities of existing organizers. It is most important to involve local governments in such a manner that the primary initiative (in procuring information) would come from their side. In subsequent periods, attention could be paid to extracurricular forms of language instruction related to individual child development.

Both the meetings with family study representatives and those with children and parents who have taken part in family study confirmed that family study helps people learn about Estonians and Estonian culture in addition to language. According to the family study representative, approximately 10% of the children who undergo family study go on to Estonian-language schools.

In the period 2000-2004, approximately 25.3 million kroons was invested in order to implement the activity. An estimated 16,752 children and youth attended various camps and forms of family study in the period under observation. The assessment of children, parents, camp organizers and family study representatives has been positive with regard to the activity, and it has been found to be effective and sustainable enough to ensure sufficient language training and availability of practical training for motivated children. According to one family study representative, the requirement of partial self-financing may be a problem for less well-off families. The representative added, though, that generally families with motivation find opportunities in any case. The families that took part in the meeting found that this kind of language instruction could be advertised more (for example, one family had heard of the opportunity on Raadio 4), but it should not take place at additional costs, but rather be included in the announcements in public broadcasting's daily tasks. Children themselves incite interest among their peers.

The joint language instruction projects with Estonian schools are not separately listed under the given mission in reports for the period 2000-2004 and are reported in the

section on mission 1.4 (To develop linguistic and cultural cooperation between Estonian- and Russian-language schools, so that students' language proficiency would improve and tolerance of other cultures develop). It emerged in the course of interviews with teachers that language-study-based exchange programs with Estonian schools are missed the most. Children should have the opportunity to practice and learn the language in an Estonian environment. This would increase their confidence in interaction and provide an introduction to Estonian culture at the same time. Schoolteachers say they have considered initiating such exchange programs, but it has generally been left undone due to a lack of time (teachers do not have enough free time to write grant proposals) and funds (schools do not have supplementary funds to initiate programs or employ full-time grant writers).

The activities conducted in the framework of the given sub-mission are effective and sustainable, receiving positive feedback from both target group representatives and camp and family study representatives and organizers. The entire mission accounted for 58% of the sub-programme expenditures and 28% of total expenditures, thus the mission that required the most resources. The IISS report for 2005²⁴ also provides a positive assessment of implementation of extracurricular language models.

I.2. To make more expedient, and to expand, basic training and in-service training for teachers of Estonian as a second language, so that schools with a language of instruction other than Estonian would staff teachers meeting the qualification requirements.

The given mission consists of three sub-missions, which are:

I.2.a. The regional in-service training network for teachers of Estonian as a second language

The activities carried out in the framework of the mission has resulted in the creation of regional in-service training network centers. The Association of Teachers of Estonian as a Second Language was registered as an NGO. Over 900,000 kroons was

²⁴ Ibid, pg 13.

invested in the period under observation (2000-2004) to support the activities of the Association and the activities of the teachers in the network. Various training sessions and seminars for the teachers of the network have been supported. In 2004, winter and summer school was held for teachers of Estonian as a second language. The launch of the website www.eestikeelteisekeelena.ee was supported. The website was updated in autumn 2005.

The work of Estonian language teachers was also supported (primarily in the first two years of programme implementation).

Investment into in-service training for Estonian as a second language for teachers of other subjects has been more modest compared to other activities (only around 628,000 kroons in the period 2000-2003). According to the activity reports for 2004, in-service training on priority topics was organized in the amount of around 800,000 kroons. Fifty teachers in two teaching areas—history-civic education, and natural science-geography—took part. At the same time, the teachers themselves find that the language proficiency of teachers of other subjects is often not sufficient to convey the subjects in Estonian, or to language immersion classes. Language proficiency of teachers of other subjects is one of the major hindrances to school reform in 2007.

According to the surveys carried out, the majority of student respondents in Ida-Viru County agreed completely or in part that the preparation of teachers for teaching Estonian as a second language in school is deficient.

From the standpoint of developing the network, the activities in the framework of the submission were sufficient to create the conditions for organizing in-service training closer to teachers. Form was not sufficiently invested with content—in other words, training was not substantial and consistent.

In the future, it would be expedient to link this sub-mission with the activities of the first mission's sub-mission, as the topics are close and, in some aspects, coincident (the association of teachers of Estonian as a second language is involved in consultation).

I.2.b. In-service training in Estonian language instruction for teachers of other subjects and other training

In-service training in the teaching of Estonian as a second language has been significantly supported for teachers at preschool children's institutions. Training was

held for Russian-speaking school directors in 2000. At the same time, it has emerged in the course of this mid-term appraisal that the leadership of Russian-language schools are not very well informed regarding the various opportunities and one way to reach them would undoubtedly be for the IF and MER to convey information to them better.

Investments were made in the period under observation into development of training programs and models of in-service training (approximately 3.3 million kroons).

A project for teachers at vocational educational institutions was launched. It emerged from an interview with two teachers that took part in the project (one in projects in Kuressaare and Võru, the other one only in Võru), in a visit to the Narva Vocational School held in the course of the mid-term appraisal, that the Estonian-language environment did not inculcate a permanent habit to obtain Estonian information in their professional area, that they lack contacts with assistant teachers and the influence of the project was fleeting. Positive aspects cited included the opportunity to get outside the everyday environment, to become familiar with different methods of teaching one's subject and to practice Estonian. However, the most important problem is the fact that neither of the interviewees was able to say "what next": whether they definitely wished to start teaching their subject in Estonian and when they would be ready to so do. The school director mentioned that people in Võru tend to acquiesce easily to Narva residents by switching over to interaction in Russian.

Even though the University of Tartu and Tallinn University are both taking part in developing new training models in programs for basic school teachers for formal education acquired in the adult education system and continuing education, the latter university—the primary institution for teacher training—considers its level of involvement in resolving the problem of the lack of qualified Estonian-speaking teachers weak—according to both the rector and Estonian language scholars. In-service training has expanded to all schools and teachers, in the framework of which a multilingual support center has been established at the University of Tartu's Narva College.

The activities of this sub-mission support achievement of the objective.

I.2.c. Re-training of teachers, in-service training for working teachers

In-service training has been organized for music teachers in the framework of this sub-mission in the period under observation. There has also been activity related to developing principles of training for specialty teachers and study programmes as well as actual training of specialty teachers. There were significant investments into the transformation of Narva College to an academic center in 2000 (1.5 million kroons). UT's Narva College trains Estonian-language teachers to teach history and civics, and natural science and geography in Russian-language schools.

In late 2004, TNS EMOR conducted a survey²⁵. The shortage of teachers with the required qualification and language proficiency emerged as the main obstacle to implementing Estonian-language teaching of subjects. EMOR survey results revealed that 72% of surveyed schools planned to increase the amount of Estonian-language instruction in the coming academic year. Only 31% of teachers who taught their subject only in Russian were in principle ready to start teaching it in Estonian. If the remaining teachers do not want to lose their job due to teachers coming from Estonian-language schools, that number must at least double. Many problems and barriers to transition to teaching of subjects in Estonian are seen by teachers, not by students, and this was also shown by meetings that took place in the course of the mid-term appraisal. Their attitudes (primarily those of teachers) are projected on to other target groups involved in the process (parents, Russian-language media and officials). A clear will, plan and resources have so far been lacking to carry out the pragmatic recommendations provided at the end of the EMOR survey. A positive development is that the plan for transition to the Estonian language by subject was completed at the same time that this mid-term appraisal was completed.

Since only one-third of non-Estonians consider the school reform good with respect to a significant change for the state, the partial transition to bilingual instruction from 2007, and believe that the coping ability of non-Estonians youth will improve as a result (Tallinn's non-Estonians are the most critical, with over two-thirds against school reform), the preparedness, including mental preparedness, of teachers is a critical factor in the implementation of the change. Even though the topics of Russian-language schools are dealt with in the Russian-language local governments and the county governments of Ida-Viru and Harju, the MER has a key role in the framework of the integration programme, and the existence of only one MER official dealing

²⁵ Cf pg 21.

with Russian-language schools cannot be deemed sufficient.²⁶ The survey conducted in the course of the evaluation showed that approximately half of Ida-Viru County students consider schools ill-prepared for the transition to Estonian language teaching. A large part of the teachers currently employed are not able to make the transition to Estonian-language teaching of subjects due to lack of language proficiency. Inevitably a part of them will have to cede their job to teachers who have proficiency. At the same time, there is no analysis of how and with what motivational measures teachers made redundant at Estonian language schools due to dropping numbers of children can be offered work at Russian-language schools.

In May 2005, the SIP steering committee expressed their readiness to support the proposition of the Minister of Education to increase budgetary funds for training and recruiting teachers, awaiting a plan outlined in more detail. The steering committee also stressed the need to provide better information to students, teachers and parents and to involve them in the preparation process. This means the MER had not been able to work out a clear programme on how many teachers in which subjects are required and when they must be prepared (the MER reported in the course of compiling the CE's 2003 human rights report that the programme completion was imminent). On the basis of this report, the resources to this point are deemed insufficient to fulfill the task. The deficiency of the measures is stressed in the opinion of the CE committee on minorities as well.²⁷

To sum up: the activities have not been sufficient to achieve the objective. The mission forms 20% of the expenses of the sub-programme and 10% of total expenses, which considering the great importance of the mission to the expected reform shows the underfunding of the preparations.

I.3. To create at schools conditions that would ensure the Estonian-language work of study groups, and the proficiency in Estonian as a second language for school-leavers, in everyday and professional interaction on the level necessary for learners to integrate in Estonian society.

²⁶ The 2002 report "Minority Protection in Estonia – an Assessment of the Programme "Integration in Estonian Society 2000-2007" also provides the position that there are not enough people (officials) to ensure the carrying out of complex projects in the framework of the entire programme.

²⁷ ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON THE FRAMEWORK CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF NATIONAL MINORITIES Second Opinion on Estonia adopted on 24 February 2005.

The given mission consists of four sub-missions, which are:

I.3.a. Planning of measures in schools' development plans, syllabuses, training

The first activity under this sub-mission is the planning of the transition to an Estonian language of instruction in the development plans of upper secondary schools, vocational education institutions and institutions of higher education with a language of instruction other than Estonian. Training programs were developed, a competition was prepared, and seminars were held in the period 2000-2004. Stipends totaling around 500,000 kroons were disbursed up to spring 2002 to teachers of Estonian as a second language newly employed at Russian-language schools (foreign aid project "Support for the state integration programme").

From spring 2002 to 2005, stipends were not disbursed for this purpose nor was the hiring of new teachers of Estonian as a second language promoted. In 2004, the establishment of a multilingual school support center at the University of Tartu's Narva College was supported in the framework of this mission, with 261,000 kroons.

One of the most important activities in the framework of the given sub-mission is the provision of support instruction to Russian-language students in Estonian-language schools through the project "Non-Estonian-speaking children in Estonian-language schools" (22 projects were supported in 2000-2003).

The activities have not been sufficient to achieve the objective.

I.3.b. Cooperation between Estonian- and Russian-language schools in developing study programmes

An important activity through the years under observation is the development and implementation of the "Open study programme", into which 1.5 million kroons was invested in the given period. Investments were also made into development of new training models and materials. In 2000, development of schools' cooperation network support centers and their training programs began. In 2000, 18 pilot schools were interviewed and an overview was compiled of the curricular work of schools with

Russian as the language of instruction. In 2002, 16 schools with Russian as the language of instruction whose directors were ready for their schools to become test schools for Estonian-language instruction, were selected for a pilot programme. Curricular development seminars for pilot schools were also organized. There were also investments into consolidating, public disclosure and publication of materials on the development work at schools.

The number of non-Estonian schools with a programme in place for transition to Estonian-language instruction was planned to be increased from five in 2001 to 20 in 2003, but only preparations took place in this period. The number of Russian-language schools where at least three subjects were studied in Estonian in basic school grades was 28 in 2000, yet it is not apparent from reports how many of such schools there were in subsequent years. Performance indicators—the number of vocational educational institution groups with Russian as the language of instruction where at least three subjects are taught in Estonian; the number of Estonian-language schools with development programs supporting a transition to Estonian-language study for speakers of other languages; the proportion of joint instruction of total instruction—are also not included in the reports. It is noteworthy that only three of the measurable results set as goals in activity plans were fulfilled in 2002 and 2003: the number of advised and trained school teams (2002), the number of study materials for vocational educational institutions developed in the year (2003) and the number of titles of Estonian-language publications purchased for libraries of Russian-language schools during the year using programme assistance (2002).

Drawing on the IISS report "Appraisal of the activities of the foreign aid project 'Multicultural Estonia'", it can be stated that the accomplishments in the framework of the given sub-mission have contributed significantly to development and implementation of the new study programme as well as to closer cooperation between Estonian- and Russian-language schools. The report cited does not reveal the results of the part of the aforementioned foreign aid project on curricular development: it is pointed out with concern that as the enthusiasm of the early 1990s wore off and the workload of teachers was great, they lacked the readiness to devote their time after seminars to applying the knowledge gained. "The interviewees considered their workload a significant hindrance to contributing to the project's success," it is stated in the report. It follows that the hindrance to successful realization of a well-planned

project was a lack of a motivational mechanism in involving teachers in the development of the study programme.

I.3.c. Intensified instruction of Estonian as a second language

There have been investments in the framework of the given sub-mission in developing the Estonian language intensified instruction programme in vocational educational institutions and institutions of higher learning. There have also been efforts to apply the intensified instruction of Estonian as a second language in vocational educational institutions (teaching Estonian to students in service-related, social services and medical fields) and institutions of higher learning (over the years, supplementary Estonian has been taught at language courses at the three major universities).

Extension of the term for learning the Estonian language took effect in Estonian institutions of higher learning on the basis of regulation no. 28 of the Minister of Education, 19 May 1999, "Requirements and procedures for intensified study of the official language in acquiring a higher education," according to which the standard period of study was extended up to one academic year. One of the requirements holds that the level of Estonian proficiency for a university student starting intensified study of the official language is lower than the average level specified in the Language Act. The activities support achievement of the mission.

I.3.d. Study materials supporting Estonian-language subject instruction and acquisition of Estonian

Investments have been made in the framework of the sub-mission in developing study materials for basic schools and upper secondary schools necessary for Estonian-language subject instruction. The following were developed in the framework of this activity, an Estonian-language study kit, a speech development kit, an anthology of Estonian-language circle and song games, Estonian grammar wall tables, teacher's edition of the table book, a methodological guide accompanying the Estonian grammar wall tables, a pictorial map of Estonia, EFANT (a Web-based Estonian language environment) and a listening game.

In addition, development of training and subject programs necessary for Estonian-language subject instruction and of materials for vocational educational institutions was supported by approximately 1.7 million kroons. Investments were made into development of dictionaries of specialized terminology. Significant sums have been invested into school libraries for the purchase of Estonian-language reading material and academic methodological literature. The following are good examples. In 2001, 34 other-language vocational educational institutions were provided with Estonian grammar tables, while in 2003, the libraries of Russian-language school libraries were provided with the book “Karu süda” (Bear’s Heart).

The appraisers did not disclose problems with academic materials in the course of the mid-term appraisal. Thus the activities in the framework of the given sub-mission can be considered sufficient.

The language proficiency of students acquiring a secondary education is measured by the intermediate level test. The average result in the past two years was 65 points out of 100. In other words, we cannot say that the sub-objective was fulfilled in the case of the youth who placed below the average. The state examination for Estonian as a second language is compulsory from 2003 for those who have acquired a vocational secondary education. A comparison of examination results shows that the Estonian language proficiency level of vocational educational institutions is significantly lower than for learners who acquired a general secondary education.

Several institutions of higher education allow graduates of upper secondary schools to learn Estonian as a supplement during one academic year: this can be considered a correction of the shortcomings of the general education system. There are generally no references in the development plans of county and municipal development plans to the organization of education in other languages, and implementation of bilingual instruction is generally left to the schools, even though all of society requires reforms to be successful²⁸.

As a overall assessment of mission I.3., it can be said that the tempo and content of the transition to Estonian as the language of instruction has not been in conformance to the term provided by legal acts. Even though training and discussions were held in

²⁸ Asser, Hiie. “Tendentsid ja tingimused muukeelse kooli arenguks Eestis”.

developing study programmes for schools, these were not followed by the implementation of the acquired experience in schools. The end of disbursement of stipends following the end of foreign aid for the hiring of teachers of Estonian as a second language is not in conformance with the need for those teachers. Educational institutions lacked an integral statewide plan for planning and carrying out changes, guidance and financial support.

The entire mission accounts for 18% of the sub-programme expenditures and 9% of total expenditures.

I.4. To develop linguistic-cultural cooperation between Estonian- and Russian-language schools, so that students' language proficiency would improve and tolerance of other cultures would develop.

In the framework of the given mission, we treat both vocational educational institutions and general educational schools pursuant to the activity plan.

Considering the fact that it is not possible to increase the number of lessons of Estonian as a second language in vocational study programmes, exchange programs were initiated in the framework of which vocational educational institution students and teachers spend a certain period in practical training in an Estonian-language environment or take part at Estonian-language vocational educational institutions that teach the same fields in instruction in the course of which additional Estonian is taught and learned. From 2000-2004, over 200 vocational school students took part in exchange programs. Due to deficient Estonian acquired in vocational schools, the future integration of Estonian Russians in society and their competitiveness are curtailed.

The number of students taking part in exchange programs has grown each year, allowing us to assume that the given activity is popular among the target group. On the basis of interviews conducted at the Narva Vocational Educational Center, it appears that only a few of the students that took part in exchange programs are interested afterwards in using Estonian language sources in acquiring their education. Unfortunately, use of language is one-off affair and does not instill the habit of, say, even listening to Estonian in order to practice it. One student who took part in an

exchange programme held in the service field could not articulate basic positions during the interview or comprehend elementary questions.

The development of short and long-term exchange programs for general educational school students has been supported as well. There were investments into development and implementation of the model for the exchange programme for general educational teachers (there has been cooperation with University of Tartu's Open University and Tallinn Pedagogical University; individual study programmes were compiled for Narva College teachers, over 200 teachers have taken part in various projects).

The exchange programme for teachers at general educational schools was put together in 2001. There were activities aimed at teachers in 2002-2003, both in the framework of the PHARE programme ES0003.01 and the foreign aid project "Support for the state integration programme". A total of 113 teachers took part in the exchange projects, of whom 57 were trainees from Russian-language schools and 56 were consultants from Estonian-language schools.

Still, activity introducing the opportunities of the project "Domestic assignments for the workforce for the purposes of linguistic and professional practical training" to teachers and faculty was not supported in the given period. Speaking of cooperation between schools, there has been a lack of concerted cooperation between Russian-language schools, in the framework of which schools that have joined the language immersion programme or practiced Estonian-language subject instruction would be able to set a positive example and share their experiences.

According to teachers, Russian teachers do not take part in all Estonian-language subject pairs, which is the reason that this channel does not work well enough to let students acquire Estonian vocabulary for a given subject. In a meeting with the teachers at one Russian school, the academic director cited the problem with the language proficiency of Russian teachers. The director added that at the moment, two teachers were studying Estonian and they should due to that fact acquire the highest level.

Creation of contacts intended for teachers is necessary (such as a Civic Day Quiz and joint history academic Olympics for Estonian- and Russian-language schools). Thus investment of monetary resources could be considered along with making interscholastic cooperation and exchange of information more effective. For example,

over half of Ida-Viru County students have not heard anything of interscholastic cooperation, the survey conducted in the course of the appraisal revealed.

It must be said as an overall assessment of the mission that interscholastic cooperation has not been organized in an orderly manner. Success in exchange programs has been achieved on the basis of projects, even though Russian-language teachers and students should “roam” on the basis of a definite individual development plan. The situation is positive in schools run by Estonians—local governments as the school operators should therefore use this opportunity more actively. State-level interscholastic cooperation between Russian-language schools would also be very important, in the course of which compatriots would provide each other an example and enthusiasm. The mission accounts for 4% of the sub-programme expenditures and 2% of total expenditures.

I.5. To create the conditions for speakers of other languages so that they would want to and be able to function as citizens and make conscious decisions regarding their future academic and working lives.

The given mission consists of two sub-missions:

I.5.a. Concept of civic education, concept of the multicultural school, material for such a school

The civic education concept began to be developed in the period under study in cooperation between the Jaan Tõnisson Institute and the University of Tartu. Through the years, there have been significant investments into diversifying instructional materials for civic education and Estica, material supporting national cultural identity has been created, the concept of the multicultural school formed, in-service training provided for teachers and students’ civic awareness promoted (publication of volume 11 of the national encyclopedia in Russian, introduction to the history of the War of Independence and the birth of the Estonian state, the publication in cooperation with the NEQC in 2004 of an Estonian and Russian-language publication providing reference for teaching the constitution).

The activities support achievement of the mission. The problems here are of a general nature—if young Estonian Russians, like their parents, lack interest in the society here, they will not be interested in civic education topics either. In the future, different approaches in explaining matters important for Estonia could be considered in the process of updating study programmes so that the Russians’ sense of national pride would not interfere with acquisition of the material in the learning process (as in the case of World War II).

I.5.b. Training on topics of the citizen and the multicultural school, informing and consulting

There were investments into in-service training for teachers and school directors on the topics of civics and multicultural schools, and in-service training on the abovementioned themes were conducted for hobby leaders and youth employees. The promotion of various Russian-language schools at the fair “Teeviit” was supported, as was the launch of the website www.rus.delfi.ee/jti/.

A systematic carrying out of vocational consultation of Russian-language students—which besides career planning would play an important part in explaining the necessity of Estonian language proficiency and greater knowledge about Estonia—would have been in the interests of implementation of the mission as a whole.

There has not been enough discussion with student governments and teachers with regard to the content and methodology of civic education in order to achieve a programme of subjects that is of interest to Russian children. Ida-Viru County youth often lack knowledge of opportunities to study and work elsewhere in Estonia.

The activities in the framework of the given mission, I.5., were necessary for fulfilling the sub-mission. In the process of updating study programmes, it is worth, on the experience of other countries, to study needs based on cultural differences for different approaches in treating topics that are sensitive for minorities. Implementation of the vocational consultation system in the final grade of basic school would contribute to the shaping of independent citizens.

The mission accounts for 3% of the sub-programme expenditures and 2% of total expenditures.

I.6. To create a system of training children of new immigrants and exiles to allow them to acquire an education in the Estonian educational system

This is a new mission which consists of a modification of the programme's social competence mission, **To develop training models to support the integration of refugees and other minorities into Estonian society.**

The joint Estonian-Dutch cooperation project MATRA has had its first results in increasing the preparedness in teaching children of new immigrants. There are currently around 200 children in Estonia who can be classified under this mission. Information brochures introducing Estonia's educational system in English and Russian have been distributed to the parents of children of new immigrants in the framework of the project ("Astu sisse! Uusimmigrandid meie ühiskonnas ja haridussüsteemis. Käsiraamat eesti õppekeele koolide õpetajatele, koolijuhtidele ja haridusametnikele", "Astu sisse! Uusimmigrantide ettevalmistus eesti keeles õppimiseks. Õpilase tööraamat", "Astu sisse! Uusimmigrantide ettevalmistus eesti keeles õppimiseks. Õpetajaraamat", "Avatud noortekeskuste arendamine mitmekultuurilises ühiskonnas", "Kuidas kohaneda võõras kultuuris?", "Noorsootöötaja kultuuridevahelises kommunikatsioonis"). Schools were supported with project contests, thanks to which schools have received teacher training and study materials.

The activities launched are necessary for achievement of the new mission.

Sub-programme II "Education and culture of ethnic minorities"

II.1. To raise the awareness of Estonian society of cultural differences, to broaden the opportunities of ethnic minorities in preserving their specific linguistic and cultural character and to increase their knowledge of Estonia.

The following activities were carried out in the period 2000-2004 in order to fulfill the given mission:

Ordering scientific studies in shaping the multicultural model, in the course of which, for example, 10 projects were supported in 2000 in the framework of the Estica competition in the amount of 294,786 kroons. In addition, there has been cooperation

with the Institute of International and Social Studies at Tallinn University in preparing and carrying out integration monitoring. The cultural consumption of the Russian-language community was studied.

30 projects were supported in 2001-2002, the goal of which has been to develop materials on multiculturalism in Estonia, which should provide an overview of Estonian history, culture, Estonians and the ethnic minorities inhabiting Estonia.

In 2001, foreign language periodicals from the mother countries of various ethnic minorities were ordered in the amount of 2.9 million kroons (120 different newspaper titles, 731 magazines and 43,920 copies of various books were procured to Ida-Viru County libraries). In 2001-2004, there were investments in a significant amount in development of museum educational programs (contracts with 11 museums over Estonia, and continual support for development and circulation of supplementary materials). In 2001, the activity of the Russian-language Ida-Viru County theatres Ilmarine, Tuuleveski and Lepatriinu were supported with 1.9 million kroons. The aim was to offer Russian-speaking children and youth professional theatre productions that were based on drama of the Estonian and world stage and/or works by members of the community. Supporting the local theatres of Ida-Viru County has been an important activity. An interview with the director of the cultural department of Ida-Viru County government revealed that the local non-Estonians prefer to consume culture imported from Russia rather than that created at the local level (the comparison used in the interview was theatre productions and the low level of interest among locals toward Estonian traveling productions). Here the insertion of additional activities introducing Estonian culture might be considered in the mission activity plan.

In 2000, preliminary work was begun to develop regional history materials, but there is no information on whether the activity was carried out.

Support for teaching of the language and culture of other peoples (Russian among others) creates a positive social background for acknowledgement of society's multiculturalism.

The Council of Europe's 2003 human rights report stresses the need for better resolution of the problems faced by Roma in the light of a CE round table held in Tallinn in 2000.

A competition organized in 2002 was aimed at making extracurricular academic activity more active in the form of museums, hobby schools, nature conservation areas, exhibitions, libraries, cultural institutions, etc. Study materials and study programs (including digital ones) based on the state study programme and intended for students at Russian-language schools were completed in 2003.

Summarizing mission II.1, the activities carried out can be rated as good. Many activities have been undertaken to support integration of small ethnic minorities as well. It is of course not known on the basis of the publications issued to what extent they are being used—how much interest have ethnic minorities (who communicate with each other in Russian) felt toward Estonia or how much interest Estonians have felt toward the other nationalities here. In the future, more attractive IT or A/V solutions in realizing the mission should be considered.

The costs of the given mission form 33% of the expenses of the sub-mission and 4% of total expenses.

II.2. To support the preservation of the language and culture of ethnic minorities through the activity of national cultural societies, artistic collectives and Sunday schools.

An important activity has been the defining of the status of Sunday schools and developing the basis for state support for them. In 2001, public dialogue was organized on the given topic and cooperation agreements concluded, in 2003, information days were held for Sunday schools and in 2004, the activity of 34 Sunday schools was supported and various publications prepared.

Great progress was made in carrying out training for Sunday school teachers in 2003-2005, in the framework of which the University of Tartu organized methodology training for teachers of the mother tongue of ethnic minorities, and in addition, a seminar was organized in 2004 to introduce educational techniques for working with children with special needs.

Projects initiated by national culture societies, artistic collectives and Sunday schools received significant support. In 2000-2004, over 300 different projects received support totaling 11.7 million kroons (in addition, the Ministry of Culture allocated funds, organizing of seminars, etc, has been supported).

In 2000, a conference was organized for leaders of national cultural societies (primarily with the aim of training and informing them). Leaders play an important role in developing the work of national cultural societies and their training and keeping them in the know helps to make the work of cultural societies more active. Since 2000, the leaders of many societies have been replaced by others and in order to raise administrative capability, regular and continual training and informing of leaders has taken place. The problems of the moment for national cultural societies are primarily administration of paperwork that accompanies projects (the societies are small and putting together projects and reports has become too time-consuming) and managing cash flow (many events are cancelled or organized on a smaller scale, since the project support does not guarantee 100% that support will be received, and there is also a question of timing in receiving funds). At the same time, the IF is seen as an important source of support in introducing their culture to Estonians and a necessary supporter in bringing projects to life.

The representatives of ethnic minorities feel that there could be more educational events aimed at Estonians. The activity of societies is mainly aimed at their own members and events have not achieved a wider base (such as media interest in the civic initiatives of ethnic minorities). A great aid would also be simplification of procedures related to project preparation and reporting for smaller organizations. An index of national cultural societies has been prepared, and it is an important source for anyone interested.

In subsequent periods, the arrival of new ethnic minorities in Estonia (in connection with EU expansion) will become an important field that must certainly receive attention.

The activities to be carried out support achievement of the mission objective. The activities performed to carry out the given activities form 65% of the sub-programme expenses and 5% of total expenses.

II.3. To promote cooperation among national cultural societies and cooperation with the state.

The activity of the President's Roundtable has regularly been supported to develop recommendations in issues of state and community life. The organization of periodic information days for national cultural societies—both on state policy on ethnicities and other topics—has not been reported under the mission in activity reports. The fact that this was done in the sections on missions II.2 and IV.1 shows the greatly overlapping nature of the three missions and the need to consolidate them into one group of activities upon changes in the programme structure.

Depending on the problem positioning, government institutions seek opinions from umbrella organizations. On the basis of the survey conducted in the framework of the mid-term appraisal, representatives of ethnic minorities do not receive much special help from the cooperation between them and thus they are used to contacting Estonians' organizations or government institutions whenever they have concerns. The lack of information was also mentioned as a standard answer in surveys, indicating a need to discuss better aiming of necessary information at them. The interviews conducted in the course of the mid-term appraisal pointed up the low level of involvement of ethnic minorities in ethnic policy topics. To the question of how they saw cooperation with the government and government institutions on the topic of the problems of ethnic minorities, many were somewhat dissatisfied (30% of respondents). Approximately half of respondents found that Estonia had partially used the experiences of other multicultural countries in resolving ethnic issues.

The activities support achievement of the mission.

The expenses for the given mission accounted for 2% of the sub-programme expenditures and 0.2% of total expenditures.

II.4. To support the activity of new national-language basic schools.

The mission stated in the official programme does not have any significance in reality, as only one school, the Vladimir Korniyenko Private Upper Secondary School has the

national-language private basic school classes initially desired. Given the existence of municipal schools, Estonian Russians have not considered it necessary to create more private schools. Other nations, on the other hand, are too small to found their own basic schools and so Sunday schools are used for instruction in the mother tongue. It has not proven successful to restore the pre-war private school of the Jewish community in its full extent, since the fragmentation and ageing of the community and the omission of one interim period have had its effect. Despite this, the primary task stemming from actual demand for education has been fulfilled (the municipal school was reinstated), with the Jewish community playing an assisting role. Considering the numbers of the Ukrainian minority in Tallinn, city assistance might have been considered for founding an Ukrainian school as well. Intensified Finnish is taught in ordinary schools. The mission has no significance in the context of the Private Schools Act, since general educational schools based on the state study programme must be supported by the central and local government in any circumstance.

In the course of the survey conducted in the framework of the appraisal, it was studied whether respondents were aware of the possibility of acquiring an education in their native language. About half of respondents believed their ethnic group did not have such an opportunity and about 1/4 of respondents were aware that there was such an opportunity.

The global trend in the last decades has been an emphasis on one's own ethnic identity. It is clear from IM2005 data that for two-thirds of non-Estonians, it is important that they preserve their ethnic identity, with only one in ten supporting assimilation. The existence of administrative and financial problems stemming from the smallness of ethnic group does not mean that such an ethnicity does not have the desire to found a basic school if the opportunity or administrative capacity arises.

No activities were planned for the period 2000-2004 in the framework of the given mission. The future need for the mission is questionable, considering the limited administrative capacity of ethnic minorities, besides the potential of Estonian Russians. If the opportunity to found a private basic school arises, efforts can be made to contribute to the process in light of the general sub-programme for ethnic minorities.

Sub-programme III “Estonian language instruction for adults”

III.1. To develop the Estonian language proficiency testing system and related consultation with the aim of ensuring greater reliability of the proficiency testing and a positive effect on study of Estonian as a second language.

Training for those administering basic school proficiency testing was organized in 2000 in the framework of this mission, and the same year, the basic school examination handbook was published. 2000 also saw analysis of Estonian proficiency tests. Results of exams at basic school and upper secondary schools were entered and a collection of examination analysis was published. Yet there is no information in the activity reports for the subsequent years on continuation of activities, even though NEQC was responsible for that function. NEQC's homepage contains statistics and analysis on the official language examination (more thorough) on the basis of 2001/2002 comparisons; source statistics on 2002-2005 by proficiency level and analysis and summary of surveys conducted in among those taking the state examination in 2003.

Materials on the language examinations and examination procedures were compiled and distributed (a total of around 400,000 kroons was invested in 2000-2004 to compile and distribute various reference works, carrying out sample examinations, etc.) Examination results are reliable and successful performance at examination provides a positive effect. The primary problems are with motivation for learning the language.

Cooperation in various development projects was also supported in 2000-2004 (between ALTE, the Council of Europe and Estonian experts).

In summary, it can be said that the international experience in organizing language examinations has been applied successfully in Estonia. This has resulted in ensuring interested parties and the government routine functioning of the language verification system.

The costs of the given mission form 2% of the expenses of the sub-mission and 0.4% of total expenses.

III.2. To create the foundation for linguistic-communicative integration for adult non-Estonians in the form of availability of quality Estonian language instruction.

In the period 2000-2003, studies on the motivation for learning language were ordered, and a total of approximately 470,000 kroons were invested in period for carrying out the given activity.

Elucidation of needs of teachers for in-service training and development of models for in-service training was supported (totaling around 546,000 kroons) and the compilation of methodological and didactic guides for teachers (totaling around 931,000 kroons, which does not match the availability expressed in the mission.

2000 saw 4 (2-3-day) language learning seminars held. A total of around 120 adults took part. Information days were organized for around 200 teachers at Russian schools.

The period 2000-2004 did not see activity in activating the network or training of regional teacher trainers or in launching counseling assistance for Estonian language teachers for adults, which is corroborated by the survey conducted in the framework of the mid-term appraisal. The 2004 SIP report to the government does not treat the given mission activities. The passive attitude toward organizing better language instruction displayed by ministries and other state institutions responsible for employees in vital walks of life—policemen, health care workers, prison officials—should be noted, however. It should be analyzed what are the needs and ways of keeping adult non-Estonians informed with regard to the aims of language study. The problem in the last few years is not so much organization of quality language study as obtaining reliable and compact information on the various opportunities.

Our overall assessment is that we cannot be completely satisfied with the fulfillment of this mission, since the regional dimension has remained very weak in training and forwarding information. A characteristic indicator of the government's attitude is the shortcomings of the system of study for the official language for employees in vital walks of life. The treatment of teachers of Russian schools here and not in the

framework of in-service training for teachers in the education sub-objective, is questionable.

The mission accounts for 8% of the sub-programme expenditures and 1% of total expenditures.

III.3. To expand the opportunities for adult speakers of languages other than Estonian to learn Estonian in order to ensure Estonian-language proficiency on the level necessary for everyday and professional interaction.

One of the most important activities is subsidization of social priority groups—the unemployed, job-seekers, conscripts, public servants.

In the period 2000-2004, about 5 million kroons was invested and 2,716 public servants and conscripts received training. In 2004, a competition was held for providing 120 hours of language education for 800 participants.

Language study for social risk groups (unemployed, job-seekers) was subsidized in the framework of the PHARE projects in 2000-2002. Primarily the Ida-Viru County and Tallinn Employment Offices have been tied to the given activity, considering language study upon hiring to be an important factor. According to the Ida-Viru County Employment Office, there is today an urgent need for such language instruction: there are frequent queries from the unemployed regarding whether it is possible.

The most important activity in the framework of the given mission is the extensive, results-based subsidization of language study—the “Interest” project. Language study was subsidized in the amount of 14 million kroons in the period 2000-2004. As of 30 August 2005, refunds had been made to 11,200 people. In addition, language courses and employment assignments have been organized in addition. As a result of the survey conducted in the course of the appraisal, around half of respondents believe that language study should be supported irrespective of results. Approximately half find that the courses are not available due to the location or cost.

Support for employment assignments in the framework of the SIP continued in order to support language study for non-Estonians, which is an activity that promotes cooperation between Estonians and Russians and promotes integration. Activity

reports indicate that various projects have been supported in the amount of 1.8 million kroons, and a total of 165 public servants have taken part in business assignments.

In 2000 and 2001, the creation of a support person programme for adults learning Estonian was supported as well.

According to IISS's 2005 report, labor force exchange can be considered an innovative solution²⁹. The language instruction component (primarily overcoming of the language barrier) and creating social connections are both important. Interviews with target group representatives conducted in the course of this mid-term appraisal also provided positive feedback for the exchange programme.

The fact that as a whole, the Estonian proficiency of non-Estonians has as a whole not improved in the last eight years, remaining around 40% according to IM2005 data, requires serious analysis and the making of a decision. Even though linguistic experts believe that survey methods and data do not allow the results to be taken as 100% accurate, there are no better available methods or data for making conclusions about language proficiency. Acquiring Estonian depends not only on language study programs carried out by the state, but on general socio-economic and cultural developments in society.

In conclusion it can be said that broadening the field of use of Estonian, which represents a primary objective of Estonian integration, is inherently a long-term social process, which is not possible to achieve with a project-based approach.

The necessity for Estonian language instruction has been diminished in the eyes of non-Estonians by inconsistency of government administrations' policies: easing and changing of the requirements and time limits set for proficiency in the official language has resulted in loss of faith in these requirements. Approximately half of respondents attending language courses found that the effective learning of Estonian is hindered by the lack of opportunities to use the language in practice. The activities carried out in the framework of the mission were appropriate, with language instruction aimed at social risk groups and performance-based support for language instruction being especially important.

²⁹ Vöormann, R., Helemäe, J., Nimmerfeldt, G. Appraisal of the foreign aid project "Multicultural Estonia" activities, 2005, pg 20.

Vöormann, R., Helemäe, J., Nimmerfeldt, G. Appraisal of the foreign aid project "Multicultural Estonia" activities, 2005, pg 26.

The costs of the given mission form 68% of the expenses of the sub-programme and 11% of total expenses, showing the significance of the given mission to the sub-programme .

III.4. To support linguistic-communicative integration of non-Estonians through involving and informing the public.

The most important activity in the framework of the given mission is the carrying out of social promotional campaigns to promote linguistic-communicative integration, including raising the image of Estonian and putting a value on language proficiency. In 2000 a campaign promoting “Interest” was carried out (1.4 million kroons), in 2002, conducting of surveys was supported in the framework of the given activity (approximately 500,000 kroons), in 2002 an additional “Interest” promotional campaign was held (1.14 million kroons), in 2003, the campaigns for “Lugu sellest, kuidas ma keelt õppisin” (Story of how I learned the language) and “Keel toidab!” (Language Feeds) were carried out (total of around 2.7 million kroons), in 2004 the “Lugu sellest, kuidas ma keelt õppisin” campaign was carried out (total of around 3.5 million kroons). In addition, the activity of the free information telephone line was supported, and public information events were organized. There has been separate efforts devoted to developing various electronic information channels (supplementing the IF website, creating the PHARE website).

This is a mission that is very confusingly worded and it is hard to appraise the results. The activities of the given mission can be of a supportive nature for a very stable long-term government administration (see previous mission). SIP reports cite provide activity summaries for social promotional campaigns (for example, it emerged in 2001 on the basis of the survey that 94 % of the target group had noticed the advertisements, while more than half (58%) of the target group were aware of the project “Interest”; 2002 – the Russian language website www.interest.edu.ee was founded, and 20 000 information folders were distributed and information stands installed in the primary information centers; 2003 – the campaign “Keel toidab!” continued, the aims being to provide sufficient information on opportunities for learning the language, further “Interest” and increase the number of people registering for language courses; the campaign “Lugu sellest, kuidas ma eesti keelt õppisin” was

designed to provide acknowledgement of people learning Estonian, to create a positive attitude toward people speaking Estonian as a foreign language and to encourage people whose native tongue is Estonian to be well-meaning partners in interaction, which does not however indicate that the campaigns were effective or influential (as shown as by the general level of proficiency staying the same).

In conclusion, it should be said that the use of resources has not been effective. The large expenditures on promotional activities for language learning have not resulted in changes, as seen from IM2005. Instead of costly commercial channels, cheaper ways of reaching target groups should have been thought out: direct contact with (large) corporations, inexpensive local media channels, wider use of the Internet.

The costs of the given mission form 21% of the expenses of the sub-programme and 3% of total expenses.

III.5. To analyze the development of the linguistic relations and socio-cultural competence of various groups of people in various walks of life and on this basis, to develop measures for the acceleration of the formation of Estonian as a lingua franca and the development of multilingualism.

This is a mission that has not been covered by activities in the last few years. Here we have a case of a possible threat recognized when the programme was put together becoming a reality in part—*disregarding of scientific points of departure and avoidance of measuring performance*. Even though the results of the monitoring survey are presented in the corresponding publication in analytical form (articles + tables) along with conclusions and recommendations, there is no further analysis by scientists on the basis of these data in order to allow the necessary corrections to the SIP to be attained through the surveys.

Unlike the first two missions of the given sub-objective, we cannot say that these topics are any less salient (only 40% of non-Estonians get by in Estonian). The survey conducted in 2002-2003 in the framework of the “Mina. Maailm. Meedia” study reveals the following: in 1981, 58% had no Estonian, while in 2003, the figure was only 12% among non-Estonians; in 1981, 10% of non-Estonians considered

themselves to be fluent in Estonian, while the figure in 2003 was 27 %; Estonians consider their Russian ability better than non-Estonians do their Estonian ability; Russians have more opportunities to test their Estonian and are better at assessing their Estonian; the higher their educational level or income, the more people with active Estonian or Russian proficiency in that group. Broader use of linguists and sociologists would undoubtedly be necessary in the framework of the given mission.

The aforementioned study was not funded in the framework of the programme.

IV. Sub-programme IV "Social competence"

IV.1. To develop the cooperation related to the integration of non-Estonians between the third sector and state institutions.

Projects totaling 4.5 million kroons were supported through a general competition in the period 2000-2004 (143 different projects received support).

As a separate activity, information days have been organized on a periodic basis, reports made on IF activity, and annual development grants distributed (totaling 140,000 kroons). The aim of the development grants distributed annually is to spur the development of new integration projects. Those developing and organizing projects carried out in the previous year are eligible for grants. Thus this is an example of a supra-mission approach which interlocks with all of the SIP fields.

At the same time, analysis and supplementing of the principles for funding the integration-related activity of NGOs has not been dealt with under the given mission.

The mission overlaps to a great extent with the ethnic minorities sub-programme mission **To promote cooperation among national cultural societies and cooperation with the state** (see mission II.3, p. 67), as national cultural societies are part of the third sector. It would be expedient to merge these missions.

The overall assessment of the activities carried out is positive. Better forwarding of information to invitees in organizing information days should be considered, in order

to ensure greater turnout. The points expressed in the mission would be better as a part of everyday routine tasks than a group of activities that requires separate emphasis in the programme.

The costs of the mission form 13% of the expenses of the sub-programme and 1% of total expenses.

IV.2. To support consistency of the development of youth associations and student governments in order to ensure more opportunities for joint activity for young speakers of other languages and shape their social competence.

Regular training of leaders of youth associations and student governments has taken place and the formation and strengthening of new regional student government suborganizations/youth associations has also been given support. Activities aimed at introducing the topic of youth associations and student governments into the training programs of school administration staff and teacher training programs were supported in significant measure in 2000-2001. Over 1 million kroons has been invested into carrying out 48 different projects.

In 2002-2004, youth cooperation was also supported through programs and projects (a total of 1.35 million kroons and 22 different projects and, in addition, compilation of youth centre development plans). A study of the development plans of youth associations, compilation of materials on the basis of the study and corresponding training were also carried out.

At the same time, Russian-language youth associations and student governments are not involved in the activities of their Estonian-speaking peers and thus there is little interaction between the youth. According to data from the youth association Avatud Vabariik (Open Republic), there are approximately 50 Russian school student governments, but not all of them are actively operational. Joint activity is hindered by the language problem, since the Russian youths do not have sufficient Estonian proficiency and Estonian youth have poorer Russian ability. Thus we cannot be satisfied with the limitation of joint activity in the mission by ethnicity. Contacts

between youths would help in inculcation of the language immersion and camp programme, domestic interaction, broadening of learning opportunities.

Youth policy is brought to life by the relevant departments of the MER and on the basis of the approved youth work vision document. The contribution of the ministry would be welcome in uniting the student government work between Estonians and Russians at various levels.

The assessment of the success of this mission is twofold. The activities have contributed significantly to strengthening the sustainability of the youth associations. The self-initiated projects supported have in addition helped to grow the awareness of youth of the nature of other cultures, shape open attitudes toward youth cooperation, tolerance and mutual understanding and has created friendship ties³⁰. The successful implementation has also been aided by the fact that there has been thorough preliminary analysis (for example, an investigation of the development plans of youth associations) with the actual needs elucidated. At the same time, there is a lack of clear activities to conjoin the activities of Estonian and Russian youth organizations, especially with regard to the activity of student governments. As for what next, the need to support youth associations on the basis of ethnicity is questionable and the carrying out of a unified youth policy outside of the SIP through the relevant departments of the MER merits consideration.

The mission accounts for 14% of the sub-programme expenditures and 1% of total expenditures.

IV. 3. To elaborate more diversely the integration topic in both the Estonian- and Russian-language media; to establish and to extend the common part of both the Estonian- and Russian-language media system; to increase the interactivity of Russian-language media; to improve the availability and quality of institutional and utilitarian information in Russian language in the media for the purpose of promoting the social participation of the Russian-speaking population.

To implement the above mission, activities involving training journalists and organizing stipend competitions were planned. During 2000-2002, these activities

were supported with approximately half million kroons, stipends were awarded and seminars were organized.

An important activity in the framework of the mission mentioned above has been the producing of television programmes in Estonian and Russian. Approximately 3 million kroons has been invested in this activity. The most familiar television programmes on the topic of integration are Sputnik (Sputnik), Unetus (Sleeplessness), Dilemma (Dilemma), the programme cycle of Uudistaja (Reporter), etc. The primary objective has been to change the television watching habits of Russian speakers in Estonia. In the period 2002-2004, establishing of Russian-language radio programmes was also supported. For example, there is a contract with a radio station Raadio 4 under which programmes concerning social life and integration in Russian are produced. As a positive reform, programmes for other minorities have also been started, namely programmes in the Ukrainian language and programmes for the Jewish community (in 2002, two radio programme series for minorities were supported). According to the IISS report (Institute of International and Social Studies), it will also be complicated in future to carry out the recommendation of the estimators of the previous foreign aid project to apply measures to assure for the smaller minorities a possibility, in spite of their limited possibilities and knowledge of writing projects and applying for funds, to participate in Estonian society. In a situation where the public broadcaster Raadio 4 has quite limited equipment and an important criterion of estimating the efficiency of their activity is the size of the audience, it would help just to target resources at the small minorities in an expedient manner in order to allow them to make themselves heard by the public. For the support of the radio programme, approximately 1.45 million kroons were invested. The radio programmes particularly contribute to the awareness of the wider public about the cultural life and activities of minorities' associations.

Unfortunately, public broadcasting (particularly ETV) does not represent the natural segment of shows aimed at a 30% segment of population; programme producers say that (discussions with the representatives of ETV and ER) they produce the shows based on projects. After the spread of cable television, the Estonian Russians have selected Russian television channels as their main media sources and for that reason it is complicated to inform them about the events in Estonia. The number of newspaper readers is also continuously declining. It would be natural to have bilingual programmes as a natural and stable part of public broadcasting financed by the state

budget. The responsible institution for the television and radio programmes aimed at the minorities would be the Ministry of Culture and Broadcasting Council. In creating a common information network, the Riigikogu has not solved the shortages of financing of ETV and ER. Neither has the assembly prioritized in the SIP the topics provided by the steering committee. It would have been possible to cover the topic of integration better on a contractual basis with journalists writing in Russian, in order to avoid the domination of negative opinions. At the meeting with the employers of Ida-Viru County, the “Istoki” supplement of the newspaper *Põhjarannik* was cited as a positive example, one that also conveyed more important changes in the legislation concerning the region. “Istoki” was discontinued because funding was project-based. According to the survey carried out in the framework of the appraisal, approximately half of the non-Estonians of Ida-Viru County who participated see their knowledge of Estonian language as insufficient for following Estonian-language programming. Programmes in Russian shown on Estonian channels are only a topic for discussion among 23% of the non-Russians who participated.

In summary, this mission must be considered as unsuccessful. Several positive activities have resulted in temporary project-based changes, and the results of media have not demonstrated that a common knowledge field has been created due to media monitoring. Programmes enabling implementation in the framework of the everyday work of public broadcasting have not become a natural part of SIP. The idea of creating a bilingual programme for ETV as a second programme has been completely abandoned.

The mission forms 23% of the expenses of the sub-programme and 2% of total expenses.

IV.4. To increase the number of media and information professionals among non-Estonian youth; to raise a new generation of non-Estonians with new, regular media consumption habits and the skills to orient in the information society.

In the framework of the mission, training was organized for the teachers of general education schools and the management of schools, media teaching study programmes and necessary refresher course programmes for the media teachers were analyzed,

instruction materials (“Media education in general education schools”) were analyzed, and various training sessions were organized.

According to the activity reports, other planned activities were not implemented during the observed period. Those planned activities were elaboration of the training programmes of the teachers of non-Estonian schools and their application in the specialties of journalism, advertising and public relations in the institutions of higher education, elaboration and application of the system of diploma study for journalists in electronic media in cooperation with the institutions of higher education together with stimulating preliminary work in the school, including essay competitions and youth-edited sections in daily papers. At a meeting with the representatives of the Youth Media Club³⁰, who have organized trainings concerning school newspapers for the non-Estonian youth and teachers, it was pointed out that although interest exists, the biggest shortcoming concerning the training of teachers is the lack of language proficiency (for example, the teachers of Russian schools had to participate in training that was aimed at pupils because the materials of the training aimed at the teachers turned out to be too complicated due to the lack of proficiency in the language).

According to the IISS report, media studies are one of the obligatory topics in the study programme at in the national curriculum at basic and upper secondary schools, and its purpose is to give a holistic view of elementary facts about media to the pupils and to develop knowledge to orient in the media, and in turn to shape critical media consumers who will not be manipulated and who have the need and habit of getting necessary knowledge from the media³¹. General education schools were obliged to make their study programmes meet the national curriculum with regard to basic topics by 1 September 2004 at the latest. Here we should mention the assessment part of the IISS report: “In summary, it can be said that the delay of the sub-activities, and failure to achieve the activities of media education, is in large part related to the lack of sufficient self- analysis and not having an adequate view of the real situation. For that reason, the assumptions on which the programme and its objectives rested turned out to be incorrect. In addition, the project team did not have sufficient preliminary experience in the field of media education in comparison with many follow-up

³⁰ The Youth Media Club has organised training camps for school newspaper editors since 2000. Since 2003, pupils and teachers from the Russian schools have participated five times. In the camps theoretical knowledge and practical instructions for making school papers were given to the pupils. They also could immediately apply them in the end of the camp when composing a paper.

³¹ Vöörmann, R., Helemäe, J., Nimmerfeldt, G. Appraisal of the foreign-funded “Multicultural Estonia”, 2005, p. 28.

activities about what the experiences were obtained during the implementation of the previous foreign aid project. For that reason, there was a lack of adequate knowledge about the situation in Russian schools and about teachers' Estonian proficiency levels and their level of media knowledge. Comparison of two quite different accounts of teachers' in-service training confirms the statement that in planning and executing the media education activities, there was not always enough attention paid to the analysis of the needs and expectations of the target group. The CEDC (Central Estonian Development Centre) training, which proceeded from previous experiences and whose training provider had an adequate view of the level of the knowledge, was much more successful, in the opinion of participants.”

Going by meetings with the youth, Russian-speaking youth orient relatively well in the information society and there is also a habit of using English sources for information. Teachers play a relevant role in inciting interest in information in Estonian. For those who know no Estonian, Estonian sources remain secondary. According to the survey of teachers, approximately one-half of participants seek out and also receive the necessary information from the Estonian press, but this was not regarded as sufficient. In striving toward the purpose of the given mission, it would also be important to use standard and efficient broadcasted learning programmes and to prepare instruction materials on CDs.

Analyzing activities, both planned and actually performed, in the framework of the given mission, we can summarize that considerably less has been performed than was initially planned. The reason may be overly enthusiastic activity programmes and unrealistic objectives, which in turn originate from a lack of an adequate view of the real situation of both the priorities of education policy and the situation in Russian-speaking schools. The second reason is regarded as the fact that the contribution of the co-operation partners remained unrealised³².

The expenses of the mission form 6% of the expenses of the sub-programme and 1% of total expenses.

IV.5. To intensify the communication between Estonians and non-Estonians; to establish and to develop the dialogue between cultures.

³² Vöörmann, R., Helemäe, J., Nimmerfeldt, G. Appraisal of the foreign-funded “Multicultural Estonia”, 2005, p. 30.

A few of the more important activities: production of bilingual programmes, including production of the programmes for learning the language. In the period 2000-2004, the activity was supported by approximately 2.7 million kroons. For example, a series of 25 chapters of a half an hour each, "Eetris on Eesti" (Estonia is on the air), was supported. In 2002, a contest for creating language learning television programmes and video materials was prepared, and in 2003, three major projects were supported. In 2000, in the framework of production of bilingual stage performances, the project "Save Your Soul" was supported.

In the period under observation, activities that are related to the organizing of a social advertising campaign were performed, drawing the public's attention to the multicultural society and structuring the media relations. For example the "Palju toredaid inimesi" ("Many nice people") and "Naeratusest algab sõprus" ("Friendship starts with a smile") campaigns and events advertising citizen's day were supported. In total, approximately 2 million kroons has been invested into social advertising campaigns.

The publications of the bilingual newspaper *Ruupor* were completed, providing important information about integration. In addition, sets of picture postcards were produced.

Yet the framework programme of Common Events was not elaborated, nor where to apply it.

A positive tendency is efficient integration in the third sector, where hobbies help bring people together. Russian-language football, initiated in the 1990s, has now become a bilingual sport enjoyed en masse. The best players advance. On the level of the masters league the footballers from Narva participate in matches in Kuressaare and vice versa. It is important to have Estonian-speaking leaders (this example is not related to the SIP).

The given mission has a lot of tangents with media and the missions of intercommunication and for that reason it would be practical to join these activities together. The previous activities have not been productive according to the results of monitoring. There are few attractive programmes and the programmes favoring integration have not become a natural part of the ETV programme. The expenses of the social advertising campaigns are questionable. The formulation of the mission does not enable to estimate performance.

The mission forms 26% of the expenses of the sub-programme and 3% of the total expenses.

IV.6. To support the legal-political integration of non-Estonians.

Approximately 900,000 kroons has been invested into carrying out social advertising to motivate people to take citizenship exams, ordering the programmes and articles, and organizing media relations. The funds were used to organize citizen's day campaigns and the production of the "Hea kodanik" ("Good citizen") posters and card and publication of folders.

Important progress with regard to elaborating necessary and practical information for passing the citizenship exam and applying for citizenship was made by publishing the citizen's manual ("Kodaniku käsiraamat") in 2004. This is a bilingual publication. In the framework of youth-oriented common events, debates and other activities on topic of legal-political integration, various forensics projects have been supported (approximately half a million kroons in total).

The activity of www.kodanik.ee has also been supported. In co-operation with Eesti Põlevkivi, preparation by non-citizen employees of an exam of knowledge in the Estonian language and knowledge of laws was supported.

Additionally, implementation of active labor market measures has been supported with the purpose of ensuring integration with the labor market for young unemployed non-Estonian speakers. In 2002, in co-operation with Tallinn Employment Office, a project was supported in which 25 young unemployed non-Estonian speakers participated. In co-operation with Ida-Viru County Labor Market Board a project was supported in which 40 young unemployed non-Estonian speakers participated. In 2003 the project "Dokumenteerimata inimeste integreerimine Eesti ühiskonda" ("The integration of undocumented people in Estonian society") was performed as a supplementary activity.

Changes in the sense of identity of non-Estonians is related to the phenomenon of "two native countries" (IM2005). 20-25% of non-Estonian respondents, both citizens and non-citizens, regard both Estonia and Russia as their home countries. In 2000-2003, less than 4,100 persons acquired citizenship by naturalization, while in 2004, 6,523 persons became naturalized. Accession to the EU certainly plays an important role in this as it creates abundant working, studying and traveling possibilities in other EU countries for Estonian citizens. The process has also been intensified by the Act

Amending the Citizenship Act adopted in Riigikogu on 10 December 2003 which provides 100% compensation of the tuition fee for Estonian language instruction paid to licensed private schools by successful takers of the Estonian language examination and the examination of knowledge of the constitution and Citizenship Act, or graduates of Estonian language and constitution and Citizenship Act courses. The number of persons with unspecified nationality in Estonia is decreasing, which is one of the main criteria for integration. As of 31 December 2004, the number of those persons had fallen to 150,536. The recommendation of EEC proposed in 2003—to specify the nationality according to the country of birth to reduce the number of children with unspecified nationality—has not yet been realized.

According to the IISS report³³ as a whole, the given activity as one component of the project was highly necessary. The allocation of foreign aid to the activity is seen as justified in every respect but lack of clarity with regard to sustainability is reported--the government's initial refusal of the funding application submitted by NEQC (National Exam and Qualification Centre, raised again the question: are certain activities (partial compensation of language studies) necessary only so long as it is possible to involve foreign aid? From the IISS report, it is unclear how the steps made for citizen awareness were directly reflected in the increase of the number of citizens. Citizens perceive themselves as being better related to the local community. They are more motivated to study and use the language and are also more active on the labor market. Newly-won political rights also play their role, which decrease the non-represented population. In 2004 the project "Support for the integration of non-citizens," part of the programme of the EU Transition Facility, was started. The purpose of the project is to increase the number of citizens from among the non-citizens. Analysis of legal-political integration treating only the topic of nationality is too limited. Engagement of non-Estonians in the public sector seems limited. There are 9 non-Estonians³⁴ in the Riigikogu and none in the government and among the county governors.

To summarize, it is positive that Transition Facility was also started in addition to the project "Interest," which promotes applying for Estonian citizenship. The question of

³³ Vöörmann, R., Helemäe, J., Nimmerfeldt, G. Appraisal of the foreign-funded "Multicultural Estonia", 2005.

³⁴ On the basis of the membership of the Riigikogu.

sustainability after the end of the foreign aid is mentioned in the IISS report³⁵ (that has since got a positive solution through the state budget).

The expenses form 19% of the sub-programme and 2% of total expenses, which is not in sufficient proportion to this important mission.

IV.7. To increase the coping of the non-Estonian population by facilitating emergency psychological assistance through a Russian language telephone help line.

IV.8. To increase the coping of non-Estonian deaf people by giving them assistance to continue studies and to achieve success at making a career.

IV.9. To increase the level of physical, intellectual and social functioning of the non-Estonian blind possible as high as possible by developing greater independence, enabling them to read Braille or listen to literature, specialty texts, textbooks, periodicals and reference books in audio form.

Those missions have turned into specific tasks not reflected in the reports. The problem is that the target group is too small compared to the other missions. According to the data of the evaluators, the activities described will be performed in the framework of the welfare service policy in the area of government of the Ministry of Social Affairs and local governments without setting ethnicity as a primary characteristic.

IV.10. To elaborate training models in order to support the integration of refugees and other minorities into Estonian society.

The given mission was transferred to the education sub-objective in a changed wording:

To create a training system for children of the new immigrants and refugees to allow them to get an education in the Estonian educational system (see mission I.6. p. 63).

Sub-programme V, “Management and evaluation of the state programme and increasing the capacity of the institutions”

³⁵ Vöörmann, R., Helemäe, J., Nimmerfeldt, G. Appraisal of the foreign-funded “Multicultural Estonia”, 2005.

The capacity of the institutions will not increase if the number of officials/personnel related to the integration does not increase. On the basis of the interviews with the members of the steering committee and the foundation, ministries other than the Ministry of Education and Research do not perceive direct responsibility for the performance of the programme. The office of the Minister for Population Affairs does not bear the continuity because when the Minister changes, new advisers are employed as well.

V.1. To organize the management and evaluation of the IF's sphere of responsibility of the state programme, in order to guarantee the development, efficient application and the achievement of the primary objectives of the programme.

The organization of the work of the integration programme steering committee was supported with approximately half a million kroons in 2000-2004.

In the framework of research on integration, organization of appraisal of projects and publishing the yearbook, the following studies were supported: general monitoring of the media and integration, publishing the Foundation yearbook, organization of the international conference "Multicultural Estonia", and the media study on integration conducted by the Baltic Association for Media Research. The total investment in the various studies during the period under observation is approximately 2.9 million kroons.

The state-financed activity expenses of the Integration Foundation are related to two main fields. One of them is covering the activity expenses of the IF (Integration Foundation) and the second field is co-financing of various projects. The foundation administrates a great majority of the activities performed in the framework of the integration programme.

Listed as separate activities are the financing of the activity expenses of Multi 1 and Multi 2 (includes fees, expenses concerning reporting and auditing and expenses concerning organization of the meetings of the managing committees). Also mentioned is the financing of the activity expenses of PHARE 1 and PHARE 2 (this includes fees, expenses concerning reporting and expenses concerning organization of the meetings of the steering committees).

Recommendations provided during an appraisal performed by PriceWaterhouseCoopers (PWC) in 2003 have been implemented. The State Audit Office found in 2004 that the distribution of the integration funds and disbursement of support were well-organized.

The mission forms 76% of the expenses of the sub-programme and 12% of the total expenses.

V.2. To organize the management and evaluation of the MER's sphere of the responsibility of the programme in order to guarantee the development, efficient application and the achieving of the primary objectives of the programme.

In the framework of the mission, there have been the following activities:

- directing and coordination of the programme, programme development counseling and training (approximately 4.1 million kroons was invested in 2000-2004);
- drafting the activity plans and monitoring and evaluating their realization and evaluation (approximately 700,000 kroons was invested);
- developing the criteria for evaluation of the results of the programme and individual projects and the approval of the studies ordered in the framework of the programme (48.000 kroons was invested in 2000);
- management and coordination of particular projects (supporting the management of the EU PHARE “Language Study Programme of Estonia”, 180,000 kroons invested).

The following activities were not implemented in the period under observation:

- developing the performance appraisal criteria for the programme and individual projects and the approval of the studies ordered in the framework of the programme;
- analysis and evaluation of the primary objectives of the programme;
- the elaboration of the content and financial reporting and the preparing of consolidated reports.

As the biggest problems in performing the programme are related to the language study and Russian-language schools, the existence of feedback and reaction to it by the Ministry of Education and Research cannot be regarded as satisfactory. The reports on the education programme, with shortcomings highlighted, has not received the necessary attention or correction on the basis of the interview conducted at the

Ministry of Education and Research. The resources of the given sphere of responsibility are clearly insufficient to apply the programme efficiently. There has been a lack of a firm will on the part of the governments to set the objectives of the educational sub-programme as priorities.

The expenses of the mission form 9% of the expenses of the programme and 1% of the total expenses.

V.3. To increase the capacity of the institutions related to the integration, including improving the institutional availability and quality of institutional-utilitarian information in Russian.

In 2000, training of Ida-Viru County and local government officials was supported. A countrywide seminar was organized where a two-year regional language study strategy project was summarized. Five 2-day seminars were organized.

In 2000, a database of the studies made in Ida-Viru County in the last 10 years was composed. At the same time, the reports supply no information about completion or renewal of the database.

In the framework of the given mission, there has been continuous training of management and personnel of the IF, and the technical base has continuously been improved. 940,000 kroons in total has been invested in the given activity during the period observed. The main investment subjects have been training sessions, creation of websites (e. g. web newspaper “Multicultural Estonia”), etc.

Training of Citizenship and Migration Board officials has also been a separate activity.

In addition there has been support for training for the ministries and public departments with a focus on developing the communication skills needed for Russian-language media and Russian-speaking clients. In 2003, a contract was signed with the Estonian Public Administration Institute as a result of the contest of the development project “Local government-level measures and indicators for the integration of the non-Estonian population”. Through the EL PHARE programme, expert assistance was provided to the improvement of the administration capacity of the Integration Foundation and the target group of the integration projects. The training was organized for 150 representatives of non-profit associations.

In the framework of the given mission the main stress has been on training (foundation, Citizenship and Migration Board, related ministries and state

institutions). The availability of practical knowledge in Russian prompted the most complaints in Ida-Viru County. As it is complicated to direct important information to the population through the media, the governmental institutions (including local governments) will have an important role in directing the information to the target groups. According to the survey, people visit those institutions for one reason or another, for important transactions. Unfortunately, no attention has been paid in the programme to jails and prisons where Russian speaking prisoners are predominant, returning to the society without language proficiency or professional skills.

The expenses of the mission form 15% of the expenses of the sub-programme and 2% of the total expenses.

Summary of appraisal of all missions

It is extremely complicated to evaluate how cost-efficiently the missions were realized—the basis of the mid-term appraisal—because in many activities it is impossible to determine the number of beneficiaries or the level of benefit. In activities with specific beneficiaries, one can indeed measure the expense per person but it can not be related to the profit because it is not possible to evaluate so-called soft values: Estonian-mindedness, better knowledge of Estonian culture, continuous use of the official language by a specific beneficiary. If we try to evaluate the profit within a selected group, a question rises regarding how representative the selected group is, and in turn, the question of the feasibility of spending resources on such appraisals. In this case, in the course of evaluation organized in the framework of SIP it has been found that *all* of the activities that support the continuous existence of an Estonian-language environment are necessary. The question is rather that the so-called person-based approach would require a precise programme in place for each supported non-Estonian: if the action *a* takes place, the action *b* must follow it, etc., until a certain person no longer needs the SIP to live successfully in the multicultural society. In other words, the question is about sustainability. The planning of the activities has only been activity-based, and there has been a lack of an individual approach. If a teacher from Narva can state during an interview that the further activities in Kuressaare will change as a result, then it is clear without counting the money that things cannot go on that way.

In the case of a lack of motivation in integration programmes, it would be difficult to apply a principle common in other fields—give an initial boost from the public sector and the project will start rolling on its own. On the contrary, many expenses have not produced the expected results (for example, the campaigns for language study have not increased language proficiency), many activities have remained non-recurring (the teachers who participated in change programmes have no further activity plan). The number of actual people who benefit from the expenses is unknown (for example in the case of publications, media programmes, the activities of part V) as many activities are directed to everybody. The resources directed to language immersion programmes are explained through the result of language study and knowledge, but the circulation figures by themselves actually give us no information about the achieved effect.

3.3 What are the advantages and shortcomings of the programme and the composition of the activity plans?

An advantage of the programme can be considered the desire to cover all activities concerning integration in order to see the connections between fields and to consolidate them into one framework as the opposite of fragmentation. Monitoring and appraisals have also created a useful background for programming follow-up activities.

Below are listed in detail the shortcomings of the structure of the programme.

3.3.1. The structure is complicated (primary objectives, primary objectives within fields, outputs, sub-objectives, missions, etc.) but the final purpose is unclear.

What is the nature of the multicultural society that we want to reach as a result of successful integration? From several meetings during the mid-term appraisal, one can draw a conclusion that it is not known “where the train of integration should arrive”. As the unifying of the society and maintenance of varieties are in contradiction, the primary objective should be more thoroughly discussed in the media.

3.3.2. The primary objectives and sub-objectives are not in harmony. It is difficult to understand how the sub-objectives belong to the primary objectives.

The fields defined in the primary objectives (marked with letters a, b, c) form a logical structure which would enable to make each field more specific with sub-objectives (forming a branching structure where general topics would have logical connections to more detailed topics). Education, mentioned in the primary objective, appears in three sub-objectives. The education and culture of ethnic minorities is not sufficiently in accordance with the fields of the primary objective. The social competence sub-programme is related to all three primary objectives, however, and for that reason does not further describe the primary objectives but rather condenses them. The term “social competence” is not a good one because there is a lack of clear understanding of what it is. None of the sub-objectives is directly linked to the primary objective of “socio-economic integration” (the omission has been explained by the excessive complexity of managing it but this is untenable and the excessive addition of expenses can only be relevant if the profit is of little importance). It is also unclear why management and evaluation of the programme and the capacity of the institutions are specified as sub-programmes because these items are working organization measures and not further descriptions of primary objectives.

3.3.3. The structure of the sub-programmes is not uniform and not balanced with regard to priority. For example, activities aimed at the juvenile non-Estonians are distributed between three sub-programmes and it complicates achieving the objectives because of different responsible persons.

It is clear that social competence of a person in the process of becoming an adult is obtained through the education. The topic of ethnic minorities is not comparable with the issues in education or social competence. It is questionable whether these topics are on the same level. Naturally one characteristic of multicultural society with integration in both directions is plurality of nationalities, and support and attention to the minorities is continuously necessary. But analysis of the problems forces us to admit that the main stress must be on integration of the Russian minority, 26% of the population³⁶. A very wide field of activities is concentrated under the social

³⁶ According to the 2004 SIP activity report, 26% of Estonian population was formed by Russians.

competence. This provides no answers regarding objectives that further describe the primary objectives, nor does it enable responsible persons to set it in one-to-one conformance with the sub-programme.

3.3.4. In the programme the term *mission* is used in a very different meaning (it is equated with the task) compared to common use in programmes and strategic programmes.

For example the mission **“To promote co-operation between national culture societies and co-operation with the state”** is a classic task. Missions normally concern in summary the idea of the whole programme, its main idea or special significance in the society. In the integration programme, however, there are many missions and they are reflective of groups of activities in the framework of one sub-objective. This great deviation from conventional use serves to initially confuse the reader. This is in contradiction to the desire to make the programme as simple and clear to the public as possible. In addition, the programme was approved in the Ministry together with the missions but a part of them are no longer treated, and at the same time missions have been changed and added without the permission of the government (this is done by the steering committee).

3.3.5. Several objectives are ill-defined (for example the mission “To support linguistic-communicative integration through informing and involving the public”) or in unquantifiable form from the standpoint of measuring performance (To increase the awareness of Estonian society of cultural differences, to expand the possibilities to maintain the linguistic and cultural special character of the minorities and to increase their knowledge of Estonia).

3.3.6. With regard to activities, there prevails a lack of uniformity regarding how detailed a fashion activities are described (for example, the thorough section on media as opposed to the section on social problems).

It is not clearly stated that the socio-economic aspect will remain secondary, although it has turned out that way. There are also certain activities that governmental institutions can themselves implement directly but also ones that are open (e. g. award system for journalists). As the boundaries between missions are unclear, it is difficult to classify the activities according to mission.

3.3.7. With regard to activities, there are no precise terms set. For that reason, in 2000, the terms for each activity were equally set at 2007, but this is not a suitable basis for the planning of the use of resources.

According to the principle of project management, the hierarchy and order of the activities is undetermined. A good example of the consequences of this fact are the omissions in transition to teaching in Estonian in Russian upper secondary schools—elaboration and implementation of the plan for training of teachers and preparation of study materials.

3.3.8. The performance evaluation criteria are quantitative and do not enable qualitative changes to be assessed.

One example is the sub-programme I activity entitled “The developing of the camp and family studies model, its application and related training” where the possible performance indicators have been set as following: the number of the persons who have completed camp and family studies (including the number of pupils in the 1st and 2nd grade in language immersion classes), the manual for the project manager of the language camp, the number of in the language camp auxiliary materials composed by Estonian and other language teachers, and the number of persons who have passed training. The given indicators are numerical results and do not enable to assess the results in improving language knowledge or even an increase in the following of Estonian media.

3.3.9. Summarizing the discussions, interviews and surveys performed in course of the mid-term appraisal, it can be said that many activities were planned, but fewer were performed. Not enough success or attention has been achieved in the main field: learning of and proficiency in the official language.

This view does not mean that other activities are not necessary at all. The question is one of determining the attention and resources. The appraisers are of the opinion that the programmes aimed at adults should have been secondary in comparison with those aimed at youth and children (see the opinion of Katrin Saks about the final appraisal, 3.10, p. 114).

3.4 Are the objectives of the programme covered with the missions and activities stipulated in activity plans, and if so, to what extent?

3.4.1. Linguistic-communicative integration

3.4.1.1. Education

As a sub-programme, “Education” acts in the interests of integration in the formal education system. The problem here clearly lies in implementation of the programme. A clear programme and implementation of such a programme have been lacking in transition to bilingual studies. Right at the beginning of the programme, co-operation should have begun between all Russian teachers and Estonian teachers, organized and coordinated by the Ministry of Education and Research (for example in the form of camps at school vacations); it should not have been left to a voluntary non-profit association. The teacher exchange programme was organized in the framework of the PHARE project in 2002-2003 but according to the pupils’ opinion, it is insufficient. Developing of the study programme has been marked as a positive activity. Despite activities that offer pupils stable contacts with an Estonian-language environment (camps, living in Estonian families, joining the student government, student exchange, study excursions), there are not enough possibilities to communicate in an Estonian-speaking environment, the youth of Ida-Viru County feel (based on the meeting with the youth of Sillamäe).

3.4.1.2. Knowledge of Estonian language

The programmes “Estonian studies for adults” and “Education” as a whole are in accordance with the primary objective. The problem is rather the low speed of Estonian studies and inconsistency in legislation about requirements of the knowledge of the language, and likewise a lack of necessary activities in the programme. Estonian Russians stated in course of the appraisal that the small number of Estonians gives them no motivation to study Estonian. The programme does not reflect organized language studies, which are necessary in the jails and prisons.

3.4.1.3. Changing attitudes in society

The collection “The education and culture of ethnic minorities”, and the sub-objectives of the “Social competence”—“Estonian inhabitants participate actively in developing the civil society” and “The attitudes of Estonians and non-Estonians support achieving the primary objectives of state programmes”—together with the activities, cover the given primary objective. The discussions in the course of the mid-term appraisal pointed out clearly activities that are lacking in the programme:

- 1) making ER’s Russian programme more attractive to young Estonian Russians;
- 2) creation of a bilingual second channel by ETV where study programmes also play an important role;
- 3) regular cooperation with Russian-language media, publishing free publications about relevant changes in the laws concerning non-Estonians and the integration process.

The objections to the costliness of the abovementioned measures can be refuted first by the obligation to direct the necessary information to the inhabitants, second, by the need to take steps towards the formation of a common knowledge field and thereby reduce the desire to emigrate to the West among gifted young Estonian Russians. The reports do mention success in smaller media projects, which can not replace the main project. The public sector also has its role to play in changing attitudes. If governmental institutions set EU projects as priorities in place of unpleasant domestic matters, the attitudes of non-Estonians will not improve.

3.4.2. Legal-political integration

3.4.2.1. Citizenship

Today it is obvious that obtaining Estonian citizenship helps many people to feel more secure in Estonia and that positive attitudes thereby form among non-Estonians. The decrease of the number of stateless persons, related to them becoming Estonian citizens, was clearly underestimated in the first years of the programme. Only one mission of one sub-objective of the “Social competence” sub-programme, together with a couple of activities, reflected this primary objective. Certainly an important factor in the stimulation of growth of the number of citizens was Estonia's accession to the EU.

3.4.2.2. Participation in political structures

This is probably a primary objective whose importance is unclear in comparison with other primary objectives. Only the citizens can be politically active and for that reason the increase of the number of citizens among non-Estonians is important. The purpose is thus largely tantamount to the previous one. The citizens can independently of their ethnic origin choose a party and representative of their liking. Although such a purpose was actually formulated at the creation of the programme, it is not directly reflected by any mission or activity (which is also understandable in light of the above).

3.4.2.3. Loyalty

The comments here are similar to those about the previous primary objective. Loyalty to the state is in large part a consequence of citizenship but also of the changes in attitudes. For that reason, there is nothing to add to the missions and activities set in accordance to the lastmentioned objectives.

3.4.3. Socio-economic integration

3.4.3.1. Participation in Estonian social life

In the programme, this primary objective is covered by the sub-programme “Ethnic minorities” and the missions related to the third sector and youth associations in “Social competence”. Participation in social life is naturally favored by consumption of local media. In the course of the mid-term appraisal, a question was raised about the appropriateness of the given purpose with respect to the urgent and relevant objectives of the programme. The opinion was stated, in the target group and at the meeting with youth associations, that cultural and youth activities could already be taking place on basis of unified national principles and that they should not be under the integration programme (in other words, not with the emphasis on ethnic origin). Developing of the cooperation between youth of different ethnic origin is performed through the communication between ethnic minorities and through obtaining education (including language camps and family visits). Approximately one-half of the respondents mentioned positively that common activities at the local level do not depend on ethnicity.

3.4.3.2. The reduction of regional isolation of non-Estonians

Elimination of the economic measures from the programme, for the reason that they are reflected in other documents, is not in accordance with the general principle to concentrate in the programme all activities that relate to integration. By the same token, it could be stated that the transition to studies partly in Estonian is stipulated in legal acts of education and would need no repetition in integration. It is important not to forget the specifics when elaborating and executing the economic and social policy that derives from national composition. For that reason, similarly to educational questions, it is necessary to discuss these topics on the level of the integration steering committee and government to be able to see the whole (which is formed by the language and education system).

Ida-Viru County needs specific labor market measures and investments which is highly related to the other objectives and activities of the integration and therefore more important in the way of unified programme coordination. It does not mean the reduction of the responsibility of the ministries nor concentrating finances to the SIP but primarily better coordination and more integral treatment of the process.

Naturally this begs the question of how justified it is to treat questions of social welfare separately when all inhabitants are guaranteed to the same possibilities for assistance, and services for Russian speakers are provided by local governments in Russian. According to the survey in the course of the appraisal, less than one-half of respondents found that unemployment and lack of proficiency of the language are related and that proficiency of the language prevents the mobility of the workforce. “The inferiority of the economic and social situation leads to social rifts which can provoke ethnic tensions and separation of the main population and minorities.”³⁷

3.5 Are the missions implemented in the framework of activity plans sustainable? If so, then to what extent?

Here we will only discuss those activities that received critical treatment in the course of the mid-term appraisal before the drafting of this report.

The sustainability of all activities to this point in the educational area in fact questionable, because for example 38% of graduates in Narva know only their native language (IM2005). In other words, the organization of Estonian language studies in Russian schools in Ida-Viru County has not been sufficiently sustainable. The

³⁷ The second report about the fight against racism and intolerance in Estonia (2001).

question is not so much about the organization of the studies but of the integral application of measures supporting language studies. As already stressed in the answer to the question 3.4, in addition to language studies, there must be a real possibility to practice the language. It would be ideal, of course, if the students showed interest themselves, because possibilities do exist.

The same situation is dominant in adult language studies. The survey in the course of estimation demonstrated that persons who have participated in the courses even three or more times forget the language without ever using it. Differently from the pupils whose sustainability of the language use can be increased by educational organizational measures, the Estonian Russians who have left the educational system have their only possible contacts with the official language through the media, work, the activities of the third sector or through the resolving of domestic problems (for example housing associations). There are still a large number of Russian speakers who have none of the abovementioned contacts. So the topic of sustainability is very salient here and confirms the fundamental validity of the programme's orientation to youth. Many of the programme drafters probably do not see it as fitting to reach a situation where the number of Estonian citizens who do not know the Estonian language has increased.

The non-Estonians are also discouraged by the project based approach in the media and in how people are kept informed. The publishing of an important Russian information source, "Istoki" ("Sources" in Estonian, editor Eduard Odinets), turned out to be merely a project. The individual programme series in public broadcasting are only performed while the project lasts, although 30% of the population would require regular and comprehensible information distribution for the creation of a common knowledge field and other media of interest. Professional journalists are not attracted by temporary solutions. They tend to prefer an employer who offers a more stable work environment.

3.6 Are the target groups covered in the framework of missions and activities of the activity plans? If so, to what extent?

The table below takes into account the activities and target groups in the activity plans for 2000-2003. Where necessary, they have been corrected with the addenda made to the activity plans of 2004-2007 as regards activities and target groups.

MISSION	TARGET GROUPS	COMMENTS
Sub-programme I		

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
I. 1. a. Developing language didactics, language instruction methodology and study materials, teacher training	Teaching staff, teachers, including teachers of pre-school child-care institutions and school teachers and heads of school (of both Russian and Estonian schools), the owners of the pre-school child-care institutions	Regarding both children and parents as a target group in activities which require certain skills
	Pupils, including pupils of pre-school child-care institutions and schools, non-Estonian children at pre-school age Parents	

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
<p>I. 1. b</p> <p>Development and implementation of the language immersion programme</p>	<p>Teachers</p> <p>Pupils</p> <p>School administration, including administration at the language immersion schools</p> <p>The teachers and heads of the kindergartens</p> <p>The parents (children of pre-school age and their parents)</p>	

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
I.1.c. Extracurricular language models	<p>Teachers</p> <p>Estonian and non-Estonian speaking children</p> <p>Parents</p> <p>The project managers of language camps and family study</p> <p>Ethnic Estonians</p>	<p>University students are mentioned in the programme but not their activities</p>
I.2.a. The regional in-service training network for teachers of Estonian as a second language	<p>Teachers teaching in Estonian</p> <p>Teachers teaching Estonian as a second language, teachers of Estonian as mother tongue</p> <p>Teachers participating in the network</p> <p>Students of corresponding specialties</p> <p>Pupils</p> <p>Children learning Estonian as a second language</p>	

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
I.2.b. In-service training in Estonian language instruction for teachers of other subjects and other training.	<p>Estonian teachers of the vocational educational institutions</p> <p>Teachers of general education schools teaching in Estonian</p> <p>Teachers, including teachers of Estonian and of other languages, teachers of pre-school childcare institutions</p> <p>School heads</p>	The subject teachers of the vocational educational institutions are not mentioned, for the formulation of the activity there should not be only Estonian language teachers involved

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
I.2.c. Re-training of teachers, in-service training for working teachers	Pedagogues of Russian and Estonian speaking schools Teachers who have obtained vocational education outside Estonia Teachers, including class teachers Special education teachers Specialized schools Students	University students are not a big help here, for they may not participate in in-service training
	Pupils from various origins learning in Estonian speaking schools and their parents	
I.3.a. Planning of measures in schools' development plans, syllabuses, training	Pupils of non-Estonian speaking schools Teachers of non-Estonian speaking schools	Pupils are here inappropriate to mention, school heads and local government are lacking

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
I.3.b. Cooperation between Estonian- and Russian-language schools in developing study programmes	<p>The administration of non-Estonian speaking schools</p> <p>Training working groups, other training providers</p> <p>Pupils of 1st grade of Russian speaking schools</p> <p>Teachers</p> <p>Training network teams, network team</p> <p>Schools</p>	Schools are redundant to mention, pupils inappropriate
I.3.c. Intensified instruction of Estonian as a second language	<p>Teachers of non-Estonian speaking schools</p> <p>Students</p> <p>Pupils of non-Estonian speaking schools</p> <p>Pupils of the 1st class of Russian speaking schools</p>	The role of university students is ill-defined

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
I.3.d. Study materials supporting Estonian-language subject instruction and acquisition of Estonian	<p>Teachers of non-Estonian speaking schools</p> <p>Pupils of non-Estonian speaking schools</p> <p>Schools</p>	
I.4. To develop linguistic-cultural cooperation between Estonian- and Russian-language schools, so that students' language proficiency would improve and tolerance of other cultures would develop.	<p>Pedagogical personnel working for Estonian and Russian speaking schools</p> <p>Pupils of Russian and Estonian speaking schools</p>	The cooperation between schools can also be initiated by self-governing institutions
I.5.a. Concept of civic education, concept of the multicultural school, material for such a school	<p>Pupils</p> <p>Teachers</p> <p>Hobby instructors</p>	It would be necessary to communicate with Russian intellectuals

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
I.5.b. Training on the topics of citizens and the multicultural school, informing and consulting	Pupils Teachers Hobby instructors Non-Estonian youth Parents Youth workers Language didacticians School heads	The training should be performed directly through pupils, not abstractly through youth
Sub-programme II		
II.1. To raise the awareness of Estonian society of cultural differences, to broaden the opportunities of ethnic minorities in preserving their specific linguistic and cultural character and to increase their knowledge of Estonia.	Estonian population Ethnic minorities Pupils Non-Estonian population, particularly in Ida-Viru County	

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
<p>II.2. To support the preservation of the language and culture of ethnic minorities through the activity of national cultural societies, artistic collectives and Sunday schools.</p>	<p>Sunday schools</p> <p>Teachers and pupils of Sunday schools</p> <p>Cultural self-governments of the minorities</p> <p>The founders and mother tongue teachers of national cultural associations and Sunday schools</p> <p>Participants of national cultural associations and art collectives</p>	
<p>II.3. To promote cooperation among national cultural societies and cooperation with the state.</p>	<p>The members of the Presidential Roundtable</p> <p>Experts</p> <p>Governmental institutions</p>	<p>Governmental institutions are on the list but inactive in their activities</p>
<p>II.4. To support the activity of new national-language basic schools.</p>	<p>Ethnic minorities</p>	
<p>Sub-programme III</p>		

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
<p>III.1. To develop the Estonian language proficiency testing system and related consultation with the aim of ensuring greater reliability of the proficiency testing and a positive effect on study of Estonian as a second language.</p>	<p>Teachers and learners of Estonian language</p>	<p>It is a positive sign that target groups are focused</p>

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
<p>III.2. To create the foundation for linguistic-communicative integration for adult non-Estonians in the form of availability of quality Estonian language instruction.</p>	<p>Learners of Estonian language</p> <p>Teachers, including the Estonian teachers of adults</p>	
<p>III.3. To expand the opportunities for adult speakers of languages other than Estonian to learn Estonian in order to ensure Estonian language proficiency on the level necessary for everyday and professional interaction.</p>	<p>Learners of Estonian language</p> <p>Teacher of vocational educational institutions and members of local governments in Estonian speaking regions and in Ida-Viru County</p> <p>Teachers</p> <p>Police officials</p> <p>Adult non-Estonians</p>	<p>Here should be separately mentioned prisoners, prison watchers, unemployed and persons seeking work</p>
<p>III.4. To support linguistic-communicative integration of non-Estonians through involving and informing the public.</p>	<p>Public: media companies</p>	<p>A deficient formulation of the task does not enable to determine the target groups</p>

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
<p>III.5. To analyze the development of the linguistic relations and socio-cultural competence of various groups of people in various walks of life and on this basis, to develop measures for the acceleration of the formation of Estonian as a lingua franca and the development of multilingualism.</p>	<p>Estonian population, companies of language studies, composers of study programmes and subject syllabuses</p>	<p>The analysis should be performed by universities together with non-Estonian specialists and the results of the analysis are aimed at governmental institutions and organs who are decisive for the questions of integration</p>
Sub-programme IV		
MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
<p>IV.1. To develop cooperation related to the integration of non-Estonians between the third sector and state institutions.</p>	<p>Estonians Non-Estonians Members of non-profit associations</p>	<p>The first two are undetermined, governmental institutions are lacking</p>

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
<p>IV.2. To support continuity of the development of youth associations and student governments in order to ensure more opportunities for joint activity for young speakers of other languages and shape their social competence.</p>	<p>Non-Estonian youth</p> <p>Students, including non-Estonian students</p> <p>Members of student self-governments</p> <p>Non-organized young at age 15-25</p> <p>Members of management bodies and project managers of the youth associations</p> <p>Workers of the youth centers</p> <p>Managements of educational institutions</p> <p>Education and Research Ministry, Hobby and Daily Centers</p> <p>Hobby instructors</p> <p>Wider public</p>	<p>Only those can be supported who have taken an initiative, i.e. organized while supporting them gives a good motivation to the non-organized young</p>

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
<p>IV.3. To elaborate more diversely the integration topic in both the Estonian- and Russian-language media; to establish and to extend the common part of both the Estonian- and Russian-language media system; to increase the interactivity of Russian-language media; to improve the availability and quality of institutional and utilitarian information in Russian language in the media for the purpose of promoting the social participation of the Russian-speaking population</p>	<p>Media workers Estonian and non-Estonian audience Non-Estonian audience</p>	<p>Also managements of Ministry of Culture, Broadcasting Council, ETV and ER should be particularly specified</p>

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
<p>IV.4. To increase the number of media and information professionals among non-Estonian youth; to raise a new generation of non-Estonians with new, regular media consumption habits and the skills to orient in the information society</p>	<p>Pupils, including youth studying in non-Estonian speaking schools</p>	<p>It is a positive sign that target groups are focused</p>
<p>IV.5. To intensify the communication between Estonians and non-Estonians; to establish and to develop the dialogue between cultures.</p>	<p>Estonian and Russian speaking audience Estonian and Russian speaking population</p>	<p>Vague formulation of the tasks complicates defining the target groups</p>
<p>IV.6. To support the legal-political integration of non-Estonians</p>	<p>Persons with non-identified nationality, particularly youth Persons preparing the exam of knowledge of the Constitution and Nationality Law</p>	<p>Public sector and also the parties could here be initiators instead of the citizens</p>

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
<p>IV.7. To improve the vocational Estonian language knowledge of the non-Estonian unemployed and employees in combination with the knowledge of the official language that enables them successfully to integrate in labor market</p>	<p>Non-Estonian speaking unemployed and employees, training institutions, participating companies and institutions</p>	

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
<p>IV.8. To create non-Estonian youth and adults possibilities taking in account their social, ethnic and linguistic peculiarities that reduce their participation in social risk groups, including drug abuse, HIV/AIDS, criminality, unemployment</p>	<p>Non-Estonian persons of social risk groups (drug abuse, HIV/AIDS, criminality)</p>	<p>Also Ministry of Social affairs should be involved</p>
<p>Sub-programme V</p>		
<p>V.1. To organize the management and evaluation of the IF's sphere of responsibility of the state programme, in order to guarantee the development, efficient application and the achievement of the primary objectives of the programme</p>	<p>Steering committee of the SIP PHARE 2003, Multi 2, the personnel of Multi 2 and IF, EU Accession Facility</p>	<p>There are lacking the scientists who would analyze and give recommendations</p>

MISSION	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
<p>V.2. To organize the management and evaluation of the MER's sphere of the responsibility of the programme in order to guarantee the development, efficient application and the achieving of the primary objectives of the programme</p>	<p>Performers of the programme</p> <p>Personnel of PHARE 1, PHARE 2, Multi 1, Multi 2 and IF</p> <p>Participants in projects</p>	<p>It is a positive sign that target groups are focused</p>
<p>V.3. To increase the capacity of the institutions related to the integration, also improve the availability of institutional-utitarian information in Russian and to improve its quality in institutions.</p>	<p>The employees of IF</p> <p>The employees of ministries and public departments</p>	<p>It should separately be mentioned that the government must pay more attention to Ministry of Social Affairs, Ministry of the Interior, Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications, Ministry of Culture and Ministry of Justice in the view of integration</p>

In selecting target groups, one must take in consideration only relevant target groups and limit the length of the list to what is essential. The primary objective is to reach the target groups. It is at the same time practical to define the target groups more specifically and not to direct the activities to the public (which naturally accompanies use of the media). In the programme the pupils are specified as a target group even when they can only use the obtained knowledge in their later course of studies. If the

activity is studying, the main target group could be pupils. If the activity is achieving better study organization, they are not mentioned as a target group.

It is positive that before starting any activity, there is an attempt to specify the exact target group, and corrections are made while the programme is under way.

3.7 Has the hedging of risks in programmes and activity plans been successful? If so, to what extent?

3.7.1. The influence of interstate relations

The highest risk factor affecting the entire integration process are relations between Estonia and Russia. On the basis of IM2005, 20-25% of Estonian Russians identify both Estonia and Russia as their home countries. Persons identifying themselves with Russia have a dominantly negative view of the efforts of the Estonian state which derives from the official views of Russia. In this light, one of the security risks of the programme is the eruption of ethnic conflicts which would paralyze a calm integration process.

The war in Iraq (actions near the American Embassy in 2003) and the celebration of the events of the 9th of May (2005) demonstrated how high a risk is involved when two interpretations of history with too big a discrepancy exist side by side. According to a study organized by BNS/Faktum in July 2005, more than one-half of non-Estonian respondents found their lives were better during the Soviet period than nowadays. In other words, it is difficult to offer possibilities to assimilate in Estonian society for those who did not come to Estonia voluntarily and who still regard the previous social order, which was forced on Estonians, as being better.

3.7.2. The risk of emigration and influence

The necessary attention has not been paid to the risk from the emigration to the West of successful and gifted Estonian Russians. If those who stay behind have no examples who are loyal to the Estonian state in their own communities, they can be easily influenced by hostile forces. One can draw a conclusion that underestimating the socio-economic problems in Ida-Viru County or failure to inform the Russian-speaking population of important developments means a considerable unneutralized risk.

3.7.3. The risks assumed in compiling the programme

The purpose of the SIP document is to provide a direction and primary instructions for the activity plans mainly for state institutions and local governments. The SIP document mentions potential risks that have to be avoided in **managing and coordinating the state programme**. Yet no attention is paid to general processes that influence the integration process as a whole (the abovementioned examples).

The main risks concerning managing and coordinating are listed as the following:

1) the integration process lacks scientific management (which requires regular feedback and analysis) and verification, due to which the integration as a term can turn into a phrase devoid of content, a process that is in turn accompanied by disregard for scientific views, ill-defined statement of purpose and avoidance measuring performance.

On the basis of the interviews with the focus groups, one can conclude that the first risk has become a reality, for integration as such has become a phrase which is not used in a positive context. Although a negative attitude to the term does not necessarily signify an absence of purpose, this tendency is detrimental with regard to the main title of the programme. For non-Estonians, the purpose of the integration programme is vague. There is no clarity as to why and for whom the given document was created. According to the document, integration is a two-way process, but common people perceive it as a one-way process (similar to assimilation).

Measurement of performance is also questionable. The indicators mentioned in the activity plans only evaluate particular quantitative results, but it remains an open question whether the achieved results have contributed to the qualitative performance. The indicators are indeed reported in SIP reports, in the chapters entitled “Attitudes” and “Major developments” but all indicators are not reported in the reports every year, and the main problem is that several quantitative indicators do not measure qualitative performance with regard to progress towards the sub-objectives of the SIP.

It is also unclear who should take responsibility for staving off this risk. Should it be the steering committee? The interviews with the members of the steering committee demonstrate that the steering committee has not discussed the risks or assessment of

the risks concerning the programme. So, one can assume that, if at all, the appraisal and management of risks related to the integration programme are dealt with by the programme implementers.

2) Insufficient or irregular financing, lack of consideration of expedience or performance in financing.

The programme has been financed from both the state budget and foreign resources. Interviews with IF employees showed that financing was not regarded as a source of a relevant risk. As a rule, all planned activities have received funding. The question involves evaluating the performance in making decisions on financing because there are no indicators for performance or influence. The use of existing indicators is also irregular. Considerable time and money is spent on monitoring and reports, but since there is no serious analysis nor drawing of conclusions by the decision-making institutions (foundation supervisory board, steering committee, office of the Minister for Population Affairs), financing is mainly decided according to the activity plan and the possibility of involving foreign aid, not according to performance. Since the objectives are numerous and they all need to be financed, there have not been enough finances to cover the primary objectives to the necessary extent.

3) A low capacity for action of the responsible governmental institutions and other partners (county governments, local governments, institutions and organizations of the third sector, etc.) in both preparing and executing individual sub-programmes of the state programme and organizing cooperation among themselves.

The question concerns whether the capacity of the partners has been evaluated in the programme. The State Audit Office recently performed an audit of the Integration Foundation. The capability and administrative capacity of the other partners have not been evaluated based on their roles and assumed responsibility in the programme. Although several responsible parties are registered in the programme, the programme is led by the MER. The other parties (Ministry of Social Affairs, Ministry of Culture, Ministry of the Interior, Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications) must not distance themselves from the field of integration.

The programme does not mention potential risks of achieving the primary objectives or sub-objectives. Nor it has been analyzed which factors provoke potential risks, what are the possibilities of hedging the risks and in which institution's sphere of the responsibility should identified risks be hedged (together with particular activity plans).

The principles of risk management assume the existence of a strong management structure, but the original idea was to compose a strong and detailed programme which would not need a constantly functioning steering committee.³⁸ The steering committee has so far not dealt with risk management. The interviews with its members demonstrate that the topic of the risk management in the programme has not been discussed. The risks were even not discussed in 2003 when new activity plans for the period of 2004-2007 started to be compiled.

Integration is a long-term process. The influence of the activities today can only be evaluated years from now. The performance of the programme can be increased by systematic (for example one-year) identification and evaluation of potential risks. Pursuant to a government regulation, the steering committee has a right to convoke expert commissions. The evaluation and analysis of the potential risks could be the task of such an expert commission.

The programme should also cover recommendations providing direction for identifying the potential risks and elaborating the principles of how they are to be hedged. Risk management as an activity should remain in the competence of each institution itself. The purpose would be to draw attention of the programme implementers to the potential risks and the necessity of hedging them.

3.7.4. Summary of existing risks

In the view of the programme as a whole, the appraisers feel the following risks should be mentioned in generalized form:

- Integration as a process has a poor reputation in society (mainly among non-Estonians).
- The guarantee of political support, i.e. position of the programme as a priority of the government.

³⁸ The steering committee assembles 3-4 times per year.

- Insufficiency of the financial means of realizing the planned activities of the programme.
- Technical quality is insufficient. Can the existence of the experts in the necessary fields be guaranteed?
- Not all of the important target groups are involved in the programme and/or nonessential target groups have been involved in the programme.
- The activities on the list of guidance activities do not support achievement of the primary objectives of the programme.
- The objectives of the programme are full of generalities, there are no specifications.
- The activities listed in the activity plans are duplicated by the development plans composed by the ministries. There is no coordination process with people in the integration field.
- Important parties--the ministries--have distanced themselves from the programme. They do not perceive integration as their sphere of responsibility.
- Legal acts passed do not support the real needs of the integration process. The analysis of politics has not been sufficiently performed.
- A part of the objectives of the integration programme increase the risk of dealing with activities which have little importance and do not yield results.
- Analytical security is absent and the risk management is weak.

3.8 Have management and coordination of the programme and activity plans been successful? If so, to what extent?

Steering committee of the programme

According to the government order from 14 November 2000 establishing the steering committee for the state programme “Integration in Estonian Society 2000-2007” in the capacity of an expert committee [last modified by order number 321, 27 May 2005 (RTL 2005, 61, 897)] the members of the steering committee are:

Paul-Erik Rummo – Minister for Population Affairs, chairman of the steering committee

Members of the steering committee:

Mailis Reps - Minister of Education and Research;

Ruth Annus – head of the foreign nationals department at the Ministry of the Interior;

Mati Luik – director of the Integration Foundation (until 26 Sep 2005);

Reet Mikkel - deputy secretary general of the Ministry of Culture;

Kadri Reinthal - head of the foreign financing department of the Ministry of Finance;

Maarja Saks – chief specialist of the labor market department of the Ministry of Social Affairs;

Silver Tammik – chief specialist of the division of the economic development department of the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications;

Raivo Vetik – director of the Institute of International and Social Studies.

The purpose of the steering committee

According to the clause 3 in the abovementioned order, the task of the steering committee is to manage the state programme, to monitor the expedience of its implementation and its performance, and to make corrections if necessary.

According to clause 4, the chairman of the steering committee of the state programme shall present a report on implementation of the state programme in the last year to the government by 30 June every year.

The administration of the steering committee

The steering committee meets 3-4 times per year (once per quarter). The frequency of meetings is not directly regulated. Going by interviews, meetings are called when necessary, i.e. when an important field or subject is under discussion (e. g. confirming new activity plans, new integration programme, etc.).

According to clause 6 of the abovementioned order, the office of the Minister for Population Affairs must guarantee the administration, servicing and financing of the steering committee of the programme.

The steering committee has the right:

- 1) to get necessary documents and appropriate information from the state government and local governments for their work;

- 2) to establish expert groups and work groups;
- 3) to make proposals about the activities and financing the programme to the relevant governmental institutions.

Interviewees did not make any relevant comments regarding the informativeness of the materials presented at the meetings by the steering committee. The level of detailedness of the presented materials did raise some questions. Some representatives of the ministries are not specialists in the field of integration and do not play an important role in the ministry because of their positions, and so the decisions of the steering committee are not realized efficiently in their area of government. The risk is that skills and knowledge are insufficient to evaluate the level of the informativeness of the materials. In course of the interview, doubts were expressed as to whether members are able to familiarize themselves sufficiently with the materials and whether the materials are forwarded to the appropriate officials on whom implementation depends. For that reason, the Ministry's attitude is a bit "lukewarm" toward the integration problems.

Interviews revealed that the members of the steering committee are not aware of the purpose or precise role of the steering committee in managing the programme. To the question whether they base their work on rules and regulation, the most common answer is that they have not seen such a document. The role of the steering committee in managing the programme is provided in the government order.

The members of the steering committee made a proposal that the role and activities of the steering committee in managing the programme be elucidated. The need for this was felt most keenly by members who have joined the steering committee more recently. Although the purpose of the steering committee is to coordinate the state programme, members of the committee feel that the steering committee has until recently remained a place for exchanging ideas. At the same time, the programme has been composed in detailed enough a form and therefore originally there was no need for a strong central management body but rather a supervisory and analytical body. A positive aspect of the strong and detailed programme is that the programme has been relatively resistant to changes in the cabinet of ministers, which in turn has been accompanied by a more comfortable and easier organization of the work of the steering committee.

The members of the steering committee are not informed on a current basis about changes in the membership of the steering committee. The steering committee does not confirm at meetings the minutes of the previous meeting, nor are the minutes sent to members immediately after the meeting. This function should remain the task of the unit serving the steering committee.

The integration programme originally provided the following regarding the membership of the steering committee: “The members of the steering committee are the representatives of the institutions responsible for the sub-programmes. The steering committee’s decisions relating to implementation and correction of sub-programmes shall be prepared by the institutions responsible for the sub-programmes, establishing expert groups for this purpose where necessary.”

At the moment the representatives of the ministries listed in the state programme (Ministry of Education and Research, Ministry of Social Affairs, Ministry of Culture, Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications and Ministry of the Interior) and of implementing authorities (Integration Foundation) all belong to the steering committee, as does a representative of the Institute of International and Social Studies, whose main task in the steering committee is to provide information about the course of integration in society. One of the main problems of involving the ministries was, and still is, explaining their role in the integration process. Ministry of Education and Research had a leading role. The main problem is guaranteeing the interest of other ministries. There is no generally agreed-upon mechanism how, for example, the head of a department would participate in the meeting of the steering committee at least with the powers of a secretary general in decisive questions, or how an adopted decision would become binding for the participating ministry. Integration is a continuous process and participating in it should be among the obligations of ministries related to programme fields.

In the first years of the programme, the steering committee was an administrative organ. In order to make management more efficient, and also to create inclusion, the inclusion of third sector and target groups as permanent should be considered-- Estonian Russians contribute additional information to the discussions and help to increase the legitimacy of the decisions. A similar proposal was presented in 2002 in

the report *Minority Protection in Estonia*³⁹ composed in the framework of the EU accession process. The same report cites the necessity of cooperation with local governments in order to guarantee more efficient realization of the objectives and to develop better cooperation with target groups on the regional level.

The members of the steering committee also posed the following questions:

a) does important information always get conveyed to persons who are authorized to make decisions?

b) should there be a level of top officials in the steering committee who in daily work would be involved in particular decision-making processes?

The question mark is on coordination of documents composed in different ministries with the office of the Minister for Population Affairs and eliciting opinions from the IF. Both institutions stand outside the process at the moment and, in discussing labor problems, for example, governmental institutions do not devote enough consideration to the specifics of Ida-Viru County's ethnic character.

Managing the programme has been appropriate (meetings, summaries of activity reports, etc) but the efficiency of the management can still be improved on the basis of the above.

3.9 Have monitoring and reporting on programme implementation been successful? If so, to what extent?

To perform this mid-term appraisal, we obtained the reports “The application of the state programme “Integration in Estonian society 2000-2007” presented to the Government of the Republic in 2000-2004, and all other more important reports, summaries and monitoring.

According to clause 4 of the government order, the chairman of the steering committee of the state programme must present a report on execution of the state programme in the past year by 30 June every year. In addition, IF issues a yearbook on its activities.

The real necessity would be to organize integration monitoring every two years. The reality is different. Before the 2005 monitoring, the last one was in 2002. Such instability indicates the underestimation of the analytical component of the

³⁹ Minority protection in Estonia – An assessment of the Programme Integration in Estonian Society 2000-2007, 2002, p.203.

integration. The purpose of monitoring is to give an appraisal to the influence of the integration programme in the society.

The biggest shortcoming in the field of reporting and monitoring is weak analytical support – analysis of the effects of various policies. Apart from covering media and attitudes, monitoring should also take into account socio-economic indicators influencing integration and international experience (particularly the influence of the EU).

Activity plans for 2000-2003 were provided with performance indicators. The real changes are difficult to measure, for we cannot know the benefit of the number of information materials or events, the number of people participating in studies, the volume of information in the press, etc. Other performance criteria included such indicators as the satisfaction levels among the non-profit associations, quality of information or the participation of contests, which are themselves impossible to measure. It is obvious that it was not sensible to continue to use such indicators. The need to formulate the objectives more specifically and to measure performance are still present.

It would be necessary to study more broadly the appropriate guidelines and rules of the EU and the integration experience of other countries. In particular, we should mention the international experience and recommended indicators for Estonia contained in the *European Integration Handbook* (completed in 2004).

The guide “Local government-level measures and indicators for integration of the non-Estonian population” by L. Kasemets and Ü. Kurvits (2005), draws the following conclusions:

- indicators reflecting the development of integration are presented indistinct from indicators on performance or course of the activities;
- there is no agreement as to who should observe the indicators and collect necessary data, and in what way;
- the indicators are too numerous and the list does not make clear which are more important (about 5 indicators are listed per objective of which there are around 100).

3.10 What are the strong and weak points of the financing of the programme and activity plans?

The programme's main focus is on financial means. The detailed nature of the activity plans has also helped the programme to resist political government changes.

The programme contains activities for which there are no financial means.

The State Audit Office audited the performance of the state programme “Integration in Estonian Society 2000-2007” and utilization of the finances within the constraints of the sample in 2004. The audited institutions were the office of the Minister for Population Affairs, the Ministry of Culture and the IF, which is in the area of government of the Ministry of the Interior.

IF received support for specific objectives totaling 45.7 million kroons, including 8 million kroons from the state budget. In the course of auditing, it appeared that the disbursement of support in the IF and Ministry of Culture was well organized. The absence of criteria for subsidizing the cultural societies, pointed up by the State Audit Office, had unfortunately not yet been resolved in summer 2005—the office of the Minister for Population Affairs had assigned the task to the IF alone. Activity plans for sub-programmes were completed at the IF and the office of the Minister for Population Affairs. On the basis of these, the rules and system of oversight for organizing project contests and disbursement of support were elaborated. The measures to avoid the risks involved in financing the projects were successful. The number of applications refused by the IF was noteworthy (approximately one-third) but the audit found that the refusals were justified. The IF had an overview of the utilization of the finances allocated to the projects. The reporting about the utilization of the finances was successful. The State Audit Office marked critically that there are no official procedures for allocation of support to the cultural associations.

In the years the programme was in operation, the real expenses remained below what was planned according to the budget. The big proportion of foreign aid is a main source of instability because if an application is not satisfied, then co-financing by Estonia also loses its point. For example, in 2004, the state budget means were approximately 6.7 million kroons and foreign aid was 4.7 million kroons less than planned. Although it is very difficult to draw a line between the daily tasks of local

governments and integration measures, it is obvious that, particularly in Russian-speaking regions, local governments' part of the budget is noteworthy.

During the period of 2000-2004, the total expenses of the programme were 267,681,387 kroons. 51% of this amount was spent on the education sub-programme, 9% on ethnic minorities, 16% on the language studies of the adults, 10% on the social competence and 15% on management, appraisal and increase of capacity. The answers provided to the second question demonstrates expressively the ratio of expenses for the mission to the sub-programme and to the total expense--the funds are fragmented for secondary activities.

The following conclusions can be drawn:

- 1) More than one-half of the means are spent on the education system, including without a clear activity plan for the transition to bilingual studies (only in May 2005 did the Minister of Education and Research promise to make a more detailed programme);
- 2) If the real means remain insufficient in comparison with what was planned in the budget, there will be a necessity to specify priorities without which the process cannot be continued;
- 3) Although the appraisal of performance has not been as qualitative or analytical as expected or sufficiently budgeted, a larger amount than expected has been spent on the appraisal together with management and coordination (40,152,208 kroons) than on two sub-programmes (24,091,325 and 26,768,139 kroons);
- 4) Although the adult language studies instruction is the second financing priority, positive changes in their language knowledge have not been seen, according to IM2005.

The appraisal of the programme

With regard to implementation of the programme, **good work has been done** within the limits of the resources used in the sense of initiating and coordination of the projects, involving foreign aid, combining know-how, creating competence centers and the activity of implementing institutions. As shown by the IM2005, several indicators have improved.

Katrin Saks, Minister for Population Affairs when the SIP was created, summarizes developments to date as follows:

“What is good is that, compared to Latvia, for example, our programme was created with relatively little effort. It was easier to reach consensus. It is positive that there was exceptionally good cooperation with social scientists and an attempt was made to achieve two objectives which appear at first glance to be incompatible: to integrate non-Estonians with the Estonian cultural space and simultaneously to offer them support in preserving their culture and language. The most important is precisely the finding of a balance. It is also positive that the integration is not regarded as a unilateral process and that Estonians are seen as having a clear role. There is an attempt to create a working structure, and at least in the initial stage there was very good cooperation between different ministries. Another positive sign is the contribution of foreign aid and from the state, increasing every year. A very large amount of foreign funding forced us to build up an efficient system in the form of the foundation.

Now, the problems. The main problem is not that anything has been done incorrectly. Rather not enough has been done compared to the real needs. Action should have been taken faster and more should have been achieved, even though this is complicated due to the shortage of human resources alone. A few things could have been done differently if we had been as smart initially as we are now, if it had been possible to react more flexibly. All the foreign funding had to be agreed upon long in advance and it was almost impossible to change how it was to be used. For example, we could have compensated 100% instead of 50% of the costs of people who took language exams successfully. We would have won a lot politically. In principle, we should have concentrated more on children, especially kindergarteners. That should have been the start. It would have been the most efficient method, but we spent enormous amounts in the 1990s teaching those who actually did not want to learn. A very serious problem is that the programme has not efficiently contributed to the reform of Russian upper secondary schools. However, this is the fault of the Ministry of Education and Research; they have not been able to prepare for it, but it should have been set as a priority.

Hopefully the wishes for the future can be discerned in the list of problems.”

The appraisal of fulfillment of the sub-programmes by the year 2005 resulting from the desired sub-objective set for 2007 in the SIP, summarized in all of the above report, is based on the following 4-point scale:

Excellent – the sub-programme has as of the mid-term appraisal achieved the results necessary to achieve the objectives by 2007; the performance is efficacious.

Good – the sub-programme has as of the mid-term appraisal achieved most of the results necessary to achieve objectives by 2007; the performance is taking place at a sufficient speed.

Satisfactory - the sub-programme has at the moment of mid-term appraisal achieved some of the results to necessary achieve objectives by 2007; the performance is taking place at insufficient speed.

Failed - the sub-programme has at the moment of mid-term appraisal has not achieved the results necessary to achieve the objectives by 2007; the performance is ineffective.

SUB-PROGRAMME	APPRAISAL
Education	Satisfactory
Ethnic minorities	Good
Adult language instruction	Satisfactory
Social competence	Satisfactory
INTEGRATION PROGRAMME (overall)	Satisfactory

Recommendations for future steps

The main recommendation of the appraisers for the future is to concentrate on three fields which we feel are the most important:

- **the transition of Russian schools to bilingual studies;**
- **the creation of the common knowledge field and**
- **achieving greater institutional involvement in programme implementation.**

We also recommend that:

- 1) the whole programme be renewed on the government level before 2007 on the basis of experience gained from the rapid changes in society, focusing on the most important and specifying particular and measurable objectives.

2) Considering the unmet expectations in the society at large as well as among non-Estonians, it would be expedient to take further action regarding the following sub-programmes (5) and tasks (10):

- Transition to the bilingual studies (acquiring the official language, teaching other subjects in Estonian);
- Common knowledge field (the role of public broadcasting, Russian-language information bulletins);
- Integration of adults (language studies, increase of the number of Estonian citizens);
- Employment in Ida-Viru County (labor market measures, investment assistance);
- Ethnic minorities (support for cultural activities and studies in the minorities' mother tongues).

In harmony with these recommendations, a proposal of the appraisers is also provided concerning a new structure for the integration programme (see appendix 5. Proposals for the new structure of the programme).

3) To measure of the performance of the sub-programmes mentioned in sub-item 2, the following indicators could be used (measuring the activities separately will no longer be necessary). The following list is not necessarily complete.

- Transition to the bilingual studies – the average result of the Estonian language examination in basic schools, upper secondary schools and vocational education institutions, the number of citizenship applicants among juveniles and upper secondary school graduates, the proportion of unemployment of non-Estonians age 24 and under, non-Estonians in Estonian upper secondary schools or vocational educational institutions;
- Common knowledge field – the results of the monitoring: non-Estonians who follow ETV, ER, read the local Estonian press, follow the local media, read Estonian-created publications in Russian;
- Integration of the adults – the number of persons who passed the language test, the increase of the citizens through naturalization, the reduction of the number of illegals (undocumented persons), the reduction of officials not meeting the language requirements, the unemployment level among released prisoners;
- Employment in Ida-Viru County – the non-Estonian unemployed, persons seeking work, persons knowing Estonian at least on an intermediate level, average income;

- Ethnic minorities – the number of culturally autonomous nationalities, the proportion of national cultural associations and minorities living in Estonia, possibilities of obtaining an education in the mother tongue.

In the course of renewal of the SIP, we recommend to elaborate such activity plans that enable to improve all of the abovementioned indicators. If these indicators do not improve, there is no point in approving the annual reports that describe the publications, events or any other quantitative activity.

- 4) To direct the whole attention of the government to the success of the school reform. To staff the necessary number of officials at the Ministry of Education and Research, in Harju County and Ida-Viru County, to compose a specified programme of the needs of teachers and teaching materials and achievements and to provide the programme with the necessary state budget resources. The preparation of the teachers of other subjects is of critical importance. The events of Latvia must be avoided and rapid action has to be taken.
- 5) Unsustainable activities must not be planned. An inevitable condition for approval of any project should be indicating the follow-up activities for particular beneficiaries. For activities that are continuously necessary, the project-based approach should be replaced by constant support.
- 6) To involve more non-Estonians in the renewal of the programme, expert commissions, adapting of the study programme and interpretation of the results of the monitoring. They should be elected by non-Estonian umbrella organizations. If non-Estonians perceive that their important and reliable representatives are involved in leading positions of the programme and its sub-items, their attitude to the programme and integration as a whole will improve. Such activity would also contribute to the purpose of reducing emigration of gifted non-Estonians.
- 7) To improve the realization of the programme with regular discussions in the cabinet of ministers in order to achieve a better involvement of the responsible ministers and determination of the responsible persons in ministries and their inclusion in the steering committee. As long as the existence of the Minister for Population Affairs is regarded as necessary, non-political jobs for analysts should be created in the office of that minister in order to guarantee continuity in case there is a change of government.
- 8) To also involve prisoners in target groups. Their prison sentences can include modern measures for joint Estonian language and professional instruction.

9) To increase the role of universities and other research institutions in the analysis of integration performance. To reduce the preparation of reports containing impractical activity indicators. To increase management performance-based programme management with feedback, i.e. to make more corrections in planned activities which are based on previous performance indicators. Apart from observing the media and attitudes, studies must be ordered for the transformation of social, economic and psychological processes and policy and its performance. This delicate topic requires decisions that are based on analysis.

APPENDIX 1. Timetable of focus groups, interviews and surveys

Table 1. Interviews

Nr.	Representative of the interviewed organization	Date of interview
1	Ljubov Abramova Muhu Kindergarten, director	25.08.2005
2	Aleksander Dušman Roundtable of the Minorities of Ida-Viru County	25.05.2005
3	Jevgeni Golikov Ministry of the Interior, Adviser of the Minister for Regional Affairs	01.06.2005
4	Merle Haruoja Institute of Human Rights	23.05.2005
5	Mati Heidmets Tallinn University	20.05.2005
6	Katrin Hõövelson Ministry of Social Affairs	10.05.2005
7	Madis Järv Ministry of Culture	24.05.2005
8	Marko Kaldur A youth from Ida-Viru County	19.05.2005
9	Reet Kaldur Youth worker from Jõhvi	17.06.2005
10	Svetlana Selentsova Academic director and language immersion coordinator of Karjamaa Upper secondary school	25.08.2005
11	Oleg Karpikov Estonian-Russian Chamber of commerce	04.07.2005
12	Laura Kikas Ministry of Justice, adviser of prison department	25.07.2005

Nr.	Representative of the interviewed organization	Date of interview
13	Vira Konyk Ukrainian society, chairwoman and 2 members	19.09.2005
14	Jevgeni Krištafovits Youth association Avatud Vabariik (Open Republic)	10.05.2005

Nr.	Representative of the interviewed organization	Date of interview
------------	---	--------------------------

15	Kaja Kuivjõgi Ministry of Social Affairs	16.06.2005
16	Lidia Kõlvart Union of National Cultural Associations “Lüüra”	18.05.2005
17	Liis Kängsepp and two club members NGO Media Club of the Youth	28.07.2005
18	Irene Käosaar Language immersion Centre of IF	18.05.2005
19	Cilja Laud Estonian-Jewish Community, chairwoman	22.09.2005
20	Marju Lauristin Faculty of social studies of Tartu University	Presented a written opinion 27.05.05
21	Liina Lust Ministry of Justice	11.05.2005
22	Nonna Meltsas Vindi kindergarten-primary school, director	24.08.2005

15	Kaja Kuivjõgi Ministry of Social Affairs	16.06.2005
23	Maie Metsalu Employment office of Ida-Viru County	08.09.2005
24	Alar Ojalo Office of the President	20.05.2005
25	Margus Ojaots Director of Narva Vocational Educational Centre There are also teachers who have participated in Estonian courses and an exchange programme and students who have participated in an exchange programme	08.09.2005
26	Pae Upper secondary school Natalia Jurtsenko, director of teaching and education Participants: 3 teachers (class teacher of 6 th class, science teacher, Estonian teacher and other language teacher of 6 th class); 3 pupils of 6 th class, 4 pupils of 8 th class.	29.08.2005
27	Tiina Peenoja Mediator of family studies	22.08.2005
28	Meeting children and parents who have passed family studies 2 families (parents and children) participated	26.08.2005

Nr.	Representative of the interviewed organization	Date of interview
-----	---	-------------------

29	Merike Peri Social and health care department, Ida-Viru county Government	17.06.2005
30	Jaak Prozes Union of Estonian Nations	13.05.2005
31	Ene Rebane Citizenship and Migration Board	31.05.2005
32	Janika Saar Children's language and creativity camp 12 Russian and 12 Estonian children attended	26.08.2005
33	Katrin Saks Former Minister for Population Affairs	30.09.2005, submitted written opinion
34	Aleksei Semjonov Human Rights Information Centre	17.05.2005
35	Maie Soll Ministry of Education and research	13.05.2005
36	Hagi Šein Audentes University, director of the media chair	05.07.2005
37	Meeting the youth of Sillamäe in the town government of Sillamäe Youth worker Stanislav Šmeljov of Sillamäe participated	17.06.2005
38	Tarmo Tammiste Mayor of Narva	17.06.2005
39	Ülle Türk Tartu University (language tests)	27.05.2005
40	Cecilija-Rasa Unt Estonian Lithuanian Community, chairwoman	23.09.2005
41	Kaarin Veinbergs Education and culture department, Ida-Viru County Government	17.06.2005

29	Merike Peri Social and health care department, Ida-Viru county Government	17.06.2005
42	Enn Veskimägi Estonian Central Federation of Employers, chairman of management board	04.08.2005
43	Katrin Viru Estonian Forensics Society	12/05/05
Members of steering committee of the state integration programme		
44	Mati Luik Integration Foundation	09.06.2005

Nr.	Representative of the interviewed organization	Date of interview
------------	---	--------------------------

45	Reet Mikkel Ministry of Culture	07.06.2005
46	Kadri Reinthal Ministry of Finance	08.06.2005
47	Silver Tammik Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications	07.06.2005
48	Maarja Saks Ministry of Social Affairs	07.07.2005
48	Maie Soll Ministry of Education and Research	11.07.2005
50	Raivo Vetik IISS	15.07.2005
IF employees		
51	Ave Härsing Manager of a project unit of PHARE	07.07.2005
52	Karin Rätsep Administrative director of IF	07.07.2005

45	Reet Mikkel Ministry of Culture	07.06.2005
53	Eda Silberg Manager of the Education Programme Center	06.07.2005

Table 2. Focus groups and discussions

Focus group 1 – Russian public (youth, middle aged)			
26.05.2005			
Invitee	Represented target group/applicant of SIP	Participant (YES/NO)	Complementary information
Jevgeni Krištafovitsš	Target group: wider public – non-Estonian youth	YES	
Dmitri Klenski	Target group: wider public – non-Estonian adults	YES	
Aleksandr Kulakov	Target group: wider public – non-Estonian youth	YES	
Olga Tserepanova	Target group: wider public – non-Estonian youth	YES	
Anna Malikova	Target group: wider public – non-Estonian adults	YES	
Margarita Kornysheva	Target group: wider public – non-Estonian adults	YES	
Pavel Starkov	Target group: wider public – non-Estonian youth	NO	Absent
Regina Boistova	Target group: wider public – non-Estonian youth	NO	Absent
Julia Baer-Bader	Target group: wider public – non-Estonian youth	NO	Absent

Focus group 2 – Appraisal of the whole programme			
31.05.05			
Invited	Represented SIP target group/applicant/opinion leader	Participant (YES/NO)	Complementary information
Mati Heidmets, Tallinn University	Target group: administration of educational institutions, school heads	YES	
Raivo Vetik, IISS	Target group: steering committee of the SIP, members of Presidential Roundtable	YES	

Piret Lilleväli, Ministry of Social Affairs	Applicant Target group: employees of the ministries	YES	
Marju Lauristin, University of Tartu	Opinion leader Target group: teaching staff	NO	Submitted a written opinion 27.05.05
Tarmo Tammiste, Narva Town Government	Target group: local governments of Ida-Viru County	NO	Interview, 17.06.05
Katrin Saks, Riigikogu	Opinion leader Target group: governmental institutions, members of Presidential Roundtable	NO	Missing

Focus group 3 – Language and education

02.06.2005

Invited	Represented target group/applicant/opinion leader of SIP	Participant (YES/NO)	Complementary information
Irene Käosaar, Language Immersion Center of IF	Applicant	YES	
Mart Rannut, Tallinn University	Target group: Teaching staff	YES	
Katrin Viru, Estonian Debating Society	Target group: teachers	NO	Interview 12.05.05
Veera Sibrik, Kohtla-Järve Russian Upper secondary school	Target group: teachers	NO	Missing

Maie Soll, Ministry of Education and Research	Target group: Ministry of Education and Research, employees of ministries	NO	Interview 13.05.05
Kaarin Veinbergs, Ida-Viru County Government	Target group: local governments of Ida-Viru County	NO	Interview 17.06.05
Olav Aarna, Riigikogu	Opinion leader Target group: administration of the educational institutions, governmental institutions	NO	Missing
Jaak Prozes, Union of Estonian Nations	Target group: ethnic minorities, members of Presidential Roundtable, participants of national cultural association	NO	Interview 13.05.05

Focus group 4 – Media			
06.06.05			
Invited	Represented target group/applicant of SIP	Participant (YES/NO)	Complementary information
Olga Martõnova, Estonian Television	Target group: media companies, media staff	YES	
Mary Velmet, Raadio 4	Target group: media companies, media staff	YES	
Hagi Šein, Audentes University	Target group: members of Presidential Roundtable, teaching staff	NO	Interview 05.07.05
Reet Oja, Estonian Television	Target group: media companies, media staff	NO	Absent
Aleksandr Zukerman, Maurum AS	Target group: media companies, media staff	NO	Absent
Vladimir Vridliand, <i>Molodyosh Estonii</i>	Target group: media companies, media staff	NO	Absent

Focus group 5 – Social economy			
08.06.05			
Invited	Represented target group/applicant/opinion leader of SIP	Participant (YES/NO)	Complementary information
Jevgeni Golikov, Ministry of the Interior	Target group: employees of ministry	YES	
Lilia Sokolinskaja, Estonian Journalists Association	Target group: media companies, media staff	YES	
Aleksander Dušman, Roundtable of Minorities of Ida-Viru County	Target group: ethnic minorities, members of Presidential Roundtable, participants of national cultural association	YES	
Vladimir Vaingort, OÜ Kardis	Opinion leader Target group: wider public, adult non-Estonians, non-Estonian employees and business circle	YES	
Janno Järve, Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications	Target group: employees of ministries	NO	Missing
Enn Veskimägi, Estonian Central Federation of Employers	Opinion leader Target group: wider public	NO	Interview 04.08.05
Oleg Karpikov, Estonian-Russian Chamber of Commerce	Opinion leader Target group: wider public, adult non-Estonians, non-Estonian employees	NO	Interview 04.07.05

Table 3. Surveys

Period	Description of the target group	Number of samples
05.07.05 – 29.07.05	General sample – a socially and demographically representative incremental sample of Russians in the whole country at age 18-65	280-300
05.07.05 – 29.07.05	Pupils of Russian schools at age 15-20	50
05.07.05 – 29.07.05	Young non-Estonian representatives of NGOs at age 18-30	50
05.07.05 -	Teachers at Russian schools	50
05.07.05 – 29.07.05	Ethnic minorities	50

APPENDIX 2. Target groups covered

Mission	Covering of target groups
Sub-programme I	
I.1.a. Developing language didactics, language study methods, elaboration of study programmes and study materials, training of training providers	Survey of pupils, survey of teachers, focus group: Russian public, focus group: language and education, interviews and meetings with the teachers, pupils and parents of Russian schools
I.1.b. Elaboration, development and application of language immersion programme	Survey of pupils, survey of teachers, survey of Russian general sample, focus group: Russian public, Survey of pupils, survey of teachers, interviews and meetings with the teachers, pupils and parents of language immersion schools, directors of language immersion kindergartens
I.1.c. Language study models outside the school programme	Survey of pupils, survey of teachers, survey of Russian general sample, focus group: Russian public, focus group: Russian public, focus group: language and education, interviews and meetings with the intermediates language study models outside the school programme, children and parents participated in family studies, children participated in language camps
I.2.a. The network of regional in-service training of the teachers teaching Estonian as second language	survey of teachers, focus group: Russian public, focus group: Russian public, focus group: language and education, interviews and meetings with Estonian and other language teachers

Mission	Covering of target groups
I.2.b. In-service training of Estonian language for teachers of other subjects and other training	survey of teachers, focus group: language and education, focus group: evaluation to the whole programme, interviews and meetings with the teachers, managers and students of the vocational educational institutions
I.2.c. Re-education of teachers, in-service training of active teachers	survey of teachers, focus group: language and education, interviews and meetings with the teachers and academic directors of Russian schools
I.3.a. Measures in development plans of schools, subject syllabuses, training	Survey of pupils, survey of teachers, focus group: language and education, interviews and meetings with the teachers and pupils of Russian schools
I.3.b. Development of the study programmes in Russian and Estonian schools and their cooperation	survey of teachers, focus group: language and education, focus group: evaluation to the whole programme, interviews and meetings with the academic directors of Russian schools
I.3.c. Intensified studies of Estonian as second language	Survey of pupils, survey of teachers, focus group: language and education, interviews and meetings with the pupils, teachers and academic directors of Russian schools
I.3.d. Study materials supporting subject teaching in Estonian and obtaining the language	Survey of pupils, survey of teachers, focus group: language and education, focus group: Russian public, interviews and meetings with the teachers of Russian schools

Mission	Covering of target groups
I.4. To develop linguistic and cultural education in Estonian and Russian schools to improve the knowledge of the language of the pupils and to develop tolerance for other cultures	Survey of pupils, survey of teachers, focus group: language and education, focus group: Russian public, interviews and meetings with the teachers and pupils of Russian schools
I.5.a. Civic education conception, conception of multicultural school, materials	Survey of pupils, survey of teachers, focus group: language and education, focus group: Russian public, interviews and meetings with the teachers of Russian schools
I.5.b. training on the topic of citizen and multicultural school, informing and counseling	Survey of pupils, survey of teachers, focus group: language and education, focus group: Russian public, interviews and meetings with the teachers and academic directors of Russian schools
Sub-programme II	
II.1. To increase the awareness of cultural differences in Estonian society, to increase possibilities of maintenance of linguistic and cultural peculiarities of the ethnic minorities living in Estonia and to increase their knowledge about Estonia	survey of Russian general sample, survey of pupils, focus group: public, interviews
II.2. To support the activities of national cultural associations and maintenance of language and culture through the activity of Sunday schools	survey of ethnic minorities, survey of Russian general sample, focus group: social economy, interview
II.3. To promote cooperation between national cultural associations and their cooperation with the state	survey of ethnic minorities, focus group: social economy, interviews
II.4. To support the activities of new schools in the national language	survey of ethnic minorities, focus group: social economy, interviews
Sub-programme III	

Mission	Covering of target groups
III.1. To develop the Estonian proficiency examination system and related counseling in order to guarantee a higher reliability of the results and positive reflection of studying Estonian as a second language	Survey of pupils, survey of teachers, survey of Russian general sample, focus group: language and education, focus group: Russian public, interviews
III.2. To create the conditions for linguistic-communicative integration of adult non-Estonians through availability of quality Estonian studies	Survey of pupils, survey of teachers, focus group: language and education , interviews
III.3. To increase opportunities for non-Estonian adults to study Estonian in order to guarantee the necessary level in work and domestic situations	survey of Russian general sample, survey of pupils, survey of teachers, focus group: language and education, focus group: Russian public, interviews
III.4. To support linguistic-communicative integration of non-Estonians through involving and informing the public	survey of Russian general sample, focus group: Russian public, interviews
III.5. To analyze the development of the linguistic relations and socio-cultural awareness in various fields and to elaborate measures to develop Estonian into a lingua franca, to develop multilingual society	survey of Russian general sample, focus group: Russian public, interviews
Sub-programme IV	
IV.1. To develop the cooperation of the non-Estonians with the third sector and national institutions concerning integration	survey of Russian general sample, survey of organized Russian youth, focus group: Russian public, interviews and research

Mission	Covering of target groups
IV.2. To support the continuity of youth associations and student self-government in order to guarantee more possibilities for common activities for the non-Estonian youth and to develop their social competence	survey of Russian general sample, survey of organized Russian youth, focus group: Russian public, interviews
IV.3. To develop more diversely the integration topic in both Estonian and Russian media, to create and develop the common field of both Estonian and Russian media systems; to increase the interactivity of media; to improve the availability and quality of the institutional-utilitarian information in media in order to promote social participation of the Russian population	survey of Russian general sample, focus group: Russian public, focus group: media, focus group: social economy, interviews and research
IV.4. To increase the media and information professionals among young non-Estonians, to educate a new generation of non-Estonians with new regular media consumption and able to orient in information society	survey of pupils, survey of teachers, focus group: Russian public, focus group: media, focus group: social economy, interviews and research
IV.5. To intensify communication between Estonians and non-Estonians, to create and develop dialogue between cultures	survey of Russian general sample, focus group: Russian public, interviews and research
IV.6. To support the legal-political integration of non-Estonians	survey of Russian general sample, survey of pupils focus group: Russian public, interviews and research

Mission	Covering of target groups
IV.7. To improve the vocational knowledge of Estonian language of the non-Estonian employed and unemployed combined with the knowledge of official language that enables them to integrate successfully in the labor market	survey of Russian general sample, survey of pupils, focus group: Russian public, meetings, interviews and research
IV.8. To create opportunities for non-Estonian youth and adults taking in account their social, ethnic and linguistic special character that reduce their belonging in social risk groups, including drug abuse, HIV/AIDS, criminality, unemployment	research
Sub-programme V	
V1. To organize the management and appraisal of the IF's sphere of responsibility in the state programme in order to guarantee the development and efficient application of the programme and achievement of its primary objectives	focus group: the estimation to the whole programme, interviews
V.2. To organize the management and appraisal of the MER's sphere of responsibility in the state programme in order to guarantee the development and efficient application of the programme and achievement of its primary objectives	survey of Russian general sample, focus group: Russian public, focus group: language and education, interviews
V.3. To increase the capacity of the institutions concerning the integration, including improving the availability and quality of institutional-utilitarian information in Russian from the institutions.	survey of Russian general sample, focus group: Russian public, focus group: the estimation to the whole programme

APPENDIX 3. Bibliography

1. Allik, H., I. Dolgovskaja jt. Kodaniku Käsiraamat, 2004
2. [Asser, H. Artikkel “Tendentsid ja tingimused muukeelse kooli arenguks Eestis”](#), Tartu Ülikool, 2004
3. Asser, H. Eesti keelekümblusprogramm, Uurimisrühma aruanded 2001-2004
4. Balti Ajakirjandusuurijate Assotsiatsioon, Integratsiooni meediamonitooringud 2000-2004
5. ECRI, II Aruanne Eesti kohta 22. juunil 2001.
6. Eesti elanik 21. sajandi algul. Ülevaade uurimuse “Mina. Maailm. Meedia” tulemustest. Toimetajad: V. Kalmus, M. Lauristin, P. Pruulmann-Vengerfeldt, Tartu Ülikool, 2004
7. Eesti Noorsoo Instituut, Eesti Huvialajuhtide Liit, Üldhariduskoolide huvijuhtide staatuse ja koolitusvajaduste uuring, Aruanne, 2004
8. Estonian Government, Comments of the Estonian Government on the Opinion of the Advisory Committee on the Implementation of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities in Estonia, 2002
9. EU Commission, Handbook on Integration for policy-makers and practitioners, Directorate General Justice, Freedom and Security, 2004
10. Euroopa Liidu PHARE eesti keele õppe programm 2001-2003, Raport ja lõpparuanne
11. European Commission, General Recommendation 30: Discrimination against non-citizens, Committee On The Elimination Cerd/C/64/Misc.11/Rev.3 Of Racial Discrimination, 12 March, 2004
12. European Commission, Second Opinion on Estonia Adopted on 24 February 2005, Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, 2005
13. Faktum Uuringukeskus, Kutsehariduse areng venekeelsetes kutseõppeasutustes, Uuringu aruanne, 2004
14. Gil-Robles, A. Report by Mr Alvargo Gil-Robles, Commissioner For Human Rights, On His Visit To Estonia, 27th-30th October 2003, Office Of The Commissioner For Human Rights, Council of Europe

15. Hallik, K., J. Helemäe et. al., Projekti “Muukeelsete noorte töötusriiski vähendamine” vajadusuuring, Mitte-eestlaste Integratsiooni Sihtasutus, 2004
16. Inimõiguste Teabekeskus, Tallinna integratsiooniprogramm 2002-2005
17. Kasemets, L ja Kurvits, Ü. Kohaliku omavalitsuse muukeelse elanikkonna integratsiooni meetmed ja mõõdikud, 2005
18. Keelekümbluskeskus, Keelekümbluskeskuse 2000-2004. aasta aruanded
19. Kodakondsus- ja Migratsiooniamet. 2004. aasta Kodakondsus- ja Migratsiooniametis, 2005
20. Kõuts, R. Integratsioon Eesti Meedias 1999-2003
21. MEIS, Integratsiooni Sihtasutuse aastaraamatud 2000-2003
22. Mitte-eestlaste Integratsiooni Sihtasutus, PHARE Standard Summary Project Fiche: Estonian Language Training and Teaching in Estonian for Non-Estonian Speakers, 2001
23. Open Society Institute 2002, Minority Protection in Estonia, An Assessment of the Programme of Integration in Estonian Society 2000-2007
24. P. Kaabel. Nüüd üles, keda võõras rõhub. Tegelikuse Keskus, juuli, 2005
25. Pooled venelastest kiidavad nõukogude aega, Delfi uudisteportaal, 26.juuli, 2005
26. PriceWaterhouseCoopers, PHARE projekti “Eesti rahvusvähemuste sotsiaalse integratsiooni ja keeleõppe programm ES 0003.01” vahehindang, 2003
27. Radzinski, E. Vale otsus, vale mees ja vale maa. Tegelikuse Keskus, mai, 2005
28. Rahvastikuministri büroo, Riiklik programm “Integratsioon Eesti ühiskonnas 2000-2007”
29. Rahvastikuministri büroo, Riikliku programmi “Integratsioon eesti ühiskonnas 2000-2007” alamprogrammide tegevuskavad aastateks 2004-2007
30. Rahvastikuministri büroo, Riikliku programmi “Integratsioon Eesti ühiskonnas 2000-2007” rakendamise aruanded 2000-2004
31. Rahvusvaheliste ja Sotsiaaluuringute Instituut, Integratsiooni monitooring, 2005
32. Rannut, Ü. Uusimmigrandid meie ühiskonnas ja haridussüsteemis. Käsiraamat, 2004
33. Riigikogu, Vähemusrahvuse kultuuriautonoomia seadus, 01.08.2002
34. Riigikogu, Vähemusrahvuste kaitse raamkonventsiooni ratifitseerimise seadus, 01.06.2002
35. Statistikaamet, Hõivatud muulased tegevusala järgi 2000-2003

36. Tafel, K., Terk, E. Teostatavusuuring projektile “Muukeelse elanikkonna integreerimine tööturule”, Eesti Tuleviku-Uuringute Instituut, 2004
37. Tamme, K. Küsitluse “2003. aasta suviste eesti keele laagri- ja pereõppe projektide mõju neis osalenud Ida-Viru County noorte eesti keele oskusele” tulemused, Mitte-eestlaste Integratsiooni Sihtasutus
38. TNS Emor, Uuring: Eestikeelne aineõpe vene õppekeelega koolides: hetkeolukord ja vajadused, 2004
39. Vähemusrahvused ja integratsiooniprotsessid. Materjalide kogumik. Koostajad: R. Grigorjan, L. Digojeva et. al., 1999
40. Võormann, R., Helemäe, J., Nimmerfeldt, G. Välisabi projekti “Mitmekultuuriline Eesti” tegevuste hindamine aruanne, märts 2005

APPENDIX 4. Proposals for the new structure of the programme

New sub-objective, tasks and entries of the activities	
Sub-programme I	Transition to bilingual studies
<p>acquiring the official language:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - necessary study materials - necessary continuing education of the teachers of Estonian language - preparation of the teachers of Estonian language - renewal of the study programme - language camps - living in Estonian families 	
<p>Instruction in other subjects in Estonian:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - study materials - vocational studies of Estonian language for the teachers - increase of language immersion - involving schools in reforms - student exchange programmes 	
Sub-programme	Ethnic minorities
<p>supporting the cultural activities of the minorities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - supporting the art activities of societies - providing education about minorities - informing the minorities 	
<p>Supporting studies in the mother tongue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - supporting Sunday schools - classes for intensified studies in the minority language in common schools 	
Sub-programme III	Integration of the adults
<p>Language studies:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> development of the Estonian language examination system availability of language courses compensating the costs of the exam to those that pass studies for risk groups (including prisoners) studies for the important employees 	

New sub-objective, tasks and entries of the activities	
Increasing the number of Estonian citizens:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - compensating the expenses for persons preparing for the citizenship exam - distributing citizen's information 	
Sub-programme IV	Common knowledge field
New sub-objective, tasks and entries of the activities	
The role of public broadcasting:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - bilingual programme of ETV - financing multicultural Raadio 4 	
Informing in Russian:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - making important information available in Russian - reinforcing the role of the news in the national broadcasting 	
Sub-programme V	Employment in Ida-Viru County
Measures of labor work:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - connecting vocational educational institutions with the labor market - modernising the vocational educational institutions - taking the necessities of the employers into account - coping training for the unemployed - re-education of the unemployed 	

New sub-objective, tasks and entries of the activities

investment aid:

- priority: involving EU funding
- obtaining foreign investments
- concessions in the co-financing by the Development Agency of Enterprise Estonia

APPENDIX 5. Survey questionnaires

Added as separate addenda.